

APPRAISAL

EDUCATION SECTOR STRATEGIC PLAN (ESSP) 2010 -2015

MINISTRY OF EDUCATION (MINEDUC)

REPUBLIC OF RWANDA

July 2010

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACRONYMS	iii
1 Appraisal and Endorsement of the Education Sector Strategic Plan 2010 – 2014 .	1
1.1 Overall Comments.....	1
1.2 Strengths.....	1
1.3 Concerns.....	1
1.4 Conclusion.....	2
2 Rwanda Education Sector Context	3
2.1 Introduction.....	3
2.2 Key Policy Documents.....	3
2.3 Management capacity.....	4
2.4 Key challenges	4
2.5 In-country donor support, aid harmonization and alignment.....	5
3 Technical Appraisal	7
3.1 Introduction.....	7
3.2 Rwanda ESSP Technical Appraisal	7
3.3 ESSP 2006 – 2010	8
3.4 ESSP conceptualisation	9
3.5 Key questions from the Appraisal Guidelines.....	11
3.6 Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation.....	16
3.7 Capacity constraints and Capacity Development	18
3.8 Financing framework	19
3.9 Appraisal Conclusion.....	23
4 ANNEXES	25
ANNEX A: Risk Analysis.....	25
ANNEX B: Tables.....	27

ACRONYMS

ADB	Africa Development Bank
BE	Basic Education
CAP	Country Assistance Plan
CF	Catalytic Fund
CIDA	Canadian International Development Agency
COE	College of Education
CPAF	Common Performance Assessment framework
CPD	Continuous Professional Development
CSO	Civil Society Organisation
DEO	District Education Officer
DFID	Department for International Development
DP	Development Partners
ECD	Early Childhood Development
EDPRS	Economic Development and Poverty Reduction Strategy
EFA	Education for All
EMIS	Education Management Information System
ESCBPF	Education Sector Capacity Building Pool Fund
ESSP	Education Sector Strategic Plan
EU	European Union
FRA	Fiduciary Risk Assessment
FTI	Fast Track Initiative
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GIS	Geographical Information Systems
GoR	Government of Rwanda
HE	Higher Education
HIDA	Human Capacity and Institutional Development Agency
HLI	Higher learning institution
ICT	Information Communication Technology
IFMIS	Integrated Financial Management Information System
INSET	In-Service Training of Teacher
JRES	Joint Review of the Education Sector
JESS	Joint Education Sector Support
KIE	Kigali Institute of education
KIST	Kigali Institute of Science and technology
LAN	Local Area Network
LTESFF	Long Term Education Strategy and Financial Framework
MDG	Millennium Development Goal
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MIFOTRA	Ministry of Public Service and Labour
MINEDUC	Ministry of Education
MINALOC	Ministry of Local Government, Community Dev & Social Affairs
MINECOFIN	Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning
MLA	Monitoring of Learning Achievement
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
MTEF	Medium Term Expenditure Framework
NGO	Non Governmental Organisations
NIF	National Implementation framework
NQF	National Qualifications Framework
NUR	National university of Rwanda
NISR	National institute of Statistics of Rwanda
OVC	Orphans and Vulnerable Children
PBE	Post Basic Education
PEFA	Public Expenditure and Accountability Assessment

PER	Public Expenditure Review
PFM	Public Finance Management
PRESET	Pre-service Education of Teachers
PS	Permanent Secretary
PTA	Parents Teachers Association
PTC	Parent Teachers Committee
REAP	Rwanda English Action Programme
RNEC	Rwanda national Examinations Council
SNE	Special Needs Education
UNICEF	United Nations International Children's' Fund
UNESCO	UN Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
RwF	Rwandese Francs
SBS	Sector Budget Support
SIDA	Swedish International Development Agency
TA	Technical Assistance
ToRs	Terms of Reference
TTC	Teacher training College
TVET	Technical Vocational education and Training
WB	World Bank
WDA	Workforce development Authority
9YBE	Nine Years of Basic Education

1 Appraisal and Endorsement of the Rwanda Education Sector Strategic Plan 2010 – 2015

1.1 Overall Comments

After a long and refined process of consultation and planning, the ESSP is ready for takeoff. The ESSP is not only consistent in addressing key policy and strategic challenges in the sector: It is a faithful mirror of the sector. It is highly ambitious however consistent with Government of Rwanda aspirations. Nevertheless, it has in-built risk identification, which brings an important balance into its vision. Table 6 (Annex B) presents the overall summary of conclusions, with box scores. This provides a positive endorsement of the directions, achievability and feasibility of implementing ESSP 2010 – 2015

1.2 Strengths

The Rwanda Education Sector Strategic Plan 2010-2015 (ESSP) is the Ministry of Education's (MINEDUC) successor to the 2006 – 2010 ESSP. It is guided by the 2003 Education Sector Policy and, very importantly, reflects the Government's Vision 2020 and the Economic Development and Poverty Reduction Strategy 2008 -2012 (EDPRS). Both stress the fundamental importance of education in the improvement of social and economic development, links with the labour market and poverty reduction

The ESSP provides clear directions intended for the education sector over the five-year period. It also acts as the rationale for Rwanda's bid for follow up funding from EFA –FTI and is fully consistent with the internationally-agreed Millennium Development Goals. It is a well considered, well conceptualized and well justified document. It is intensively written and packed, but very well-structured, logically developed and, particularly given its extensive and eclectic scope, clearly expressed. It is also very ambitious – consistent with the national drive and commitment that led to Vision 20/20 and the EDPRS.

It is owned by MINEDUC on behalf of the Government and people of Rwanda, generated with wide stakeholder and development partners' support and stands as a manifesto for MINEDUC over the five year period. It is conceived as a 'rolling' plan, amenable to flexibility within the annual work plans.

The ESSP provides a good balance between basic and post-basic levels of the system and between equity and labour market considerations and recognises the trade-offs involved in driving towards its twin priorities of 9 years of basic education and enhanced post-basic education. The logical framework and NIF actions matrices help frame the priorities and will be key tools during M+E, as long as reliable and appropriate M+E data become available. GoR and MINEDUC have laid the groundwork in an acceptable way to respond to the challenges of ESSP 2010 – 2015.

1.3 Concerns

The ESSP is realistic about of what can and cannot be achieved in the ESSP period from 2010 – 2015 taking into account both financial and capacity constraints.

Its discussion on financial frameworks highlights the extent of the funding gaps in three alternative scenarios. Even with considerable projected external support the funding gap for **Scenario 3** (the proposed ESSP scenario) 2009/10 – 2014/15 is a substantial 484,068 million RWF (= 31% of expenditure). It is 699,097 million RWF without external financial support (45%). The least ambitious scenario (based upon optimistic growth assumptions) would still leave a 13% gap (with projected external support). This is a considerable threat to the ESSP so it may prove necessary to scale down ambitions. Whether such ambitions

might be scaled down across the board (as various patterns of Scenarios 1 or 2) or whether specific individual reforms would be postponed might profitably be addressed at this stage.

Table 4c offers a comprehensive capacity assessment. The quantitative and qualitative across the board capacity gaps are seen as high risk areas. However, the ESSP emphasizes a number of reforms and actions to address these constraints and currently MINEDUC is in the process of drawing up its priority capacity building action plan – based upon the fruitful capacity building work that is on going.

The risk analysis table at annex 1 identifies a range of risk associated with implementing the ESSP and in particular tackling its qualitative dimensions. Paramount amongst these are the fundamental challenges and risks associated with the implementation of the English medium policy. A number of agreed actions and solutions were identified during the appraisal process to overcome these and will be addressed accordingly by MINEDUC.

There are some concerns associated with the embryonic EMIS and consequent data gaps, allied with limited evaluation and empirical research to underpin evidence-based policy and planning, however recent progress has built confidence in the developing system, and the strong drive for results has improved the outlook for overcoming this.

1.4 Conclusion

The ESSP is a very ambitious vision for the Rwandan education sector 2010 – 2015. It appropriately targets the improvement of the quality of the system as a whole, with a priority focus on nine years of basic education. It seeks to build upon considerable success in tackling access, retention and completion. It faces the challenge of absorbing the basic school cohorts into a reformulated and more co-ordinated post-basic education sector, fitted towards labour market needs.

Given the commitment of the Government of Rwanda to its Vision 2020, the ESSP provides an auspicious platform for the future of education over the plan period.

The Development Partners have concluded the plan is both realistic and feasible. Accordingly, we support the Government's application for the sum of \$100m to the FTI Secretariat for financial assistance over the period 2010/11-2012/13, with additional commitments up to 2014/15 where possible.

Name of Agency

Signature

2 Rwanda Education Sector Context

2.1 Introduction

Rwanda has made incredible progress in education since the devastating impact of the 1994 genocide which resulted in a large number of orphans, decimated infrastructure and a depleted skilled population. In particular since 1998, primary enrolments have grown by an average of 4 % per annum bringing the gross enrolment rate to 128% and net enrolment rate to 94% in 2009. Girls' share of enrolment (52%) is higher than boys. Increases in enrolment have resulted in greater access for the poor through abolition of primary school fees in 2003 and lower secondary fees in 2007, expanded infrastructure, more teachers, and more textbooks.

Capitation grants transferred to primary schools increased from 300 Rwandese Francs (RwF) per student in 2004, to 2,500 RwF per student in 2006 to 7,700 RwF in 2009. The 2007-2009 FTI funds have made a substantial contribution to these grants. The capitation grants enabled the schools to contract 2000 teachers in 2009 (on annual contracts) which, along with increased output from teacher training colleges, has helped to improve the pupil per qualified teacher ratio from 74:1 to 63:1 in 2009. Thanks to the government's policy of fast-tracking 9 Year Basic Education for all implemented from 2008/9, including the building of 3,076 additional classrooms in about 5 months using army, police, prisons and communities, the completion rate has soared from 53% in 2008 to 75% in 2009 (78% for girls).

2.2 Key Policy Documents.

The 2008-12 Economic Development and Poverty Reduction Strategy (EDPRS) emphasizes economic growth and poverty alleviation, continuing to build on achievements in human development and basic social services, with an emphasis on decentralization and a greater role for the private sector. The EDPRS is the country's second PRSP and emphasizes accelerating progress towards the MDGs, including improving education outcomes and gender equality (MDGs 2 and 3). The EDPRS encompasses three flagship programs: i) Sustainable Growth for Jobs and Exports, ii) Governance, including expanding decentralization and enhancing accountability; and iii) the Vision 2020 Umurenge Program (VUP), designed to alleviate rural poverty and improve productivity.

The Rwanda 9-Year Basic Education programme is a cornerstone of the Education Sector Strategic Plan (ESSP) 2010-2015 which provides the overarching framework for a sector-wide approach to the development and delivery of education services in Rwanda. The ESSP sets out its objectives, policies, priorities, strategies, key activities and indicative targets. The National Implementation Framework (NIF) 2010-2013 distils these priorities and strategies into specific core activities at all levels of the system to achieve the targets and is linked to the 3 year Medium Term Expenditure Framework

The government's vision is to ensure that every child accesses nine years of quality education by 2015. Following the strong growth in enrolment, there is now an emphasis on addressing completion rates and further reducing drop-out and repetition particularly for girls, and, in addition, addressing learning achievement through decreasing pupil:teacher ratios, sufficient teaching and learning materials, more efficient use of infrastructure, improved school management, and an adequate budget for school operating costs and student support. The plan allocates an average of 63 % of the education budget to basic education, which is in line with FTI Indicative Framework Benchmarks for a nine-year program.

Capitation grants have been used by schools to hire additional teachers, and an additional 2000 teachers have been contracted, helping to reduce the pupil:teacher ratio from 74:1 to 63:1. A major reform of textbook policy is under way with decentralised procurement and

school-level selection being rolled out over the next two years, alongside training of heads and teachers in use of these materials. A girls' education policy has been endorsed and the implementation strategy is under development. It has also been decided that key elements of the UNICEF 'child-friendly' school approach, which has been piloted successfully in 54 schools, will be rolled out countrywide, to improve the overall school learning environment.

Given high enrolment in grades 1-6, and improving transition rates to lower secondary (Tronc Commun) [from 78.4% in 2007 to 88% in 2008] as part of 9 year basic education, the development partners support the efforts of government to expand access to upper secondary education, skills and training, particularly because of the need to address the severe skills shortage in both middle and higher level trades and professions.. The Ministry of Education (MINEDUC) has developed an Integrated TVET Strategy with other key line Ministries and the private sector, and in collaboration with the development partners produced a costed post-basic education strategy to address upper secondary education, TVET, teacher education and higher education.

2.3 Management capacity

Public service reform in Rwanda has resulted in a leaner civil service, and for the Ministry of Education, this has resulted in insufficient capacity in key areas such as Planning, Finance, Statistics and Teacher Management, However, a government-restructuring process is underway to address some of these gaps, and the development of a Teacher Service Commission is now addressing some of the teacher management concerns. A new Rwanda Education Board structure made up of mostly semi-autonomous agencies such as National Curriculum Development Centre, National Exams Council and Inspectorate will also support core MINEDUC functions.

At decentralised levels, staffing has been increased slightly to one additional officer in charge of teacher management, while there has been comprehensive school management training undertaken of schools heads, deputies and bursars. An innovative pooled Capacity Building Fund supported by DFID, UNICEF and CIDA is enabling MINEDUC to contract in support staff, consultants and training for priority areas based on a rolling two year Institutional Development and Change Management Plan.

2.4 Key challenges

Although Rwanda has demonstrated considerable leadership and dynamism in its education sector, and is both ambitious and determined to develop the human capital required through education, both government and development partners recognise a number of challenges.

2.4.1 Access

The Ministry has launched a drive to expand more schools to full basic and in some cases to full primary and secondary, and a target of 760 such schools was set for 2009/10. The Primary Leaving Examination was abolished as a selection tool from 2009, and a number of other measures introduced such as reduction of core subjects being studied and use of double-shifting where appropriate expanded.

2.4.2 Quality

While the main focus has been on increasing access and enrolment, government has turned its attention to improving the quality of education. MINEDUC is now focused on improving the completion rate and further reducing drop-out and repetition. The main challenges in 2010 are improving the professionalism and motivation of the teacher workforce, whole school management, and the more efficient and equitable distribution of learning/teaching materials. These are now being addressed with specific strategies, along with changing the approach to literacy in mother tongue and second languages.

2.4.3 Gender

Despite the impressive participation of girls in the primary school grades, a study carried out by the Ministry in 2008, highlighted a number of concerns. The proportion of girls accessing upper secondary and higher learning institutions is lower than boys. The performance of girls in many subjects, especially science, mathematics and technology is poorer than boys, resulting in a lack of female role models in these fields. The new Girls' Education Policy targets teachers, communities, and learning materials to improved self-esteem and confidence of rural girls in particular. UNICEF's 'child-friendly' schools approach addresses many of these issues.

2.4.4 Decentralization

Rwanda historically was a very centralized bureaucracy, but the government has been developing a political, fiscal and administrative decentralisation strategy that is being supported by a number of development partners. In education, progress has already been made through strengthening school management, empowering schools through capitation grants, and building stronger PTCs and other community accountability structures. The main challenge is the limited human capacity at district administration level, with often only one or two officers dealing with education. The government plans to address this challenge through the deployment of additional officers for teacher management, the decentralisation of the Inspectorate and also the introduction of sector education officers (administrative level below district).

2.4.5 Infrastructure development

Within Rwanda's program of 9-Year Basic Education, the combination of domestic and external resources, including the \$70 million EFA FTI Catalytic Fund for 2007/2008 enabled an increase in the annual target for the construction of primary/lower secondary classrooms from 1,500 in 2005 to 1,800 in 2006, and to 2,500 in 2007. In 2008, 2,315 classrooms for basic education were constructed. With the increase in access and enrolment there are still shortages of classroom space, requiring double-shifting to be maintained. However between September 2009 and January 2010, there was an astonishingly successful campaign to build an additional 3,076 classrooms using labour, supplies and other support from army, police, prisons, communities together with financial support from DFID, JICA and UNICEF, in order to accommodate the increased transition flow from grade 6 (primary) to Grade 7 (lower secondary) as part of the drive for full 9 Year Basic Education.

2.5 In-country donor support, aid harmonization and alignment

Rwanda has a good track record in terms of implementation of the Paris agenda, led by government, especially the Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning (MINECOFIN), and by strong sectors such as education. Education in fact is regarded as the main model of harmonisation for other sectors, and recently the Health sector adopted several of the processes and structures used by partners in education. DFID remains the lead agency but is now sharing this lead with UNICEF. There is a division of labour in terms of TVET where GTZ is the lead partner and Quality, where UNICEF co-ordinates the donor input. In addition, the World Bank has led on the Country Status Report Update and analytical work on post-basic education, supported by DFID, GTZ and the Netherlands. The education sector is supported both through General Budget Support and Sector Budget Support (SBS). Belgium, DFID, Netherlands, African Development Bank, and CIDA have all provided funds through SBS.

Coordination between development partners is very effective; there is a well established tradition of preparatory education development partner meetings (funding agencies and civil society) to present a co-ordinated agenda through the lead partner for quarterly sector working group meetings and two joint annual reviews. DFID/UNICEF have fortnightly

informal policy discussions with PS and Director of Planning to maintain continuity. The Ministry of Finance has now also developed an effective central and sector co-ordination structure, with guidelines for the structure and management of sector reviews to feed into bi-annual Joint Budget Reviews (backward and forward-looking), and an EDPRS Monitoring Framework.

3 Technical Appraisal

3.1 Introduction

The appraisal of the Rwanda ESSP concluded in June/July 2010 as a result of dialogue between MINEDUC, Development Partners and an extensive range of stakeholders in the education system, both at the centre and in the decentralised chain, including at district and school levels. This was assisted with consultancy support.

The overall appraisal process was guided and framed by the EFA FTI Secretariat Guidelines for the Appraisal of the Primary Education Component of an Education Sector Plan (March 2006).

The appraisal process sought to follow the 6-stage protocol which EFA FTI recommends as a systematic process towards reaching a well-informed conclusion. It should be added that, whilst they were launched sequentially (viz 1-6), they took place concurrently. The labour-intensive process of data collation to enable the completion of the appended tables took place simultaneously.

The EFA FTI guidelines are intended as an aid to conducting the appraisal and offered for adaptation for country needs: They were approached in this way for this appraisal, guiding the process of appraisal towards the ESSP itself (within the context of the education system which is portrayed above) rather than towards a sectoral appraisal as such. This distinction is stressed here at the outset.

As part of the consultation and appraisal process a major two-day risk analysis workshop was conducted, involving wide representation from stakeholders across the system of education and its partners.

This workshop was envisaged as an important approach to generating a collective viewpoint on the feasibility and likelihood of achieving of the seven main ESSP priorities for 2010 – 2015 and the concomitant risks associated with such feasibility and likelihood. The focused workshop sessions generated a considerable range of ‘risks’ at policy, strategy and activity levels and the collated report has provided a comprehensive and useful reality check-list for MINEDUC. That repertoire of risks has also been used to inform the appraisal report and some of the salient risks are built into the appraisal analysis and especially at the risk analysis table at Annex 4c.

3.2 Rwanda ESSP Technical Appraisal

The Rwanda Education Sector Strategic Plan 2010-2015 (ESSP) is the Rwanda Ministry of Education’s (MINEDUC) successor to the 2006 – 2010 ESSP and its 2007 and 2008 annual revisions. It is guided by the 2003 Education Sector Policy (which is targeted for review in 2010) and, very importantly, reflects the Government’s Vision 2020 and the Economic Development and The Poverty Reduction Strategy 2008 -2012 (EDPRS) which both stresses the fundamental importance of education in the improvement of social and economic development and poverty reduction.

The plan provides the directions intended for the education sector over the five-year period. It also acts as the rationale for Rwanda’s bid for follow up funding from EFA –FTI and is fully consistent with the internationally-agreed Millennium Development Goals.

The ESSP is intensively written and packed, but very well-structured, logically developed and, particularly given its extensive and eclectic scope, clearly expressed. It is also very ambitious, very inspirational and high-flying – consistent with the national drive and commitment that led to Vision 20/20 and the EDPRS goals, visions and missions.

It is essentially a “home-grown product”, owned by MINEDUC on behalf of the Government and people of Rwanda, generated with wide stakeholder and development partners’ support and stands as a manifesto for MINEDUC over the five year period. That said, it is conceived as a ‘rolling’ plan, amenable to flexibility within the annual work plans, as within the ESSP 2006 -2010.

Whilst the ESSP is a technical document, MINEDUC’s intention is to distil the key messages into a communications strategy aimed at communities, the public and other government organisations. This will be supported by posters and brochures in Kinyarwanda and English.

The set of targets and indicators in the ESSP LogFrame, the National Implementation Framework (NIF), and the EDPRS Common Performance Assessment Framework (CPAF) will be utilised to monitor annual plan performance as a basis for any rolling development of the plans. This will be guided by the M+E framework.

3.3 ESSP 2006 – 2010

At the outset the ESSP reflects backwards on the progress since the 2006-2010 ESSP.

3.3.1 Access and retention

Enrolment increased significantly since 2000 with overall improvements in the school-age enrolment patterns (with that of girls exceeding that of boys). Drop-out rates have decreased and completion rates increased dramatically since the implementation of fast-track 9YBE in 2008 from 53%-75% (girls in particular 78%).

3.3.2 Quality

A range of policy initiatives and inputs were targeted – but possibly not prioritised at improving educational quality. These included the fast-track 9YBE together with some associated policy interventions aimed e.g. at reducing class size; creating double-shifting; reducing core curriculum subjects; developing primary teachers’ specialisations This was accompanied by reform of textbook supply policies, as well as substantial capacity and policy development. Inevitably each of these faced - and continues to do so – a range of implementation constraints, some unforeseen. Nevertheless, as the ESSP explicitly discusses throughout, lack of high quality provision is a characteristic of the sector as a whole, hence its prioritisation in the ESSP 2010 – 2015.

3.3.3 Financing

Improvements above were accompanied by and stimulated by a sharp increase in domestic and external finance with sector budget support at the core of Development Partners’ support. Additionally, FTI Catalytic Funds helped to resource teacher education, infrastructure development and school capitation grants to support the removal of user fees in the 9-year basic education cycle (9YBE).

3.3.4 Management

In 2007/8 there was considerable down-sizing of the public service. Consequently the GOR strategy for ‘leaner and meaner’ ministries has resulted in severe capacity constraints for large ministries like MINEDUC. These constraints restricted efficient development in key MINEDUC structures and institutions. New capacity development initiatives and the generation of new structures both at the centre and within the decentralised chain are, however, intended to alleviate these capacity constraints. See 3.7 for further discussion as well as the capacity assessment table (4c)

3.4 **ESSP conceptualisation**

So far, the ESSP 2006 – 2010 has not been evaluated. But the Annual Joint Review Processes have reviewed the ESSP performance against the original plan objectives and indicators. The substantial lessons learned have informed the genesis of the ESSP 2010 – 2015. Nevertheless, the key areas (noted above) still remain the targets of this current ESSP, though there are additional targets (notably Post Basic Education) and some changes in priorities and strategies.

Chapter 1 identifies with clarity and vision the broad direction of the ESSP with a multi-layered approach.

3.4.1 **Mission**

Its mission statement (1.1) clearly links education to human capital development ‘to transform the Rwanda citizen into skilled human capital for socio-economic development...’.

Thus it is linked to the overall EDPRS goal: to achieve sustainable economic growth and social development’. The purpose of education is defined as ‘access to quality, equitable and effective education for all’.

3.4.2 **Objectives**

The ESSP identifies six high-level objectives, derived from the EDPRS, applying to two levels of education (as well as an additional five cross-cutting themes):

- i Basic Education
- ii Post-Basic Education.

High level objectives

- Access to education for all
- Quality education at all levels
- Equity in education at all levels
- Effective and efficient education system
- Science and Technology and ICT in education
- Promotion of positive values, critical thinking,
- Rwanda culture, peace, unity and reconciliation.

3.4.3 **Priorities**

The ESSP identifies seven main priorities for 2010 –2015:

Main priorities for 2010 –2015

- Improving completion and transition rates whilst reducing drop out and repetition in BE
- Ensuring that educational quality continues to improve
- Developing a skilled and motivated teaching, training and lecturing workforce
- Ensuring that the PBE system is better tailored to meet labour market needs
- Ensuring equity within all fields and throughout all levels of education and training
- Strengthening of education in science and technology
- Strengthening the institutional framework and management capacity for effective delivery of education services at all levels.

3.4.4 Challenges

It flags 'the major challenges' for the ESSP 2010 – 2015 as:

- **Ensuring quality and equity throughout the system**
- **Ensuring that teachers and learners will become fully proficient in English**

This extremely broad and challenging road map is followed by a detailed portrayal of the existing state of development in relation to these parameters, with snapshot analyses of existing scenarios and challenges, together with the addition, after the risk analysis workshop, of a range of significant risks to the achievement of the extremely ambitious scope of the plan.

The ESSP 2010-2015 evolves away from its predecessor by establishing (as the Minister's Foreword to the ESSP indicates) its **two key strategic priorities**:

- **An effective 9-year basic education of high quality for all (see 3.2)**
- **Making post-basic education (PBE) more accessible and more relevant to national needs (see 3.3).**

3.4.5 Nine years of basic education (9YBE)

The first strategic priority (above) continues the unfinished business of the ESSP 2006 – 2010 and will seek to make progress on the lessons learned in that plan (see above). A significant dimension of the 'unfinished' business is associated with the construction of school infrastructure. The first wave (in 2009/10) responded to the need to create sufficient school places for the cohort of P6 leavers entering S1. Further community mobilisation is required for additional construction to enable the upward access of that cohort to S2 (in 2010/11) and S3 (in 2011/12). It is already being speculated that 'community fatigue' might have set in and that such national mobilisation (communities, police, army, enforced prisoners etc) might not occur. Additionally, the Presidential campaigns of mid 2010 might divert attention away from community support for school development. However, the performance contracts of Mayors include a commitment to mobilise communities for school infrastructure construction. Additionally, communities themselves reveal a positive commitment to work on projects (e.g. schooling) that brings them benefits. More teachers and resources are also required and it is as yet unclear where these will come from. Equally, within the ESSP period there will be continued pressure to absorb the S3 graduate output into Upper Secondary Schools or into PBE and/or into labour market niches.

3.4.6 Post Basic Education

The second strategic priority (above) departs from the vision of the ESSP 2006 – 2010 by targeting the strengthening of the (already existing) system of post-basic education (PBE), which includes (i) general upper secondary education, (ii) teacher education, (iii) technical and vocational education and training (TVET) as well as (iv) higher education – all as components of the Rwandan sector-wide approach. Higher education, it is stressed, is not a priority target of this ESSP – and that, of course, has significant implications for the future of education in total and for the higher education sector and the HLIs. The more limited discussion of HE within the ESSP reflects the integration of HE into the sector-wide approach whilst simultaneously recognising the semi-autonomous nature of HE and HLIs.

Importantly, then, the ESSP is much more than an EFA plan, providing as it does an analysis of challenges within and across all levels and domains of the system and a holistic response to those challenges.

3.5 Key questions from the Appraisal Guidelines

3.5.1 Proposed long-term Strategic Direction for Sector Development?

The above discussion has portrayed the multi-layered nature of the ESSP vision. The appraisal endorses the appropriateness and feasibility of the strategic direction that the ESSP provides in pursuit of EFA of high quality and gender equality over the MDG period by 2015 as well as the intention to enhance provision and quality of PBE.

Specifically, the significant decision to implement the policy of 9YBE (with improved quality) indicates the Government's total commitment to these goals. The activities and progress made within the ESSP 2006-2010 indicates the potential to make further significant gains in terms of access, enrolment, retention, efficiency, completion and enhanced attainments. That said, there will remain the sustained challenges suggested above of continuing that commitment and achieving the goals of 9YBE and the EFA MDG targets. The implementation constraints and challenges of specific policies, especially the English Medium Policy may have been underestimated as the discussion in the risk analysis (at Annex 4c) shows – particularly in relation to advance training for teachers across the country and the provision of appropriate materials in adequate numbers.

3.5.2 What trade-offs are envisaged to reach 9YBE in a manner that is fiscally realistic and accommodates other claims on public resources, including claims by other sub-sectors of the education system?

The major trade-off is the endeavour to tackle the expansion v quality trade-off, inherited from the implementation of the ESSP 2006 to 2010 and its predecessor policies and activities. Rwanda has followed the pathway followed of most, if not all, countries embarking on the universalisation of primary education by seeking to enhance access (viz attract pupils to enter Grade 1 on day one of the school year) as the emphatic indicator and illustration of the success of the campaign. Concerns over retention and completion were not, it is apparent, the priority consideration, albeit they now are. The **quality** of the process and the **quality** of learning attainment was not necessarily an afterthought – nor was it necessarily of priority concern. In the linear pursuit of increased access and (subsequently) completion for all, the trade-off has been poor quality of educational provision. This is now the explicit priority of the ESSP: *the concepts of universal equitable access and quality of provision underpin the ESSP* (see the ESSP Foreword).

A second trade off is the enhanced policy attention to PBE, and particularly general secondary and TVET, as the second explicit priority and strategic focus of the ESSP. This is backed by the shift of resources: upper secondary will receive 9.5% of the actual and projected recurrent and capital expenditure 2009/10 – 2014/15 with TVET allocated 5.3% over that period. A fuller discussion of PBE is at 3.4.7.

9YBE is the explicitly stated twin priority of the ESSP 2010-2015 – together with PBE – and there is no sense of any deviation away from that commitment. The third (and most explicit and threatening) trade-off is the decrease in resources to the HE sector from 23.6% of actual total expenditure in 2009/10 to 13.8% in 2014/15 (and an average of 16% over that period). This does have enormous consequences for the HE sector and its necessary role as the future driver of the politico economy of the country. The limits of cost-recovery and income-generation in terms of cost-sharing at HE level are being explored and shared across the sector by MINEDUC and MINECOFIN.

In 2009/10 the actual public recurrent and capital expenditure for 9YBE was 61.3% of the total and this is intended to rise to 65.2% over the plan period, the greater percentage (38.4%) being allocated to primary education (grades 1-6).

These figures indicate a positive trend and commitment to ensure a priority focus for 9YBE within in the education budget and offers optimism that the strategy is fiscally realistic.

3.5.3 What structural policies are being adopted to ensure that student learning continues to improve in a context of rapid expansion?

The ESSP addresses issues associated with the determinants and challenges of the quality of the education process and thus of student learning and attainment. Some lessons have been learned, but it is suggested that further empirical enquiry and evidence may be important to enhance the full-scale focus upon quality demanded by the ESSP.

The ESSP argues that the main challenges will include:

Poor readiness of children who enter P1 – as a result of limited pre-primary school age enrolments (approximately 13.3% in 2008/9) and of the poor quality of much of the provision. Expansion of pre-primary provision or Early Childhood Development (ECD) is intended as one dimension of the priority objective of improving completion and drop-out rates. The appraisal considers this to be a key risk area as the risk analysis table at Annex discusses.

The ESSP commits the Ministry of Education to increase funding for ECD on from the current 299 million Rwandan Francs in 2009/2010 to 1,050 million francs for the year 2014/2015, a substantial three-fold increase in real terms. Expansion of ECD facilities has also been highlighted in the National Implementation Framework (NIF) as the key focus area to bring about improved result in completion, repetition and drop-out rates at primary level – the key results indicators for the primary sub sector. Quality elements of ECD have also been identifies in the NIF (improved curriculum, provision of qualifies caregivers, availability of teaching and learning materials) for areas of priority action over the next three years. The link between access to ECD and performance in primary and basic education, leading to greater internal efficiencies is thus firmly established in the ESSP.

The Development Partners recognise the increased attention which the ESSP is providing to the important area of school readiness, and will continue to build upon this momentum to support the allocation of increasing levels of funding. While the total amount of funding planned for ECD is increasing impressively over the term of the ESSP, the total allocation, as a percentage of the overall budget, is projected to rise only slightly, from the current 0.2% to 0.3% by 2014/15. While there have been increasing gains made in net enrolment rates at the primary level, enrolment in ECD remains low at 13.3% in 2008-09. Access to and improved quality of ECD centres in now on the agenda in the ESSP, which is a platform from which the sector can work to increase resource allocation and increased government commitment.

Insufficient supply of quality textbooks and learning materials across all subjects – with high costs and inappropriate methodology and pedagogy constraining improved supply and utilisation, However, the considerable changes resulting from the reformed Text-Book policy, in particular decentralising textbook selection by schools, is creating massive improvements in the supply, distribution and availability of text-books. The payment of suppliers only after delivery is considered to be an important trigger and incentive.

Financial constraints limiting the recruitment and retention of more qualified teachers, thus affecting classroom performance - poor salaries, questionable training, poor working and living conditions in some cases, low motivation - all indicate an unsatisfactory and dissatisfied profession. Allied with high pupil: teacher ratios (66.7:1 in 2009 [down from 74:1 in 2005]) which make pupil-centred methodologies virtually impossible, this militates against qualitative improvements in classrooms and thus enhanced pupil attainment.

Lack of systems to improve and monitor learning achievement, particularly basic literacy – the Rwanda National Examinations Council continues its long-standing P6 and S3 examinations but there remains as yet no systematic monitoring of learning achievement. The Inspectorate is developing a diagnostic tool (with support from UNESCO and UNICEF) to assess reading readiness as a basis for remedial interventions.

Variable school management and leadership and community engagement – although PTAs and PTCs exist *'poor school management and leadership, particularly of financial management and accountability'* persist as does, it might be added, poor pedagogical management. There has been considerable provision of training for school management and PTCs and improvements are anticipated.

The challenges of redressing poor quality cannot be under-estimated and the ESSP confronts them head on with clear strategic priorities:

- Reviewing the curriculum to target required skills and learning outcomes
- Mainstreaming the principles of child friendly schools, based on a costed strategy
- Implementing a planned and costed strategy for the acquisition of English Language skills by teachers and pupils
- Decentralising text-book selection to school level in the endeavour to encourage more affordable learning materials and better usage by teachers
- Enhancing the morale of teachers , as agents of quality improvement
- Influencing the methodological approach in classrooms
- Encouraging parental involvement.

The ESSP expands the range of activities associated with these dimension. Specifically in relation to the **improvement and assessment of literacy and numeracy**, it highlights the following:

- Monitoring of classroom performance by the Inspectorate and school heads - and school-self assessment approaches are to be encouraged
- Undertaking school-based and national assessments of English, Science and Maths (based initially on a grade 3 sample)
- Developing and implementing a comprehensive Monitoring and Learning Assessment system (MLA) to assess the acquisition of skills, attitudes and values and to evaluate the teaching and learning process
- Adopting a common literacy approach for lower primary

Thus it can be seen that the ESSP targets quality and attainment as priorities but the appraisal considers that the hasty implementation of the **English medium policy to be the major risk to uplifting school quality over the short and intermediate term** and this is reflected in the risk analysis table (annex 4c). Importantly, there is in preparation a Cabinet paper on mother tongue usage P 1-3, linked to ECD provision.

3.5.4 Policies are envisaged to manage the pressure to expand secondary education and to keep it affordable

The 9YBE policy has evolved a 9-year basic cycle (incorporating the hitherto lower secondary cycle – tronc commun) and created a model that separates BE from PBE (and its four sub sectors, (i) upper secondary (ii) teacher education; (iii) TVET (iv) HE).

The ESSP shows that enrolments in upper secondary schools remain low, with a net enrolment of 13% in 2009. But that demand is expected to increase rapidly in the wake of the expansion of 9YBE and to place additional pressures for more teachers, infrastructure and resources.

The ESSP is less clear on the overall **efficiency** interventions targeted at upper secondary levels, but includes:

- Increased role of the private sector education in teacher specialisation and the better utilisation of teacher time
- Introduction of access criteria
- Day schools (to overcome the heavy costs of boarding schools)
- Evening classes
- Open and Distance learning (intended for roll out at this level after being refined at HE levels)

If implemented, these would all enhance access, participation and attainment.

3.5.5 Coverage and costs of post-secondary education

PBE is defined in the ESSP as all education and training provided after basic education. ESSP provides a brief situation analysis of the role and position of PBE in fitting the PBE output for labour market needs. It does not provide targets for coverage and the unit costs of service delivery as a basis for assessing the overall fiscal viability of the ESSP, although this approach is used in the cost and finance model used by MINEDUC.

The issue of co-ordination across the PBE field is being faced by MINEDUC's appointment of a PBE Director of Post-Basic and Higher Education, accountable to the Director-General for Education (see MINEDUC Organisation chart 2.2). This is a significant role, tasked with rationalising provision, avoiding duplication and, together with major impetus from WDA, enhancing the overall 'status' of TVET vis a vis the erstwhile high status academic tracks – thus orienting the TVET system towards the 20/20 goals. This is a significant challenge since the structures for "harmonisation" have yet to be fully developed and patterns of duplication continue to exist.

Coherence and linkages between and across institutions as well as clarity the pathways that students can follow within the existing fragmented sector (a significant percentage of which is within the mushrooming 'private sector') will be a major part of the challenge as part of the endeavour to avoid repletion and duplication of provision (within both government and private sectors). Additionally, the clarity of pathways for students, both vertically and horizontally, is a huge part of the challenge of integration and harmonisation of PBE.

At present RNEB, HED and WDA provide separate and distinct mechanisms for examining and accrediting at school, HE and PBE levels. Acceleration towards the proposed creation of an overall National Education and Training Qualifications Framework (NQF) to provide standardised qualifications and 'equivalencies' will provide a major impetus towards ensuring adherence to standardised requirements for the graduates of the multiplicity of programmes, geared towards labour-market needs and 20/20 goals. A major challenge during the ESSP is how to speed up its implementation.

Whilst the challenges involved in reorienting the curriculum and redirecting classroom and training place towards 'labour market' requirements imposes major challenges on many institutions ('academically' oriented as they are for historical reasons), this major 'risk' area may well be downplayed during the early period of the ESSP implementation.

Where will the TVET trainers and instructors come from? This is not addressed in the ESSP and will prove a key constraint, amongst many challenges. At present KIST provides some training and there are other examples of short-course and/or open and distance training and learning. An overall professionalization strategy (identified in the ESSP) linked to the

emergent National Qualifications Framework is to be evolved with obvious implications for reorientation within schools, classrooms and training centres.

The major culture shift away from supply-side training to prepare for demand-led training, which is at the heart of the ESSP policy, will inevitably take time. Nevertheless, the huge drive by GoR for Vision 2020 and a place in the global knowledge economy has provided a very strong platform for these long-term challenges.

3.5.6 Policies to meet challenges such as HIV/AIDS and conflict

Conflict. *'Rwanda culture, peace, unity and reconciliation'* is one of the **high level objectives of the education sector**. The ESSP recognises that the traumatic consequences of the genocide will need to be addressed through specific counselling, care, support and curriculum development. It internalises the challenges of dealing with orphans and vulnerable children (OVCs) within its strategies for Special Needs Education (SNE) [one of the six priority cross-cutting issues flagged at the outset of the ESSP].

Special Needs Education. The National Constitution and the 2007 Ministry of Gender and Family Protection (MIGEPROF) policy together with MINEDUC's (2007) SNE policy ensure SNE is prioritised as a cross-cutting domain. The overall objective is to ensure that *'all categories of learners access quality education services'*. There are special needs access policies, but provision (and even equity) is limited, though the MINEDUC SNE task force is working on the strategies to enhance delivery.

School health, HIV/AIDS prevention and sports: Good discussions of HIV/AIDS occurs throughout the ESSP. Prevalence is low (about 3%), albeit there is no cause for complacency. Legal frameworks exist. There are substantial programmes within HLIs and other areas of PBE. The curriculum picks up HIV/AIDS issues (and other health messages). Learning materials exist and there is constant pressure from the development partners.

There is an also major focus on malnutrition, especially at BE level where it is being addressed through school-feeding, provision of milk, school gardens etc.

3.5.7 Policies to meet the challenges of gender inequality in relation to enrolment, retention, completion and learning outcomes in a context of rapid expansion

Girls Education is one of the 7 priority cross-cutting issues. The Girls Education Strategic Plan was approved in 2009 providing the framework for interventions.

ESSP provides a brief situational analysis of Girls' and Womens' Education at 3.1.5, indicating the Government *'strong support'* in this cross-cutting domain *'as a corner stone to realise its goal to provide quality fee-free education to all'* as well as *'ensuring that women are also well skilled beyond basic level to contribute to Rwanda's economic and social development.'*

This analysis highlights the limitations on approaches to enhance the quality of girls' attainments (vis a vis boys) in spite of the higher percentage of girls enrolment (52%) and completion patterns (78%) in basic education. That said, the examination performance of girls is lower than boys. Of those achieving first division in the P6 national examinations in 2009, 60.7% were boys and 39.3% were girls (with a wider differential 68.2:31.8% at S3 national examinations). The analysis also stresses the limitations of access to specific male-dominated tracks (e.g. Science and Technology) within PBE as well as under-representation () in HLIs. At these levels, the representation, participation and performance of girls is of concern. They are more likely to be in private, non-vocationalised HLIs (specialising in law, accountancy, business, secretarial and academic tracks) than in higher status STI and ICT related tracks.

In spite of a strong ethos and high-level (e.g. Parliamentarian, First Lady Etc [see 3.1.5]) commitment and drive, it is proving problematic for the ESSP to overcome the well-embedded norms that determine the social roles played by girls and women. This is especially so in rural areas, where girls are most likely to drop-out – a key equity issue. Girls' attendance is affected by menstrual issues, and attempts are made to provide for this (e.g. through ensuring adequate latrines, sanitary towels etc).

Although there is improved participation by girls within 9YBE, which is helping to close the gender gap and address gender equity issues there is a need to prioritise greater access and improved performance for girls in upper secondary schools as well as to re-address the inequitable balance of girls' participation in public TVET provision and HLIs (NUR, COEs).

Specific ESSP challenges to meet gender inequality

- Develop gender sensitive and learner-centred methodologies
- Training educationists in gender issues
- Reviewing curricula and materials from a gender perspective
- Sensitisation families/communities about the importance of girls' completion and achievement
- Promoting affirmative action policies
- Integrating girls education into District plans and budgets

An 'equity and inclusion' study is planned for August and September 2010 with the intention of filling many of the gaps in data and understanding around these areas.

3.6 Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation

3.6.1 Processes and Tools

MINEDUC undertakes planning on an annual basis. The ESSP logframe, the National Implementation Framework, and the Monitoring and Evaluation Framework will serve to guide planning. The ESSP sets out in detail how these tools will be utilised to ensure performance is measured and priorities are being addressed and achieved.

3.6.2 National Implementation Framework

The 3 year national implementation framework (NIF) was established through a highly consultative process involving District officials, key Ministry officials, and development partners. The process engaged partners through both interviews and workshops. It was a challenging exercise that helped officials prioritise activities and identify realistic timeframes, outputs and targets in the 3 year period.

The implementation framework is directly based on the 7 objectives outlined in the ESSP. It identifies the key strategies that will need to be implemented to achieve the programme objectives, and breaks these down into a number of activities with respective targets and outputs. It identifies when in the 3 year period the activities will be implemented, whose responsibility it is to implement, and who will monitor progress against achieving the outputs.

The purpose of the implementation framework is to provide a stronger bridge between the broader policies and strategies of the ESSP and the Annual Operational Plan and Budget which looks at specific programme deliverables and budgets. In the past, the Annual Planning and Budgeting process has often not been related sufficiently to key policies and priorities, but the NIF helps to concretise how these strategies will be delivered on the ground.

Although it does not cover all activities envisaged, it sufficiently covers the major activities in enough detail that overall progress towards achieving the ESSP outcomes should be measurable. Importantly, as a tool it identifies who is responsible and hence who is accountable when targets are not achieved or activities are not implemented. It is likely to be particularly helpful for district officials in implementing the plan at grassroots level, including M+E linkages.

For development partners it is a useful tool as it succinctly summarises the type of activities envisioned and necessary under each strategy. For NGO partners this will be particularly helpful in ensuring new programmes complement and enhance delivery of government priorities.

The framework has been designed to cover a 3 year period until the end of the 2012/13 fiscal year. During the 3 years progress will be reviewed annually and reported on at the JRES meetings. Subject to discussion and agreement, the framework will be revised accordingly. It is planned that this framework will be reviewed and revised at the end of the 3 year period to cover the final 2 years of the ESSP time span.

The NIF has a very detailed action (2010/11 – 2013/14) with a time-table for the envisaged activities (see above). Its disbursement schedule is based on the budget year by year not month by month.

It has clear division of responsibility for every activity among the central- and local-level units that will implement its various components. The DAF Budget execution reports show differences between planned and actual expenditures – influencing whether resources actually reach the intended destination.

The inclusion of the logical framework, priority policy actions matrix, and key performance indicators is an excellent approach to summarizing the ESSP priorities and to allowing performance to be well-monitored during the ESSP period.

3.6.3 Monitoring and Evaluation

As part of FTI EPDF support, a detailed monitoring and evaluation framework was established to help guide the Ministry through the process of both data collection and analysis. This detailed tool not only identifies what data to collect, but also when, by who and how it will be analysed and reported on. The tool will enable the Ministry to measure and report on all the key indicators in the ESSP logframe. The development partners are committed to strengthening the Ministry of Education's monitoring role and this detailed framework will support the Ministry in building its capacity around data collection and analysis. Challenges of capacity are highlighted below.

The Education Management Information System (EMIS) is under development and following earlier challenges is now on the right track to generating credible and reliable data. Capacity to use this system for planning will be built at both the central and District levels. The specific issues around EMIS and proposed actions to address those issues are discussed in detail in table 4C. EMIS reports and information will also be widely disseminated to relevant stakeholders. Data from various household surveys will also be used to cross check against the EMIS data for a number of indicators, as outlines in detail in the National Implementation Framework.

The joint review processes have been working effectively to monitor progress in achieving results and in to address specific challenges which have been identified and will continue to operate in the same way for the duration of this ESSP. Effective coordination and participation around the joint review processes has been highlighted as a strength amongst

development partners and the Ministry (see 2.5). The joint reviews are accompanied by joint field monitoring visits where specific themes are examined and the impact of reforms discussed at the field level.

3.7 Capacity constraints and Capacity Development

Lack of capacity is a major risk to the ESSP (see the capacity assessment table at 4C). The appraisal notes that reviews have consistently pointed out that the capacity of the MINEDUC has remained weak despite the extra demands laid upon it and the formal and informal capacity building and technical support provided, though new appointees are required to be trained for the post. Decentralisation and devolution of functions and posts to semi-autonomous agencies have left the ministry with the limited staff for its responsibilities. A recent Functional Review and Institutional Audit (2007) of MINEDUC has noted that staff and skill shortages in the Policy, Planning and Capacity Building Unit are being compensated for by project staff and technical assistance, but this is unsustainable and masks the lack of capacity only in the short term. Limited capacity in planning and budgeting has meant limited institutionalisation of the cost and financing model which is a serious constraint on the ESSP.

The main risks with a limited capacity in MINEDUC is difficulties in implementing planned activities, and also the reliance on a very small number of key individuals to ensure a coherent and comprehensive planning, budgeting and reporting by the Ministry. The new Rwanda Education Board (REB) structure, described in the ESSP, is intended to ensure more effective overall and synergistic management of the system as a whole.

These capacity gaps, quantitatively and qualitatively, are mirrored in most components of the system at all levels. This includes District Offices (where there is only one DEO), sectors, and constituent units of the REBs, HLIS, and departments in MINEDUC. However, it is intended to appoint sector education officers- which will add a further 416 staff within the system. Furthermore, five additional auditors will be appointed in MINEDUC with the responsibility for auditing in a designated province.

Table 4C is a major outcome of the appraisal process, portraying the overall systemic capacity constraints and identifies in some detail MINEDUC's proposed plans to strengthen capacity across the system.

It highlights constraints and responses in the following key areas:

- Teacher recruitment, support and development (Pre-service and In-service)
- Student Assessment and Curriculum Development
- Data for better Management
- Procurement and Contracting
- Administration and Management
- Legal and Institutional framework
- School Level and PTCs.

MINEDUC is continuing to develop its overall capacity building plan and providing in-house courses and mentoring. The appointment of an HR specialist will speed up the expansion of its HR plan. Table 4C thus provides a very important range of findings upon which MINEDUC can plan and oversee its capacity building initiatives in a holistic way.

The Education Sector Capacity Building Pool Fund (ESCBPF) was established in 2006 as part of the Joint Education Sector Support (JESS) programme to support operationalisation of the ESSP by providing a channel for joint Development Partner support to the Education Sector. The overall objective of the Fund is to support sustainable strategic institutional capacity building within the Education Sector to ensure delivery of the ESSP. The Fund has

made important contributions but JRES is considering the more effective use and of the Fund. Currently a process is under way as part of the development of the new ESSP, to integrate the ESCBPF into the planning process. Already there is agreement on the general principles and criteria for use of this Fund to guide planning for 2010-11 and beyond. This is important given that the ESCBPF has limited resources, and hence it is essential to agree general principles for its use in order to ensure that it contributes in an effective way to supporting the ESSP to deliver on its ambitious goals.

3.8 Financing framework

The ESSP Chapter 5 sets out the expenditure requirements to meet the priorities of the ESSP broken down by education level and anticipated resources of finance from GoR and external sources. It seeks to capture the goals and targets of the ESSP and to cost them, with cost projections over 5 years broken down by level and domain (as in the Logframe). Using MINEDUC's somewhat complex cost and financing model (which has helped to inform the creation of Table 3B) it tries to cost as many of the targets as possible, using a 'best estimate' of such costs.

3.8.1 Cost and Financing model

As a basis for seeking to appraise the underlying realities of the financing framework, some elements of the cost and financing model are attempted here.

The approach to costing differs in relation to primary and secondary school costs (which is explained below) and HE (unit costs) TVET (unit costs for recurrent), non-formal education (unit costs).

3.8.2 School levels

A unit costing approach is not used – rather the model captures a range of variables. In the broadest sense, the model works by making enrolment projections at each level and using a range of other variables (enrolment, retention, completion etc) for every year of schooling. Using the base line and 5 year targets for teacher-pupil ratios (based on enrolment projections) it calculates the demand for teachers year on year for the 5 year period.

The average teacher salary is set as a target (as a multiple of GDP per capita), and this targeted average teacher salary is multiplied by the projected number of teachers (derived from pupil-teacher ratio targets and pupil enrolment projections). One complexity of the way in which this is presented in the budget arises because some elements of a teacher's salary are lost in the capitation grant, for example. Importantly, this is the largest recurrent cost - albeit lower than desirable (and global comparisons) and intended to rise. Construction of classrooms is based on classroom:student ratio targets and the projection of the number of classrooms required. Similarly, the number of dormitories to be built is based on target numbers of boarding students. Capitation grants and school feeding grants are based on a formula to calculate those costs.

3.8.3 Costs for higher education

These are also based upon current enrolment figures and targets for enrolment growth and using a unit cost to calculate the year by year recurrent costs in HE. HE capital costs also use a formula but capital costs are small (about 2m Rwf pa) – as a result of a focus on maintenance rather than construction; and the use of the private sector. Calculating student costs is complicated by the procedures of SFAR, which has 3 means-tested levels and differential loan levels for Arts v Science students. SFAR's distinction between loans and grants; its low cost recovery of loans; its support for private and overseas students add further complications. A proposal to facilitate student access to the SSPR fund to pay HE

fees and repay against future income is an endeavour to remove the burden of funding HE from GoR – as part of the justification for decreasing the %allocations to HE.

3.8.4 TVET

A unit cost approach is for recurrent costs used based on the requested WDA budget for 2010/2011. MINEDUC has current enrolment figures and WDA has projections. Capital costs are calculated as in school level costs, based on unit costs from MINEDUC Construction Unit. There are so many facets of TVET that it is difficult to incorporate this totally in the model at present. In any case, data may not be reliable (especially from private sector sources).

This simplified snapshot alone indicates the complexity of endeavoring to capture a range of intricate data – in a context in which data from schools and districts (feeding into the EMIS) are a crucial part of the cost and financing data base. This relies on core data, for example enrolment rates, which is fundamental to data collection.

3.8.5 Magnitude of costs

The annual budgets in the MTEF are consistent with the ESSP cost estimates. Vision 2020 and EDPRS determine the strategic direction for the country's education sector. In practice the annual budget cycle drives MINEDUC's processes but in future the ESSP will drive the budget.

- ESSP Table 5.1 lays out the Actual and Projected Recurrent Expenditures 2009/10 - 2014/15
- ESSP Table 5.2 lays out the Actual and Projected Capital Expenditures 2009/10 - 2014/15
- ESSP Table 5.3 lays out the Actual and Projected Recurrent + Capital Expenditures (combined in total) 2009/10 -2014/15.

They are disaggregated by levels (and also show % projections over time - recurrent and capital combined).

The aggregate percentage allocated to each sub-sector over the plan period is summarized below:

Pre-Primary	0.2%
Primary + L secondary = Basic	65.2%
Upper Secondary	9.5%
Pre-Service Teacher education	1.5%
TVET	5.3%
HE	16.0%
Non Formal	0.2%
STR	1.3%
Institutional support	0.8%

Consistent with 9YBE, BE (65.2%) is by far the highest priority for recurrent and capital support.

The total projected Recurrent and Capital Expenditure 2009/10 – 2014/15 for the ESSP is USD 2,660,923,723.

The projected aggregate recurrent and capital costs in 2015 appear realistic and feasible to finance. The estimates are realistic. The expenditure targets are realistic: and it is realistic to believe they can be achieved. The tough challenge is whether the funding gap can be closed. The costs and financing model accounts for the projected nominal GDP growth (averaging at 12.6% per annum). It depends on internal and external resource mobilization as well as the engagement of the private sector. The ambitious targets reflect Vision 2020 and these are highlighted in the NIF. It is this ambition that is built into **Scenario 3 (viz the ESSP approach) in the ESSP Table 5.4**

The assumed level of domestic funding for education is identified in the ESSP Table 5.4, which provides a Financial Overview 2009 – 2015 of Scenario 3, indicating

- recurrent and capital expenditures (as summarized from tables 5.1, 5.2, 5.3) as for the figure above USD 2,660,923,723.
- the aggregate resources available from domestic sources, budget support and on-budget project support as USD 1,841,677,526.
- a funding gap of USD 819,246,196, which includes projected external support
- an overall financing gap – without external support of USD 1,183,165,502.

3.8.6 The allocations

The appraisal guidelines ask what share of the recurrent cost funding gap is for teacher salaries, in primary education and in other levels of education. However, the data is not disaggregated or earmarked in the ways questioned above. It is presented as an overall figure aggregated for all the ESSP requirements. The model does not include projections of the impact (as also questioned) of HIV/AIDS as such. The data includes projections for expenditure on HIV/AIDs in schools. This amount increases over the ESSP. The mode also accounts for teacher attrition which is partly attributable to HIV/AIDs.

The appraisal guidelines also ask whether the projected unit costs are realistic in light of the need to reach the poor, most vulnerable and marginalized groups. The approach within the cost and financing model (above) shows that it is based upon a range of variables and not on a unit-cost basis. The Log frame targets (100% enrolments by 2015) incorporate reaching the poor, vulnerable and marginalized as well as enhancing quality to mitigate against the past priority on expansion (at the expense of quality). Non-salary expenditures include such items/interventions as solar panels, ICT, SNE and girls education – all of which assist in reaching the vulnerable, poor and marginalized in a more equitable way. Existing gender data is good and a lot is gender disaggregated. There is a large focus on girls' education (see 3.5.7).

The appraisal guidelines also ask whether the costs of classroom investments are reasonable. Evolved over time from the MINEDUC Construction Unit, the construction costs appear 'reasonable' and affordable. The massive construction effort of 2009/2010 was based on substantial community mobilization and inputs, which cut construction costs by 1/3rd. Whether this is replicable has been questioned in view of 'community fatigue' but internal resource mobilization is a key factor in keeping construction costs 'reasonable'.

The appraisal discussion of upper secondary education is at 3.5.4 above. The key challenge is when and how to expand the absorptive capacity of Upper Secondary as the S1, S2, S3 waves complete 9YBE 2013/14 onwards. TVET will also need further expansion to absorb S3 leavers. In order assist the priority focus on PBE, this is also planned for in the costings. It is planned to increase over time with the sequencing planned to increase capital expenditure for Upper secondary Schools after 2013/2014. The main consideration is the upward pressure of 9YBE graduates seeking upper secondary and/or TVET places, which may also place additional pressure on the private sector. 68% of upper secondary students

are in the private sector and the intention is to keep the same % - albeit that the aggregate numbers will then increase dramatically. The scale of expansion—certainly in the projected increase in student numbers and teacher recruitment—appears realistic given experience in the recent past. Teacher recruitment numbers are less certain. Recent experience based on both construction mobilization in 2009/10 and the new text book policy suggests that the aggregate volume of classroom construction and of textbook acquisition is achievable.

TVET is discussed in detail in the ESSP. It should be noted that, prior to this ESSP, a considerable amount of construction took place in 2008/9, 2009/10. Its allocation of 5.3% of the total expenditure takes this into account.

The debate over HE is well-aired. The 16% allocation takes into account the relatively small enrolments, limited capital spending and the overall priorities for 9YBE and TVET.

Amongst the less prominent domains, non-formal education programmes involve large numbers but only has 0.2% of the budget. ECD is similarly allocated 0.2% in order to cover costs of materials and ECD teacher training. Most ECD provision is within the private sector and/or NGOs, CBOs and community initiatives. STR receives a 'reasonable' 1.3%.

3.8.7 Funding scenarios

The ESSP Figure 5.4 shows the projected financing gap from 2009/10 – 2014/15. Despite efforts to obtain further allocations from domestic resources above the assumed level of 18% (which may seem unlikely)- together with new DP support and new cost-sharing approaches (training levies, extension of the RNSFAS loan scheme, private participation in PBE), there is a considerable risk that the gap will not be bridged. The costing used for the ESSP financing framework is based upon the ambitious policies, objectives and targets within the ESSP Logframe. **This is Scenario 3** (the preferred option).

Two additional, less ambitious, Scenarios are also briefly flagged in an annex. **Scenario 1** is the least ambitious and the cheapest, assuming moderate enrolment growth, less achievement of efficiency measures (e.g. reducing class size, eradicating double shifting), greater involvement of the private sector and rapid decline of boarding students. Scenario 2 is a half-way house.

The following table shows the % cumulative funding gap 2009/10 – 2014/15. *'The financing gap is clearly significant'*, as the table shows, varying from a high of 45% for **Scenario 3 (the ESSP Scenario)** without external support to 13% for Scenario 1 with external support.

	Scenario 3	Scenario 2	Scenario 1
Funding Gap without external support	45%	35%	30%
Funding gap with external support	31%	19%	13%

On questions of financial feasibility and prioritization, one DP noted in the appraisal process that even the least ambitious **Scenario 1** (which might *still* use optimistic economic growth assumptions) seems to result in a financing gap of 13%. The ESSP, it feels, does not really provide the basis for discussing prioritization. The ESSP says *'Given the inherent unpredictability of revenues, there is a need to periodically review spending plans and the MTEF as more accurate information becomes available.'* This will be done through the annual planning and budgeting process with the implications for the implementation of the ESSP being reviewed at the annual JRES. At that stage, even if the preferred Scenario 3 is commenced now, it may become necessary to scale down ambitions and this would need to be based on the LTSFF together with a clear indication of the costs/benefits of alternative policy choices. The issues of whether ambitions might be scaled down across the board (as

various patterns of Scenarios 1 or 2) or whether specific individual reforms would be postponed might profitably be addressed at this stage.

3.9 Appraisal Conclusion

The appraisal considers the ESSP to be a well-thought through and well justified document. It is clearly written and well-focused. It is also fairly realistic about of what can and cannot be achieved in the ESSP period from 2010 – 2015 taking into account both financial and capacity constraints. The FRA was positive about risk levels in MINEDUC (as only **moderate**). As the capacity assessment (table 4c) shows there are major capacity gaps that are seen as high risk areas. In addition to these, there is a major danger of ignoring the fundamental challenges and risks associated with the implementation of the English medium policy. The ESSP provides a good balance between basic and post-basic levels and between equity and labour market considerations. The logical framework and NIF actions matrices help frame the priorities and will be key tools during M+E of ESSP, as long as reliable and appropriate M+E data become available and the embryonic EMIS continues to improve.

GoR and MINEDUC have laid the groundwork in an acceptable and realistic way to respond to the challenges of the ESSP 2010 – 2015.

REFERENCES

- Bennel P with Ntagaramba**, Teacher Motivation and Incentives: a Situational Analysis and Recommended Priority Actions (December 2008)
- Chiche M**, MidTerm Evaluation of the EFA-FTI Fast Track Initiative: County Desk Study Rwanda (CEC, Mokoro, OPM (September 2009)
- Education Sector Cluster Group Education** Joint Sector Review Summary Report Jan-June 2009 (mini-budget) (October 2009)
- Education Sector Cluster Group Education** Joint Sector Review Summary Report (2010)
- EFA FTI** Secretariat Guidelines for the Appraisal of the Primary Education Component of an education sector Plan (March 2006)
- FAWE** Gender Analysis of the TVET Policy in Rwanda (January 2010)
- Madzonga G** Fiduciary Risk Assessment (FRA) of the Education sector in Rwanda (April 2010)
- MINECOFIN** Economic Development and Poverty Reduction Strategy 2008 – 2012 (September 2007)
- MINEDUC** Education Sector Policy (2003)
- MINEDUC** Education Sector Strategic Plan 2010 – 2015 (June 2010)
- MINEDUC** Special Needs Education Policy (July 2007)
- MINEDUC** Teacher Development and Management Policy in Rwanda (2007)
- MINEDUC** Girls' Education Policy (April 2008)
- MINEDUC** Financing Options for Rwanda's Post Basic Education Strategy (July 2009)
- MINEDUC** Girls' Education Strategic Plan 2009 – 2013 (August 2009)
- MINEDUC** Plan Strategique National d'Alpabetisation 2010 – 2014 (April 2010)
- MINEDUC** Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) Policy in Rwanda (April 2008)
- MINEDUC** Integrated Early Childhood Development Strategic plan 2010- 2015 (December 2009)
- MIFOTRA** National Skills Audit (January 2009)
- RNEC** Rwanda National Examinations Council Citizen's Charter (2010)
- Robinson** Education Sector Costing Report (2009)
- UNU-IAS** The Republic of Rwanda's Policy on Science, Technology and Innovation (October 2006)
- Watkins A and Verma A** (eds) Building Science, Technology and Innovation in Capacity in Rwanda (World Bank 2008)
- Williamson T and Dom C** Sector Budget Support in Practice; synthesis Report (ODI and Mokoro August 2009)

4 ANNEXES

ANNEX A: Risk Analysis

The appraisal uses the discussion in the risk analysis workshop to reflect upon the challenges and risks associated with the qualitative dimensions. The table below highlights the areas that the ESSP considers to be the highest levels of risks – particularly as they relate to improving the quality of educational provision. Actions were identified and agreed during the workshop and have been listed below.

Risk Analysis Table

Area of Risk	Nature of risk	Agreed Actions
ECD	Supply does not match demand Sustained poor quality ECD provision Private sector provision driven by profit Poorly equipped ECD leavers ill-equipped for 9YBE entry Poorly equipped entry at 9YBE spirals up the grades Insufficient teachers	Affordable and realistic expansion policies Inspectorate rigour in applying minimum quality standards As above Train ECD teachers appropriately Review school readiness curriculum Review salaries
English Medium linked with Literacy	Lack of clearly defined language policy Lack of appropriate curriculum Lack of clarity over implementation time-scales Lack of English Language champion in MINEDUC English Language teaching staff cannot keep pace with increased school populations No PRESET Teachers inadequate grasp of English Language and teaching methodologies Absence of appropriate materials to support learning Inadequate resourcing for nation-wide dissemination	Generate a national language and language in education policy Review languages curriculum Re-address reality of expectations in light of recent experience Appoint appropriate expert Accelerate and expand English language programmes for teachers Evolve PRESET Focus on English Language training in INSET and expand inset REAP provision Undertake needs assessment to identify need Ring-fenced resources for MINEDUC based expansion programme, adequately staffed
REB	REB slow to materialise Lack of clarity about roles, functions and expectation Inadequate resources and staffing for each new entity	Review progress Need for conceptualisation Staff development programmes for any new roles Provide necessary resources and staffing
TVET	Lack of clarity over TVET provision Sustained lack of co-ordination Lack of appropriate training and instruction Inadequate numbers of TVET trainers Unclear pathways within and across the system and into labour market Unemployment of 'graduates' Supply side training continues to predominate	MINEDUC and WDA continue to map TVET provision More targeted and efficient approach to co-ordination Undertake appropriate training needs analysis Undertake TVET instructor supply and demand study Continue to map existing and desirable transition points

	<p>Unharmonised qualifications and accreditation inadequate resourcing Income generation proves problematic</p>	<p>Need greater understanding of labour market skill requirements and expectations As above to lead to demand-driven training Evolve National Qualifications Framework Revise funding priorities Scale down expectations</p>
--	---	--

ANNEX B: Tables

Table 1: Catalogue of Main Documents for the Technical Appraisal

Document	Date of draft/ Base Year Data	Authorship/ sponsorship	Document Length
Education Sector Policies and Strategic Plans			
5 -year strategic directions for whole sector	2009	MINEDUC/FTI	5 Years
3-year implementation action plan	2010	MINEDUC/FTI	3 Years
Education Policy	2002	MINEDUC	N/A
Girl's Education Policy	2008	MINEDUC/UNICEF	N/A
Higher Education Policy	2008	MINEDUC	N/A
Science, Technology and Innovation Policy	2006	MINEDUC	N/A
Special Needs Education Policy	2007	MINEDUC	N/A
Teacher Development and Management Policy	2007	MINEDUC	N/A
Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) Policy	2008	MINEDUC	N/A
Education Cost and Finance Simulation Model	2009	MINEDUC	5 years
List relevant education sector analyses			
a) Gender analysis of the sector	2008	MINEDUC	N/A
Equity and inclusion study	2010	MINEDUC/FTI	N/A
b) Social analysis of the sector			
Teachers Motivation Study	2009	MINEDUC	N/A
c) Economic analysis of the sector			
Post Basic Education Study	2009	MINEDUC/DFID	N/A
Fiduciary Risk Assessment	2010	DFID/FTI	N/A
d) Etc.			

Table 2A: Population and Education Indicators Selected from the Appraisal Documents

DOMAIN/INDICATOR	2006	2007	2008	2009
SELECTED POPULATION CHARACTERISTICS				
Total Size	8,648,248	9,556,669	9,831,501	10,117,029
Females	3,643,432	4,959,390	5,095,397	5,236,798
% of population below the poverty line	56.9 ¹	na	Na	na
Females				Na
HIV prevalence rates among adults				3.0
Females				3.8
% orphans among children ages 7-14				3.9
Females				Na
GROSS ENROLMENT RATIOS (%)				
Primary Overall	145.30%	151.90%	127.90%	128.40%
Males	143.40%	151.30%	127.30%	127.30%
Females	147.20%	152.50%	128.50%	129.40%
Secondary Overall	18.40%	20.50%	22.00%	25.80%
Males	19.70%	21.90%	23.40%	26.70%
Females	17.10%	19.10%	20.70%	24.90%
Higher Overall	Na	na	na	4.20%
Females	Na	na	na	Na
PRIMARY EDUCATION ENROLMENTS AND STUDENT FLOW				
Total enrolments	2,019,991	2,150,430	2,190,270	2,264,672
Males	984,272	1,058,026	1,076,159	1,114,253
Females	1,035,719	1,092,404	1,114,111	1,150,419
% in privately financed and managed schools	N/A	N/A	N/A	6.00%
NET ENROLMENT RATIO				
Males	95.00%	95.80%	94.20%	92.90%
Females	97.00%	96.80%	95.10%	94.10%
Entry rate to Grade 1 (%)	N/A	N/A	N/A	207.00%
Females	Na	na	na	231.00%
Cross-sectional measure	Na	na	na	na
Females	Na	na	na	na
Cohort measure	N/A	N/A	N/A	38.00%
Females	na	na	na	na
Primary education completion rate (%)	N/A	N/A	53.00%	74.50%
Males	N/A	N/A	N/A	70.60%
Females	N/A	N/A	53.00%	78.40%
Cross-sectional measure	na	na	na	na
Females	na	na	na	na
Cohort measure	N/A	N/A	N/A	38.00%
Females	na	na	na	na
Repeaters as % of enrolments (rate)	N/A	17.70%	15.30%	
Males	na	17.70%	15.70%	
Females	na	17.80%	15.00%	
Girls as % of total enrolments/completions				
Females	na	na	na	
Transition rate from P6 to S1	58.70%	54.60%	87.90%	
Males	62.00%	56.60%	89.90%	
Females	55.30%	52.70%	86.30%	
PRIMARY STUDENT LEARNING OUTCOMES				
Average national score on an international student assessment	Na	na	na	na
Percent correct answers on national standardized tests	Na	na	na	na

¹ Information collected every 5 years

GOVT. PRIMARY SCHOOL SERVICE DELIVERY INDICATORS				
Years in cycle				
Pupil-teacher qualified ratio (overall)	73	75	73	63
In rural schools	75	78	69	66
Pupil-classroom ratio (overall)	66	70	71	70
In rural schools	68	73	74	72
Pupil-textbook ratio core subjects	na	5	3	2
Number of teachers	30,637	31,037	35,672	35,254
Females	15,625	15,829	18,193	17,980
Civil servants as % of total	97.60%	97%	97%	95%
Females	No started	62%	64%	63%
AVERAGE ANNUAL WAGE BILL PER TEACHER (INCLUDING BENEFITS) AS A % OF GDP PER CAPITA				
Civil servants	NA	NA	NA	200.00%
Non-civil servants	NA	NA	NA	182.90%
Instructional hours and teaching loads	NA	NA	NA	
Annual instructional hours for pupils	NA	NA	NA	720
Average pupils' instructional hours per week	NA	NA	NA	20
Average teachers' teaching load per week (hours)	NA	NA	NA	20
PUBLIC SPENDING ON EDUCATION				
Public expenditure on education as a share of total public expenditure	17.90%	18.50%	15.30%	17.20%
Recurrent spending on education (all levels) as % of GDP	3.50%	4.30%	4.20%	6.60%
Primary education's recurrent budget share of total education recurrent spending	41.30%	41.20%	44.90%	34.80%
Share of recurrent primary education spending used on inputs other than teachers (%)	40.90%	53.50%	56.00%	57.00%
Average recurrent cost per student (as % of GDP per capita)				
Primary	6.80%	7.10%	6.80%	7.60%
Secondary	32.30%	57.60%	48.20%	35.80%
Higher	516.60%	363.20%	382.40%	467.70%

Table 2B: Education Indicators for disadvantaged groups as relevant (Last available year)

	Gross enrolment ratios				Primary education				
	Primary	Secondary	Higher	Total enrolments	Net Enrolment ratio	Entry rate to Grade 1	Completion rate	% of Repeaters	Learning achievement scores
Total									
Boys									
Girls									
Urban (Total/Females)									
Rural (Total/Females)									
Richest quintile (Total/Females)									
Poorest quintile (Total/Females)									
Best performing region: (Total/Females)									
Worst performing region: (Total/Females)									
Disabled children (Total/Females)									
Indigenous groups (Total/Females)									

This information is not available in Rwanda currently, however will be addressed as part of the ongoing Equity and Inclusion Study which is being financed out of EPDF resources.

Table 3A: Overall Sector Priority Objectives and Strategies

<p>Sector Priority Objectives and Strategies for Universalising Primary Education</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• High Level Objectives include improved and increased access to education for all• The purpose is Access to quality equitable and effective education for all• Priority on fast tracking 9 years of basic education• Expansion of Early childhood development• Mainstreaming the child-friendly schools program
<p>Sector Priority Objectives and Strategies for Promoting Gender Equality</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• High level objectives include Equity in Education at all levels• Priority on Girls Education as a cross cutting issue• developing gender sensitive and learner-centred methodologies;• training of educationalists, trainers and education planners in gender issues;• reviewing education curricula and learning materials from a gender perspective;• sensitising families and local communities about the importance of girls' completing and improving achievement in formal education;• Promoting affirmative action policies, where appropriate, to ensure equal opportunities for girls, and• integrating girls' education into District plans and budgets.

Table 3B: Selected Cost and Financing Simulation Results for Assessing Strategic Directions

Indicator	EFA FTI Indicative benchmark	Country's base year position	Targets/Outcomes in 2015 under Alternative Policy Scenarios		
			1	2	3
A. STUDENT FLOW INDICATORS					
% of age-group entering first grade in primary cycle (Total/Girls)	100	207	120	120	120
Girls		231%	120	120	120
% of age-group completing 6 in primary cycle (Total/Girls)	100	75	88	89	90
Girls		79	88	89	90
% repeaters among primary school pupils		15.3	13	12	5
Girls		15	13	12	5
Total students in secondary		346,714	847,284	883,459	1,076,235
Girls		168,786	423,642	441,729	538,118
Total students in higher education		55,213	78,125	79,892	89,283
Girls		17,944	35,156	35,951	40,177
Gross enrolment ratio in secondary education		26%	59%	61%	74%
Girls		25%	59%	61%	74%
B. Service delivery indicators in publicly-financed primary schools					
Pupil-teacher ratio		63	53	47	47
Average annual wage bill per teacher:					
Existing	na	na	na	na	na
Girls	na	na	na	na	na
New	na	na	na	na	na
Girls	na	na	na	na	na
Weighted average of existing & new teachers	3.5	966	2,492	2,719	2,945
Spending on school inputs other than teachers as % of total recurrent spending on primary education	33	61%	50%	47%	45%
Cost to construct, furnish & equip a primary classroom (US\$)	8,000	10,155	12,355	12,355	12,355
C. ADDITIONAL COSTS OF HIV AND AIDS RESPONSE					
Prevention (HIV awareness teaching in school) (USD)		147,754	382,487	445,106	561,883
Teachers		na	na	Na	na
D. ADDITIONAL SPECIFIC COSTS OF ADDRESSING GENDER INEQUALITY					
Demand side interventions (awareness raising, sanitary facilities) (USD)		147,576	1,347,166	1,533,332	2,049,520
E. ACTUAL/PROJECTED RECURRENT COSTS (AS% OF GDP)					
Primary education		1.90%	2.10%	2.50%	2.90%
Post-primary		2.80%	2.90%	3.10%	3.80%
Total		4.70%	4.90%	5.60%	6.70%

Share of primary education in overall spending	42-64	41%	41%	43%	43%
F. PROJECTED CAPITAL COSTS OF CLASSROOM CONSTRUCTION					
Costs of providing water and sanitation (with separate sanitation facilities provided for boys and girls) - (unit cost for block of 12 latrines in USD)		11,847	14,414	14,414	14,414
Aggregate costs in USD		118,208,743	499,672	1,386,109	2,743,391
G. ACTUAL/PROJECTED DOMESTIC RESOURCE MOBILIZATION					
Domestically-generated government revenues as % of GDP	14-18	15	13	13	13
Public recurrent resources for education					
As % of domestically-generated revenues	20	18	18	18	18
As % of GDP	2.8-3.6	4.2	3.3	3.3	3.3
H. SHORTFALL IN DOMESTIC RECURRENT RESOURCES					
For primary education		na	na	na	na
For post-primary education		na	na	na	na
% of shortfall comprising primary school teachers' salaries	10	na	na	na	na
Overall funding gap without external support (USD)		-	157,168,243	223,055,833	345,507,472
Overall funding gap with projected external support (USD)		-	89,655,931	155,543,521	277,995,160

Rwf-USD exchange rate of 590.87 : 1 used (National Bank of Rwanda rate 12Jul10).

Table 4A: Selected quantitative targets in the 3 to 5 year action plan

	Base Year	Projections						
		2009/10	2010/11	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	Cumulative 2009/10- 2014/15
NUMBER OF STUDENTS								
Primary	2,220,047	2,246,246	2,249,555	2,240,915	2,219,446	2,193,352	13,369,561	
Females	1,122,119	1,123,123	1,124,778	1,120,457	1,109,723	1,096,676	6,684,781	
Secondary	346,714	463,558	578,123	648,820	720,303	784,158	3,538,247	
Females	173,357	231,779	289,061	324,410	360,152	392,079	1,769,123	
NUMBER OF NEW TEACHERS								
Primary	3,166	2,939	3,640	3,605	3,700	688	17,738	
Secondary	3,589	3,726	2,690	2,832	2,764	2,552	18,154	
BUDGET FOR EXPENDITURE TEXTBOOKS								
Primary	3,110,324	3,352,683	3,565,928	3,657,319	3,916,259	4,451,064	18,943,253	
Secondary	7,777,199	12,227,732	12,513,751	14,329,717	15,350,246	17,518,236	71,939,682	
NUMBER OF CLASSROOMS TO BE BUILT								
Primary	580	0	1000	696	696	696	3,668	
Secondary	2492	3000	1500	864	746	746	9,348	
NUMBER OF NEW LATRINES								
Total	9,978	6000	5000	3120	2884	2884	19,888	
Female	5,987	3000	2500	1560	1442	1442	9,944	
AGGREGATE RECURRENT BUDGET (USD MILLIONS)								
Primary	94.5	109.1	144.1	169.4	207.9	253.9	978.9	
Secondary	57.9	87.7	126.2	152	182	213.6	819.5	
Higher	56.6	55	60.4	66.7	74	82.4	395.1	
Other	21.4	27.2	31.1	35	39.4	44.9	199	
AGGREGATE CAPITAL BUDGET (USD MILLIONS)								
Primary & Secondary	18.4	39.1	27	13.4	13.9	14.5	126.2	
Higher	3.8	4.5	4.6	5.1	5.7	6.3	30	

Rwf-USD exchange rate of 590.87: 1 used (National Bank of Rwanda rate 12Jul10).

Table 4B: Performance and Disbursement of Externally Funded Projects/Programs (USD)

Development Partner	Focus Area	Disbursements USD		Commitments USD (T=tentative)		
		2008/9	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12	2012/13
DFID	SBS	3.3m	4.07m	12.2m	9.1m T	9.1m T
World Bank	SBS	2.1m	3.6m			
Netherlands	SBS	12.66m	7.85m	7.85m	7.85m	
CIDA	SBS	4m	0.5m			
AfDB	SBS	7.5m	6.0m	4.5m	-	-
Belgium	SBS	3.8m	3.8m			
USAID	Skills/ICT/Literacy	0.9m	3.75m	8.5m	3.5m	2.1m
			0.85m to be programmed		5m T	5m T
AfDB	Primary, Higher Educ (Education III) & Education IV	6.9m	-	1.5	3m	2m
VVOB	School Mgt	480212	666062			
APEFE	TVET	1.38m	1.48m	3.8m		
JICA	Science and Maths (secondary)	0.595m	0.388m			
JICA	TVET	2.626m	2.55m			
JICA	KIST resource centre		4.5m			
UNICEF	Basic educ and gender equality	2.9m	3.9m	4.9m	5.9m T	6.9m T
Netherlands	TVET/GTZ		1.58m	1.58m	1.58m	1.58m
Netherlands	TVET/PSF		1.39m	1.39m	1.39m	1.14m
VSO	Basic Educ	0.375m	0.394m	0.433m	0.437m	0.472m
GTZ	Skills	1.66m	0.46m	1m	1m	1m
SNV	Education	0.365m	0.377m	0.498m	0.506m	

Table 4C: Capacity Constraints and Plans to Overcome Them

Domain	Nature of capacity constraint	Describe the proposed plan to strengthen capacity
Teacher recruitment, support and development		
Pre-service training (Total/females)	Rwanda inherited a 'hybrid' teacher education structure comprising a system of secondary education with teacher training options rather than full professional colleges for 11 Primary TTCs. However two diploma Colleges of Education (CoEs) and the Kigali Institute of Education (KIE) graduate courses provide only teacher education. Most college lecturers are not qualified in education but in specialist subjects, and several lack the requisite teaching experience at appropriate levels. At KIE only about 10% of the graduates end up in teaching, especially those with science and technology backgrounds who can enter private sector or other government departments. Most of the technical instructors in technical and vocational colleges have no pedagogical training at all. The lack of qualified teacher educators and poor utilisation of school-based teaching practice has resulted in teacher education graduates with poor classroom methodology. In primary TTCs the majority of trainees are women, but in CoEs and KIE women form only about a third of the students.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ About 6 of the TTCs will be converted into teacher education institutions only. ▪ The post-graduate degree in teacher education started in 2009 in KIE will be expanded to more lecturers ▪ The Workforce Development Authority (WDA) plans to set up TVET Instructors training at Kicukiro Polytechnic ▪ Salaries and pay scales of graduate teacher will be reviewed to attract teachers in general and science graduates in particular ▪ Students who opt for a teaching degree do not have to repay student loans. A bonding scheme is being considered for such students. ▪ Teaching practice will be prioritised in all teacher education institutions, using both school-based mentoring and better use of schools adjacent to colleges. ▪ The increased access and enrolment targeted for upper secondary, and the girls' education strategy should ensure more girls qualifying to enter CoE's and KIE.
In-service training (Total/females)	There has been no formal Continuous Professional Development structure in Rwanda in the past. INSET has largely taken place on an ad-hoc, crash course basis, often with large numbers of teachers bussed to colleges during school holidays. However, the need to develop English language skills, alongside a number of NGO in-service initiatives has resulted in some useful models of decentralised in-service training. There is a huge need for in-service training in English language use and classroom language in English in particular, but also in subjects such as Science, Maths and ICT. In addition, lack of teacher motivation has been attributed to lack of in-service and upgrading opportunities for teachers. KIE set up a distance programme in 2002 with 10 centres round the country	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ A national CPD structure is now being drafted focusing on a decentralised school-based INSET model, with mentors and trainers at different levels to be implemented in 2010. ▪ The upgrading courses for diploma teachers are being revived and there are plans to introduce and upgrading programme for A2 certificate holders to A1 diploma level. ▪ Japan is assisting TSC to provide training for secondary teachers of Maths and Science, ▪ British Council, USAID and other organisations are assisting TSC to provide support to teachers in acquiring English language proficiency skills and appropriate

	to upgrade Diploma teachers to Graduate level, but it has suffered from lack of funding.	<p>classroom language in English in other subject areas.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Teachers will be expected to acquire an English Proficiency certificate after 4 years of in-service to qualify them for a Teacher's license in future.
Recruitment (Total/females)	<p>Currently the Ministry of Education is struggling to recruit sufficient teachers and retain them at both primary and secondary level. Currently there are 35,748 primary teachers and 14,906 secondary, but over the period of the ESSP another 13,000 primary teachers and 7,500 secondary teachers will be needed. Salaries of primary teachers in particular are quite low at about RWF 30,000 a month (\$55) and although there has been a 10% pay rise in 2009 and most teachers receive an additional RWF 12,500 (about \$20) performance bonus from capitation grants, many teachers are demotivated by pay and lack of career path. Secondary teachers, especially graduates, usually find better paying jobs elsewhere in the public or private sector. The introduction of a teachers' co-operative scheme, Umwalimu SACCO has provided opportunities for primary teachers to save money and take out loans for projects such as houses, cattle rearing and small businesses.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The government proposes as a contribution to national service that graduates should teach for two years before starting their careers. This is part of an overall plan to attract graduates to the teaching profession. Teachers' socio-economic status will be further enhanced by expansion of the teachers' co-operative scheme known as "Umwalimu SACCO" which so far has provided loan to 23,000 teachers to set up small income-generating projects to supplement professional income. TSC plan to develop a career structure that will enable teachers to upgrade from A2 to A1 to A0, alongside additional responsibility allowances for duties such as head of dept. or deputy head Encouraging non-monetary rewards for good teacher performance from communities and government including provision of high-grade cows (already being done), laptops and support for better housing.
Teacher Evaluation	<p>In the past there has been very limited follow-up on teachers' performance once they have left teacher training. However, the Inspectorate has been reformed and decentralised, and now there is much more systematic monitoring and evaluation of teachers in the classroom at primary and secondary levels</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A draft monitoring and evaluation tool for teachers has been developed by the Inspectorate School principals are now being trained in school self-evaluation including classroom teaching.
School Inspection	<p>There are around 30 inspectors in Rwanda, most of whom are now deployed to each of the 5 provinces to cover the 30 districts. They have undergone considerable retraining since 2007, with a special emphasis on classroom observation and mentoring. They are also now involved in training school principals and school management teams in whole school development,</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A major focus for the Inspectorate in 2010 will be monitoring learning achievement and advising on remedial measures in the early grades, especially in the areas of literacy and numeracy.
Managing the impact of	Rwanda has succeeded in reducing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The health agency responsible

HIV/AIDS on the teaching force.	and containing HIV prevalence rates to an overall national average of 3% (5% in urban areas). Therefore HIV/AIDS has not presented a major problem in terms of teacher attrition. However, there has not been a coherent support programme and workplace policy for teachers	for co-ordination of HIV/AIDS information and prevention measures (CNLS) is seconding staff to MINEDUC to work with the TSC on support to teachers living with HIV/AIDS, on HIV/AIDs education and awareness raising programmes for teachers, and development of a teacher workforce HIV/AIDs policy.
Student assessment and curriculum development		
Standardised Testing	<p>Skills in formative and summative evaluation. RNEC sees needs at three different levels</p> <p>a) Schools need help in understanding formative testing, standardised tests and developing tools in classrooms and to use them effectively</p> <p>b) At national level, the existing approach is norm-referenced but skills are needed to move towards criterion-reference testing at school levels. MLA is undertaken by teachers, who lack the skills and RNEC needs the training skills to assist them</p> <p>c) At every level between RNEC and the schools this repertoire of skills is also missing.</p> <p>Monitoring of learning achievement has not taken place at national level let alone links with bodies such as SACMEQ, so important information on literacy levels which could influence remedial teaching measures is missing.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ MINEDUC/RNEC intends to prioritise the development of standardised testing for schools – working on continuous assessment. ▪ RNEC intends further work on ensuring the reliability and validity of individualised school-based testing ▪ Within its own constraints RNEC will lead the process of developing a training of trainers programme, although it has not developed a capacity plan for this yet ▪ RNEC needs support to translate the pool of experts who understand instructional methodologies into ToTs. ▪ UNICEF/UNESCO together with the Inspectorate and RNEC are developing an MLA and reading readiness tool which will target Grade 3 pupils in primary schools initially. Initial surveys are being carried out and the tool will be tested in 2010, before a major national monitoring exercise is carried out in 2011. Both Inspectors and heads/teachers will be trained in using the assessment tool.
Test banks for diagnostic testing	There is a shortage of skills in most aspects, question development, command of the software, question entry, development of question papers, discrimination of skills levels	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ RNEC has an action plan to develop an item bank, based on a needs assessment and staff training is proposed ▪ The item bank training schedule (developed and delivered by Hamlet Computer Group, UK) is intended to familiarise users at all levels with the features of its Item Bank Soft-ware module for storing questions as well as generating question papers.
Data for better management		

Education Management Information System	<p>A tender was awarded to a company for development of an EMIS for Rwanda and capacity building of MINEDUC centralised and decentralised staff and work began in 2008. With 3 successive changes in Ministerial and management teams, the pace of development has been slow, and although an EMIS solution has been developed, it has not yet been able to capture accurately all the annual data, and confidence in the system is weak. In addition, few MINEDUC staff, including Planning Dept. are fully trained in its operations, there is no LAN in place and the servers for each district have yet to be installed. The questionnaires and the solution itself needs adaptation to fit changing data needs of MINEDUC. An independent evaluation carried out in February 2010 resulted in a number of key actions agreed. Data is co-ordinated by the National Institute of Statistics in Rwanda (NISR) and it has been possible for annual data to be prepared and validated, but anomalies still exist.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Training of MINEDUC staff has begun ▪ A consultant is assisting MINEDUC negotiate revision of the EMIS solution to accommodate new data requirements ▪ The schools questionnaire is being revised and updated to include 9 year basic education and TVET ▪ District Education Officers and School Principals will now play a leading role in data collection and validation rather than reliance on hired data collectors alone. ▪ An action plan has been developed to identify steps towards institutionalising the system and identifying future training and capacity needs. It is recognised that the Ministry will need to continue to outsource support on certain areas requiring a high level of computer programming skills for at least the next 2-3 years.
Expenditure tracking	<p>Two fiduciary risk assessments have been carried out of the education sector by DFID in which decentralised financial disbursement and management has been surveyed briefly. A joint MINEDUC/Development Partner Public Expenditure Review was carried out in 2007 which noted key weaknesses at decentralised levels. Towards end of 2009 the Ministry of Finance carried out a special audit of a sample of about 50 schools finding a number of systemic weaknesses in management of capitation grants. The last full PETS was carried out in 2006, and it is planned to carry out a joint MINEDUC, MINECOFIN, and Development Partner PETS in the financial year 2010/11</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ A lighter touch public expenditure review of education sector has been carried out by MINECOFIN in 2010, and publication of findings is expected shortly ▪ PETS will be carried out every 2/3 years by MINECOFIN in sample schools on capitation grant expenditure ▪ School Principals and school bursars are continuing to be trained in financial management, reporting and monitoring. ▪ Parent Teacher Committees (PTCs) will be trained at schools to be able to monitor and sign off on capitation grants
Systems for gender - disaggregated data collection and analysis	<p>Although the development of the EMIS system has been slow, it is able to provide gender-disaggregated data for most key performance indicators at all levels of the education system. The Rwanda National Exams Council is also able to provide important gender-disaggregated data on performance</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The Monitoring of Learning Achievement planned for Grade 3 will be gender-disaggregated ▪ It is planned to provide a better breakdown of regional and district variations in gender-disaggregated data as part of the planned equity and inclusion study.
Procurement/Contracting Systems		
Distribution of instructional materials	<p>Since 2008 there have been a series of textbook reforms implemented, including development of a minimum</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Decentralised textbook selection is being implemented in 2010 with textbook selection

	profile, training of evaluators and monitors, and encouragement of private sector participation. Distribution of school books and materials has been improved but numbers of books in different subjects in schools remain uneven especially at secondary schools.	committees being set up in all schools who will receive training in September 2010 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Training of schools administrators in procurement procedures will become part of school management training
School construction	Infrastructure guidelines including environment-friendly recommendations are now published, and improved monitoring of builders and contractors at district level is taking place. The capacity of construction planning both at National and District level will need to be improved in light of the likely impact of 9YBE on upper secondary enrolment. A key role in the recent building of 3,086 classrooms in 5 months was played by communities supported by police, army and prisons, However, the capacity of the population to continue to support construction may be reduced in future.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Training of MINEDUC construction unit in construction planning will be carried out Secondary school construction and provision will be expanded through public and private partnerships including faith groups and international NGOs. Already more than half of upper secondary schools are privately run. <p style="text-align: center;">“</p>
Promotion of schooling among target populations		
School mapping to improve accessibility of schools	The EMIS programme has made progress in capturing a good number of the schools in each district on maps, but is not yet complete. There is also a general GIS survey being developed to capture all key information on structures in health, education, water and sanitation, roads etc.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> MINEDUC is planning to work with the Geographic Information System being developed to ensure integration of key information and cross-checking of accuracy of data.
School design (including water, sanitation...)	Comprehensive school infrastructure guidelines have been developed including environmentally-friendly practices, and these have to be followed in all sectors and districts in any new construction projects.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Costs of construction, which are quite high because of the need to import cement, wood etc, are being addressed by alternative construction materials and processes.
Design of demand-side financing interventions (including children orphaned by AIDS and other causes)	It is recognised that some additional financing will be needed to cater for special needs groups and some orphans not catered for by free basic education.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> MINEDUC intends to co-ordinate bursaries, and increase capitation grants to schools to cater for any marginalised groups; and especially to focus on community and local NGO support to child-headed households

Administration and Management		
National-level budgeting and financial management	The budget preparation and negotiations are well managed by Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning and MINEDUC, and development partners also have opportunities as part of the March ‘forward looking’ joint sector review to comment on or ask questions about the draft budget for next financial year. DFID and other partners have conducted fiduciary risk assessments for the sector and the macro level public expenditure and financial accountability assessment (PEFA) which is a multi-donor tool and takes place every 3 years review: All these assessments indicate strong national budgeting and financial management systems. Auditor General’s reports do highlight clearly the weaknesses and strengths of sectors, although need to be clearer on the balance between these..	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ PFM strategy has been developed for Rwanda (addressing capacity in budgeting, procurement accounting and auditing) ▪ The next PEFA will be in 2011 Public sector capacity secretariat is set up for capacity building across all public sectors over next 5 years
Sub-national government administration	Fiduciary risk assessments and MINECOFIN’s own special audits have shown that accountability and knowledge of financial management – budgeting, disbursement, reporting and monitoring are weakest at decentralised levels and institutions at district level. There is inconsistency in the way that schools manage capitation grants, and this is compounded by the limited internal audit capacity at district level. Most of the problems are systemic in terms of mismanagement or misapplication of correct procedures, and major fraud or corruption is not an issue. However, the financial management capacity at districts and schools remains a cause for concern and needs to be addressed both by MINECOFIN, MINEDUC and District Administrations.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ MINECOFIN will carry out a public expenditure tracking survey in 2010/11 ▪ MINECOFIN and MINEDUC will ensure that all district and school managers receive thorough training in financial management.. ▪ Additional audit and accounting capacity will be provided at district level. ▪ Parent Teacher Committees and School Boards will be trained to monitor and account for capitation grants and other disbursements to schools. ▪ Local Authorities at all level will be more closely involved in monitoring expenditure ▪ PFM strategy will help to improve capacity in budgeting, procurement accounting and auditing) at all levels. ▪ The newly formed NGO Co-ordination Platform can help to co-ordinate efforts to empower communities to demand accountability from school managers
Capacity and structures for mainstreaming gender	There are strong political and social structures for mainstreaming gender nationally and to a certain extent ,at decentralised levels but adolescent girls, especially in rural areas, tend to lose out in terms of empowerment and opportunities. There is a Girls Education Policy and costed strategy in	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Public sector capacity secretariat is set up for capacity building across all public sectors over next 5 years ▪ Inspection of gender mainstreaming at different levels will be prioritised ▪ Male leaders at district and

	place, a Girls Education desk in MINEDUC, but the impact at more grass-roots levels is varied despite the efforts of groups such as FAWE and partners such as UNICEF. In addition, the issue of unemployed or underemployed young men is a concern to government because of the dangers of crime and unrest.	<p>lower levels will be sensitized to champion gender issues, especially participation of girls at higher levels of education</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Gender-budgeting is being introduced into sectors for the first time this year, but will need further guidance to show impact.
Legal/Institutional Framework		
Enactment of laws to facilitate EFA FTI implementation	The policy of free primary education and now free 9 year basic education was enshrined in the 2003 Education Sector Policy approved by government and due to updated in 2010.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Norms and standards have been developed by Inspectorate for operation of pre-primary, primary and secondary schools Guidelines have now been developed governing all school infrastructure
Removal of legalism pediments to primary education	The right of every child to primary education has been further enhanced in the Government of Rwanda's Vision 2020 and EDPRS 2008-2012. The 9 year basic education policy, approved by government, has been fast-tracked to improve primary completion and transition rates.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Barriers to full 9 year basic education have been further removed by making the last 3 years of Basic Education free, removing the Primary Leaving Examination as a selection tool (it is now an assessment tool only), and expanding infrastructure to accommodate more children.
Enactment of laws on discrimination and equal opportunities (gender, HIV etc.)	There are a number of laws related to sexual discrimination and harassment. In addition, several education policies address access to education for girls, orphans and children with special needs.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Girls Education Policy and Costed Strategy addresses particularly girls in post-basic education, including access to higher education. The 'child-friendly' schools approach piloted by UNICEF is now being scale up across the country to ensure equity and inclusion throughout the system.
School-level capacity		
School head leadership	Until recently, heads and principals of schools did not receive an increment in salary for undertaking this role. In addition, few heads were trained in the various skills of staff management, timetabling, class observation, community mobilisation, communication skills, and financial management. However in both cases there have been improvements, although no specific school leadership institution has been developed for sustainable staff development.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> In 2009 head teachers received increments as part of their roles and responsibilities. Regular training of heads, bursars and other key teachers has been undertaken by Inspectorate with support from various NGOs working at district level. There are plans to set up a more permanent school leadership training facility, probably at Kigali Institute of Education Simple manuals on planning, managing and reporting on the use of capitation grants will be prepared in Kinyarwanda and English

<p>Parent-Teacher Associations/Committees</p>	<p>Over the period of the last ESSP, many schools have developed PTAs or PTCs as they are now generally called. There is considerable variation in how effective these PTCs are in terms of participation in school planning, management and performance. In addition, PTCs and school board have not always undertaken monitoring of school finances, particularly capitation grants. Training and awareness raising has not always been available to strengthen this accountability role.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ All schools are now required to develop PTCs. ▪ A manual for PTCs has been developed and will be sent to all primary/basic and upper secondary schools ▪ PTCs are now being trained to participate in whole school development planning and in monitoring expenditure of capitation grants..
---	---	--

Table 5: Consultation with Stakeholders

Stakeholders	Date (s) of past or planned consultation	Format/duration of consultation	Comment on quality of consultation and any issues raised
Government			
Legislature Ministry of Finance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Joint Budget Reviews for Ministers, PS and Parliamentarians in October 2009 and April 2010 • Joint Annual Sector Reviews held in October 2009 and April 2010 • National workshop on the Education Sector Strategic Plan 28th August 2009 • FTI Appraisal Workshop 29th/30th June 2010 	The review format is clearly laid out in ToRs. They last for one day, and include presentations by GoR on sector performance and budget execution and the social cluster as a whole (education, health, water and sanitation, youth, social protection) to education officials, development partners and NGOs. Then follows discussion of key sectoral challenges and action plans for the next 12 month. The ESSP draft has been discussed and appraised in both reviews.	Ministry of Finance lays down clear guidelines for sectoral working groups, joint reviews, attends and participates in all sector reviews including education. They have provided valuable input on budget execution, GoR priorities and on the draft ESSP itself. Ministers lead the sector reviews, while Parliamentarians are involved in the overall joint budget review. Ministry of Finance chairs the joint budget reviews, and has also contributed valuable inputs to the ESSP financing framework, the implementation plan and to the FTI Appraisal workshop.
Ministry of Gender /Women's affairs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Development of Girls Education Strategy and Costed plan 2009/2010 • Attendance at National Workshop on ESSP 28th August 2009 	There was a Task Force mandated to produce the strategy, based on the Girls' Education Policy, led by MINEDUC Gender Unit. It also involved key national NGOs such as FAWE and Imbuto Foundation, Office of the President and development partners. It took about 6 months to finalise the strategy.	The Girls' Education Strategy has been fully incorporated in the plan. In fact at the last joint sector review in April, there was a very high-level session on adolescent girls' access and performance led by the Minister himself and various Directors. Subsequently some key strategies addressing menstruation issues were incorporated into the ESSP.
Other line Ministries	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Joint Budget Reviews in October 2009 and April 2010 • National ESSP Consultative Workshop, 28th August 2009 • ESSP final drafting workshop , May 2010 	Education falls under the Social Cluster which emphasizes the linkages with health, social protection, youth, water and sanitation. In particular reproductive health, HIV/AIDS and nutrition are key cross-cutting issues, as are sanitation facilities. The Joint Budget Review meeting on social cluster (one day) gave an opportunity for all these sectors to contribute to the emerging plan.	CNLS, the Health ministry unit on HIV/AIDS sent two specialists to help develop the HIV/Aids content in the sector plan and key indicators, and are seconding staff to MINEDUC to assist with implementation. MINEDUC Infrastructure unit has been helped in developing guidelines on water and sanitation, and Ministry of Local Government has contributed important sections on social

			protection initiatives targeting education access.
Local Government	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 5 Provincial Consultation Workshops 10th – 12th August 2009 • National Implementation Framework Workshop 10th-12th June 2009 	Each of the Provincial Workshops lasted one day, and involved representatives of all 5/6 districts in each province including Mayors, councillors, district education officials, principals, teachers, parents and school children. MINEDUC presented some draft priorities and then requested views, feedback, concerns and proposals to build on the draft framework. DEOs were involved in the National Implementation Framework Workshop (see below)	Participation was excellent with an average attendance of 60 in each provincial, and effective division of plenary and group sessions. Working in 3 to 4 languages English, French, Kinyarwanda, Kiswahili) ensured a good cross-section of views, opinions and practical contributions to future design of the plan. Major issues included training teachers in English language, better distribution of books and materials, teacher motivation, school management, and role of Parent Teacher Committees.
Civil Society			
Civic and/or indigenous groups	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Provincial Consultation Workshops 10th-12th June 2009 ▪ National ESSP Workshop 28th August 2009 	Each of the Provincial Workshops lasted one day, and involved representatives of all 5/6 districts in each province. Some key civic leaders and groups also made presentations to the national workshop	The advantage of this consultative process was in both raising awareness about a new generation sector plan, and making leaders realise their responsibilities in implementing it. The main item of concern was the quality of education (teachers, textbooks, infrastructure) and the need for support in English language.
Local NGOs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Provincial Consultation Workshops 10th-12th June 2009 ▪ National ESSP Workshop 28th August 2009 ▪ FTI Appraisal Workshop 29th/30th June 2010 	Each of the Provincial Workshops lasted one day, and involved representatives of all 5/6 districts in each province. In particular leaders of faith groups were well represented as many of them manage a number of schools in Rwanda, and there were high-level inputs at the National Workshop and the FTI Appraisal workshops	Faith groups and other local NGOs have participated strongly and often been the most vocal on issues such as language of instruction, overall quality of education, financing of secondary education, roles of state/religious institutions and school management issues.
Key women's organisations/networks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ National ESSP Consultative Workshop 28th August 2009 ▪ FTI Appraisal Workshop 29th/30th 	Both were national level workshops that adopted a mixture of plenary, group working sessions, feedback and development of recommendations/frameworks	FAWE and Imbutu Foundation in particular contributed to key objectives and highlighted the lack of broader gender-based approaches and gender-based budgeting within the sector.

	June 2010		
Stakeholders			
Principals Teachers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Provincial Consultation Workshops held between 10th-12th June 2009 ▪ National ESSP Consultative Workshop 28th August 2009 	Both were national and provincial level workshops adopted a mixture of plenary, group working sessions, feedback and development of recommendations/ frameworks. Most workshops lasted one day.	Good representation from principals of primary and secondary schools, and private public institutions, primary and secondary teachers also represented. Issues raised included pay, conditions, working hours, career development and housing.
Administrators/Inspectors	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Provincial Consultation Workshops held between 10th-12th June 2009 ▪ National Implementation Framework Workshop 10th-12th June 2010 	The National Implementation Framework (NIF) workshop was designed to be based on the 7 core objectives of the Strategic Plan, and a mixture of initial presentation and groups based around the 7 objectives produced draft implementation frameworks by end of 3 days. All 30 District Education officers and several inspectors were involved	The involvement and participation of the District Education Officers and inspectors was particularly valuable. Not only did it provide a valuable learning curve on developing activities, but it meant that DEOs now fully understood the role they would play in delivery of the ESSP through the NIF which is meant to bridge the gap between ESSP and the Annual Operational Plans and Budgets.
Parents/Students/Local Community	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Provincial Consultation Workshops held between 10th-12th June 2009 ▪ National ESSP Consultative Workshop 28th August 2010 	One day workshop involving plenary and group sessions and consolidated recommendations	There was quite good participation by pupils and parent teacher committees in the provincial workshops. In particular rural girls felt in some cases, that they were disadvantaged in terms of facilities and access to knowledge and quality teaching staff compared to their urban counterparts
Bilateral agencies			
DFID, Belgium Technical Co-operation, Netherlands, Canada, USAID, GTZ, JICA,	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ MINEDUC ESSP Retreat, Gicumbi, 21st-23rd July 2009 ▪ Provincial Consultation Workshops held between 10th-12th June 2009 ▪ National ESSP Consultative Workshop 28th August 2009 ▪ MINEDUC ESSP drafting workshops Kigali February/March 2010 ▪ Final MINEDUC ESSP Drafting 	The retreats were actual design and drafting workshops to develop the ESSP, the NIF and the Monitoring and Evaluation Framework. Others were one day consultative workshops involving plenary sessions and group work.	DFID has been involved throughout the first workshop and subsequent consultation and drafting stages. At different stages, other partners e.g. GTZ, Belgium, USAID, Netherlands have contributed to drafting, been involved in the consultation workshops and especially the Appraisal workshop. ESSP. Drafts have also been circulated by e-mail for comments so there have been excellent opportunities at stages for involvement. DFID also

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Retreat, Gashora 4th-5th May 2010 ▪ National Implementation Framework Workshop 10th-12th June 2010 ▪ FTI Appraisal Workshop 29th/30th June 2010 		<p>contributed to a Post-Basic Education Costs and Financing study to inform the ESSP.</p>
Multilateral agencies			
<p>UNICEF, World Bank, AfDB</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ MINEDUC ESSP Retreat, Gicumbi, 21st-23rd July 2009 ▪ Provincial Consultation Workshops held between 10th-12th June 2009 ▪ National ESSP Consultative Workshop 28th August 2009 ▪ MINEDUC ESSP drafting workshops Kigali February/March 2010 ▪ Final MINEDUC ESSP Drafting Retreat, Gashora 4th-5th May 2010 ▪ National Implementation Framework Workshop 10th-12th June 2010 ▪ FTI Appraisal Workshop 29th/30th June 2010 	<p>The retreats were actual design and drafting workshops to develop the ESSP, the NIF and the Monitoring and Evaluation Framework. Others were one day consultative workshops involving plenary sessions and group work.</p>	<p>UNICEF was actively involved throughout the whole process, and also hosted smaller drafting workshops twice in 2010. World Bank contributed by e-mail extensively, and also through the Country Status Report to inform the ESSP. Both GTZ and World Bank also contributed a study on the external efficiency of post-basic education that informed the ESSP.</p>
International NGOs			
<p>SNV, VSO, Care International, Concern, Action Aid, VVOB, ADRA, Plan International, Save the Children</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Provincial Consultation Workshops held between 10th-12th June 2009 ▪ National ESSP Consultative Workshop 28th August 2009 ▪ FTI Appraisal Workshop 29th/30th June 2010 	<p>Mainly one day consultative workshops where some NGOs also gave presentations on areas such as inclusion and accountability.</p>	<p>Under the newly formed NGO Co-ordination Platform there has been very active engagement by a number of international NGOs in the sector, particularly on the development of school level accountability systems such as Parent Teacher Committees in the ESSP. They have also provided valuable feedback on various drafts of the ESSP, as well as good representation at the FTI Appraisal workshop.</p>

Table 6: Summary of Technical Appraisal

Domain of evaluation	Summary comment	Score
<p>1. Knowledge base underpinning the sector plan</p> <p>What is its quality, judging from the available documentation?</p> <p>What critical gaps in the data and analysis remain?</p>	<p>Comprehensive consultation at every level underpins a thorough and systematic ESSP, linked to Vision 2020, EDPRS and MDGs. The ESSP is a high quality , sophisticated document located in a mission for the future, based upon realities</p> <p>Several major studies e.g. on Teacher Motivation, Post Basic education financing options, text book reform and the WB CSR</p> <p>Data analysis weak.</p> <p>The EMIS still under performing, leaving gaps in the data stream from schools upwards- though resolutions are being made to this.</p> <p>Limited empirical research to generate evidence-based planning, especially at decentralized levels</p>	<p>3.5</p> <p>2</p>
<p>2. Content of the sector plan in terms of strategic long-term direction</p> <p>To what extent is it fiscally viable?</p> <p>How sound are the tradeoffs it makes in coverage & service delivery?</p>	<p>Viable with continued domestic resourcing, external support and internal resource mobilization.</p> <p>GoR priority within the EDPRS ensures commitment to key policies e.g. 9YBE, TVET, IST, ICT</p> <p>Projected recurrent and capital costs are realistic and derive from a sophisticated cost and financing simulation model</p> <p>Sound recognition of new trade-offs implied in focus on quality simultaneous with continued expansion especially 9YBE and PBE</p> <p>Trade-offs HE v PBE v BE are squarely faced</p>	<p>3</p> <p>3</p>
<p>3. Content of the short-term action plan</p> <p>Are budget allocations in the MTEF consistent with the plan's ambition?</p> <p>How feasible are the plans for scaling up?</p> <p>How ready is the plan for implementation?</p> <p>How well will the most important capacity constraints be addressed?</p>	<p>The budget allocations in the MTEF are consistent with the plan's ambitions. Policy reforms provide a clear sense of direction.</p> <p>Yes, feasible, depending on filling the financing gap and on facing key challenges e.g. English Medium Policy, PBE and capacity, Teacher recruitment. Massive programmes of school infrastructure, based on community mobilization , and the reform of the Text book policy create a good platform for going to increased scale</p> <p>Based on earlier ESSP experiences, the ESSP is ready (dependent on fiancé) and is already internalized as part of a functioning system of education at all levels and across all domains.</p> <p>The intensive system wide consultation has generated a state of readiness and high expectation to succeed.</p> <p>Significant impetus has already occurred to address the qualitative capacity challenges, though numbers remain a concern</p> <p>The analysis highlights constraints and responses in the following key areas:</p> <p>Teacher recruitment, support and development (Pre-service and In-service); Student Assessment and Curriculum Development; Data for better Management; Procurement and Contracting; Administration and</p>	<p>3</p> <p>2.5</p> <p>3.5</p> <p>2.0</p>

	Management; Legal and Institutional framework; School Level and PTCs	
4. Consultation with stakeholders		
How strongly has the plan been endorsed by other parts of government, esp. the Ministry of Finance?	A major strength of the process has been its comprehensive level of discussion with MINECOFIN especially, which fully endorses the ESSP. All units of REB have been totally supportive. So have others e.g. WDA, NCHE, etc)	3.5
How acceptable is the plan to key stakeholders in the education system?	Totally. There has been widespread consultation at all levels - down the decentralized chain and with stakeholders in all major institutions of the system of education and training.	4
How acceptable is the plan to members of civil society?	As above. The newly established NGO Forum has been consulted on many occasions and is an active protagonist in the ESSP (both collectively and as a result of individual action)	4
How strongly has the plan been endorsed by the donor community?	As above. DPs and JRES processes fully committed to the success of the ESSP – and will hope-fully offer additional financial support. A range of formal mechanisms, meetings, networks and two-way interactions with GoR and MINEDUC has ensured active DP participation throughout the process. Acceptance of SWAP and SBS signals DP commitment.	4
Overall Appraisal	After a long and refined process of consultation and planning, the ESSP is ready for takeoff. The ESSP is not only consistent in addressing key policy and strategic challenges in the sector. It is a faithful mirror of the sector. It is highly ambitious and thus consistent with GoR aspirations. Nevertheless, it has in-built risk identification, which brings an important balance into its vision.	3

a/ Using a scoring system (e.g. from 1 – very poor– to 4 –very good) has the virtue of collapsing a large amount of information into a single number. While this makes it easier to gauge where the country comes out, the scores are obviously not intended to be used mechanically.