Introductory section
This section includes the executive summary of the report, an introduction outlining the objectives and methodology of the 2015 Joint Review of the Education Sector and a general overview of the education sector in Somaliland.

Executive summary
During the year 2014 the Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MOEHE) made encouraging progress overall. Enrolment all round increased especially for girls’ education and at the secondary level. The gender gap is narrowing. There were more trained teachers, additional schools and a great number of newly constructed and rehabilitated classrooms with good furniture. Sool and Sanaag
Regions were covered in school construction whereas in the past they had been hard to reach due to insecurity. Children and adults with disabilities or special needs (705 male, 645 female) were provided with education, literacy or skills training.

The total MOEHE budget increased from 53 billion shillings (about 9 million dollars) in 2013 to 75 billion shillings (12 million dollars) in 2014. The education budget as a percentage of the total government budget increased from 7% to 8%. An additional 482 primary teachers were paid through the Global Partnership for Education (GPE) and other partners. All primary headteachers (837) were paid incentives of $25 per month in recognition of their added responsibilities.

The first ever Joint Review of the Education Sector was held under strong MOEHE leadership. The first ever annual action plan was developed through which the current JRES is being assessed. The Education Officers (formerly trainees to the Technical Advisers) have now all been integrated as MOEHE staff and have played key roles in preparing for this Joint Review of the Education Sector (JRES). They are a valuable resource for the MOEHE in future. The education partners are also key resources for the MOEHE. There is excellent coordination with all partners through 6-monthly joint steering committees and monthly Education Sector Committee (ESC) meetings.

Quality is still a concern, however, as highlighted in the 2014 JRES. As a result of the Free Primary Education (FPE) policy many teachers are unhappy because their overall income has decreased as the public primary schools are no longer allowed to collect fees. FPE also means that many schools have no money to pay for essential running costs such as provision of water or teacher stationery. Moreover, headteachers have less leverage over the teachers whose salaries now come directly from the government. There is also a perception among some communities that primary education is free by legal statute and hence no need for their contribution.

Access and quality are continuing concerns for rural areas and remote pastoralist communities. In addition, Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) and Higher Education are subsectors which particularly require more support and funding.

For the way ahead, it is recommended that the FPE policy is reviewed so that the challenges mentioned above can be addressed. In addition, more support should be given to rural areas so that access to, and quality of, education can increase in those areas. It is also recommended that more assistance should be given to the TVET and Higher Education subsectors from the Ministry, education partners and donors.

Introduction
This report is written for the 2015 Joint Review of the Education Sector (JRES) detailing the performance of the education sector in improving access to quality education in Somaliland in 2014. It is the second such review to take place, following the first one which was held in February 2014. It is, however, the first JRES to review against an annual action plan, the 2014 Education Annual Action Plan which resulted from the 2014 JRES.

The purpose of this assignment is to assess progress against the Education Action Plan 2014 and Aide Memoire 2014 which ultimately link with the implementation of the 2012–2016 Education Sector Strategic Plan (ESSP). The assessment informs a JRES workshop (24-25 March) which provides an opportunity for the MOEHE and partners to convene and jointly analyze the sector. The results then feed into the development of an Education Action Plan 2015 and new Aide Memoire.

The method for compiling this synthesis report follows a procedure similar to the first JRES, but incorporating lessons learned where appropriate. Inputs were received from strategic partners in Nairobi before the consultant came to Hargeisa. (This was volunteered by the consultant as it was not included in his terms of reference.) Inside Somaliland the consultant met various stakeholders including MOEHE officials and Non-Governmental Organisation (NGO) partners and visited a

1 Consultant: Timothy Brown.
number of schools and educational institutions. The lists of stakeholders met and institutions visited are given in Appendices 1 & 2. A list of references used in the desk study is given in Appendix 3. The whole process was guided by a JRES task force (inclusive of Ministry officials and education partners) set up by MOEHE before the arrival of the consultant. The fact that the task force was already well functioning is indicative of the Ministry’s much strengthened capacity.

It was noted that the schools visited during the first JRES were mostly public schools only in the main towns. To ensure a more diverse set of perspectives this time and with the help of the task force, the consultant decided to choose a different set of schools and include some private ones as well which might offer some insights into quality education. The consultant also visited some schools outside the main towns which were along the road. The school visits were unannounced to ensure that the consultant saw the “real picture”. Regrettably, time was not enough to visit schools far from the main road or in remote pastoralist areas. The consultant recommends that in future reviews more time is added to reach these places, which presumably are the most under-served and needy areas.

Alongside the visits and meetings, the consultant followed up with all development partners for their results and inputs into the 2014 “updated” master action plan. The consultant consolidated all their feedback into one large excel sheet (Appendix 5) which forms the basis of the review from which both the Ministry and consultant could draw information and write their reports and presentations. One improvement was made to the master plan this year by adding a column for the “region of intervention” as recommended at last year’s Nairobi ESC. A blank template for the 2015 action plans was sent out to partners to fill and send back for consolidation by the consultant after the JRES meeting. The 2015 Master Education Action Plan thereby obtained is found in Appendix 6.

The format of this report is as follows. After this introduction, there is an overview of the education sector followed by the findings from the consultant’s field visits. Next follows some analyses of the education sector in comparison with the ESSP, the 2013/2104 EMIS report and the 2014 Aide Mémoire. The report ends with the consultant’s overall findings and recommendations. The 2015 Aide Mémoire, which is a summary of the key issues and recommendations discussed at the JRES meeting (24-25 March) is given in Appendix 4.

Overview of the Somaliland education sector in 2014

In 2014, the action plan was divided into 6 sub-sectors: primary education/ early childhood education; non-formal education/ special needs education; secondary education; technical and vocational education and training; higher education; and education management & Quality Assurance (QA). There were about 20 partners including the MOEHE and their activities were distributed among the subsectors as follows:
The planned budget for 2014 for the various sub-sectors was as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education sub-sector</th>
<th>Planned budget 2014 (in US $)</th>
<th>Percentage of total budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>20407000</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NFE</td>
<td>3007000</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>4495000</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TVET</td>
<td>1516000</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Higher</td>
<td>1161000</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management &amp; QA</td>
<td>3619000</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>34,205,000</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
It can be seen from the above that the lion’s share of the budget and activities go to primary education (14 partners) followed by secondary education. TVET and Higher Education only got 4% and 3% of the education budget respectively. Note that only the planned budget was considered. The consultant was unable to obtain information on the actual budget for 2014. His request to partners for budget shortfalls (under the “challenges” column) was unanswered.

Field visits
This section summarises the findings of the consultant during his field visits. The consultant visited both public and private institutions at each of the levels primary, secondary and tertiary.

Public primary schools
Many principals of primary, secondary and tertiary institutions told the consultant that the quality of primary education in public schools had decreased since the introduction of Free Primary Education. One reason given was that teachers’ total income had generally decreased after FPE thus lowering their morale. Moreover, headteachers now have less control over the teachers since heads no longer pay any money to the teachers. The government pays the whole salary which is the same amount to all teachers irrespective of their workload.
as water supply, stationery and furniture repair. Consequently the environment has deteriorated in some schools e.g. toilets not functional, shortage of chairs and no paint to brighten classrooms. Some devoted teachers pay out of their own pockets to make phone calls for the school or buy notebooks for lesson preparation. Many qualified teachers have moved to private schools and are replaced by unqualified ones leading to a further reduction in quality. The qualified teachers are followed by the children because many parents are prepared to pay for private school to ensure their children receive quality education. Some communities have the perception that primary education is now completely free by law, so there is no need for their contribution or it is not allowed.

2 The enrolment in private primary schools has been steadily increasing over the last few years.

---

Headteacher quotes:

- “We have no first aid kit at the school but children often fall sick. I have to call their parents on my own phone using my money when a child becomes ill.”
- “Before FPE, the schools had money and the headteachers could control their teachers. There was competition among the schools trying to get more students and hence more money to improve quality.”
- “In 2010/11 before FPE we had a total enrolment of 1,228 students. Now, the enrolment has dropped to 742 students.”
- “The lack of qualified teachers is causing conflict between the untrained teachers and pupils.”
- “After FPE, the quality of secondary school entrants has been low especially in English, mathematics and science. We have to assign extra classes in the afternoon to enable Form 1 students to catch up.”

Recommendation:

- There should be a thorough review of the Free Primary Education system in Somaliland detailing the effects (among others) on the quality of education provided, the present situation of the schools and the attitudes of the teachers and parents. The flaws in the system should be identified, analysed and addressed.
Schools need running costs to pay for teacher stationery, chalk and other materials such as paint to enhance the quality of education provided.

Rural primary schools
These schools often have additional problems. They generally have small classes requiring multi-grade teaching and many do not reach grade 8. One school the consultant visited only had grades 1 to 4 while another school was missing grades 3, 5, 7 and 8. This means that pupils are likely to drop out of school after they reach the highest grade unless their parents can afford to send them to a school in town for continuing their education. Many headteachers and teachers in rural schools are underqualified which is exacerbated by teacher turnover and transfer. Often there are no female teachers in rural schools although the consultant was pleased to see evidence of a good female headteacher in one school who was checking and stamping teachers’ lesson plans.

Recommendation:

• MOE should establish a new Department for Rural Schools to focus on the disparities in rural areas (in the same way that the Department of Gender was set up to successfully concentrate on gender disparities.) The new department would focus on improving quality and getting good teachers into rural schools and paying them higher incentives, as has been done in other countries (GPE).

Public secondary and private schools
The public secondary schools and private schools (both primary and secondary) that the consultant visited were doing well. The previous photograph with neatly painted walls was an example of a good public secondary school visited.
These schools all charge fees and they have enough funds to pay all teachers and cover the school running costs. As the headteacher pays the teachers himself, he can easily control them. Discipline in these schools is good, registers are strictly kept and monitored and lesson preparation books are checked and stamped. When children miss class, the school follows up with the parents sometimes by phone.

“Students are registered twice a day, once during the first period and the second time during the last period. If a student is missing, I telephone the parents.”  Headteacher of private school

Sadly, such accountability was missing in many of the public primary schools the consultant visited.

“The last time we received a register was three years ago. Only 3 or 4 teachers use registers in this school.”  Headteacher of public primary school

Non-formal Education (NFE)
The consultant visited one urban NFE institution. It was managed by female staff and all students were female. There were two types of courses. One course was basic literacy and numeracy for 14-20 year-olds. The other course was for older women to learn skills such as beautification. The centre staff stressed the importance of girls’ education since educated women can look after their families better in terms of nutrition, health and education.

Good practice:

• Some centres use primary school buildings in the afternoons after normal school has closed.

• After four years at the centre some young girls join grade 5 at primary school.

• The older women take two years to get a certificate after which some secure jobs while others create their own businesses or even join NGOs

• The centre visited has a shop for selling items as an income generating activity

Challenges:

• Many girls come from rural areas to do household chores in town

• There is a need for awareness campaigns to send girls to school equally

• Although school is free, some girls cannot afford the clothes or notebooks required

Recommendation:

• In view of the out of school youth and low level of literacy in this country, MOEHE should consider a programme that was successful in Somaliland a few decades ago. Secondary school leavers were sent to the rural areas as volunteers with small incentives to teach literacy to the villagers. This would give youth a job, self-esteem and valuable experience while keeping them out of trouble and helping to solve the literacy problem of the country especially in the rural areas.
Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET)
The consultant visited 3 institutions. Unfortunately, the government one in Burao was closed down due to lack of funding in spite of a massive rehabilitation programme by the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) a few years ago. The other two institutions were functioning well and run by NGOs, mostly with level 1 courses.

![Disabled boy participating in a carpentry course](image)

**Good practice:**
- One centre had a disabled student doing carpentry, and last year there were 2
- The centres do surveys to identify marketable skills
- They have good connections with local businesses
- Majority of graduates (80%) get jobs, some can even earn while training
- In Somaliland 1,013 people overall were trained in levels 2 & 3 in 2014

**Challenges:**
- Regional inequity, most centres are in Hargeisa
- Gender inequity, one centre had stopped giving courses to girls this year
- Small capacity in terms of numbers of students centres can accommodate
- Many more candidates apply than can be selected showing a great unmet demand
- Majority of trainers are not qualified
- Stigma against some trades e.g. fishing, carpentry and masonry

---

3 This institution could be useful for post-secondary TVET courses to provide employable skills.
4 Clearly the massive underutilized Burao Technical Institute could be put to good use.
5 In future, the proposed National Teacher Training Institute could train TVET trainers.
Recommendation:

- TVET requires more support and funding, especially for girl-friendly courses, and the training should be geared to the job market or self-employment. There are many jobless out-of-school youth who could benefit from such training.

Higher Education

The consultant visited 4 universities: 2 public, 1 private and 1 community. The Universities are thriving in Somaliland (total number around 27), with increasing enrolment. The National Commission for Higher Education (NCHE) stopped new applications for universities and courses in 2014 to give it enough time to assess the existing universities and courses.

“\textit{We started from zero but enrolment and quality are increasing each year. We are not yet as good as Ethiopian or Kenyan universities but we will get there.}” Chancellor of private university

Good practice:

- Courses are generally geared to look after the countries’ natural resources (e.g. at Berbera Maritime and Fisheries Academy)
- Universities do their own research on the demands and needs of the population
- Good teachers are attracted back from the diaspora
- There is a new school of social work at one university which was opened to focus on much needed community work, volunteerism and the poor
- Quality assurance is achieved by bringing in external advisers from Ethiopia
- Scholarships are awarded each year to poor students and meritorious ones

Challenges:

- Education has become the least popular course at universities because teacher salaries are low nowadays and the profession has therefore lost its esteem
- There is a shortage of funding for higher education, every university must start from zero
- More support needed for women to access higher education
- Getting teachers who are qualified
- Scarcity of higher-level vocational training institutions and courses in Somaliland
- Deficiency of HR capacity at the Higher Education Directorate
- Lack of assessment of minimum university standards, which is now part of the Higher Education 2015 work plan
- Lack of career guidance workshops in secondary schools, which are to be initiated in 2015

Assessment of the Education Sector

This section assesses the overall performance of the education sector in 2014 using the 2012-2016 Education Sector Strategic Plan (ESSP), the 2014 Education Action Plan, the 2014 Aide Mémoire and the Education Management Information System (EMIS) data.

Overall achievements of the Ministry of Education & Higher Education

The Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MOEHE) was highly successful in 2014 with the continuing support from its education partners. The main achievements were as follows:
Enrolment all round has increased especially for girls. Secondary education, in particular, has almost doubled. The gender gap has narrowed. There are more trained teachers, more schools and a great number of newly constructed and rehabilitated classrooms with good furniture. Sool and Sanaag Regions have now been reached in school construction whereas in the past they had been somewhat neglected due to insecurity.

Total MOEHE budget increased from 53 billion shillings (about 9 million dollars) in 2013 to 75 billion shillings (12 million dollars) in 2014. This represents a 35% increase. The education budget as a percentage of the total government budget increased from 7% to 8%.

482 additional primary teachers have been paid through GPE and other partners. All primary headteachers (837) have been paid incentives of $25 per month to lift their morale in carrying out their added responsibilities.

The management framework and blueprint for the National Teaching Training Institute (NTTI) has been developed. It was decided that in the first two years of operation the NTTI will only have female trainees which will quickly supply qualified female teachers thus giving a great boost for girls’ education.

631,000 textbooks were distributed to 878 primary schools throughout the country. The textbooks covered all primary levels and subjects, teacher guides and syllabi, including much needed English textbooks for the first time.

The curriculum framework has been developed and validated through a highly consultative process. Broad learning outcomes have been finalised for all levels. Two committees have been formed and are functional (curriculum oversight and curriculum technical) to oversee the curriculum transformation process.

In the National Examinations, the number of students sitting for the examinations increased from the previous year in both primary (9%) and secondary education (7%). The number of passes in the primary examinations increased from 11,684 to 12,744 while the overall performance in the secondary examinations also improved. Neighbouring countries continue to recognise Somaliland secondary school certificates for admission into institutions of higher learning.

90 school supervisors were examined, selected and trained to visit almost all public primary and secondary schools (902 out of 954) in the country at least once using the agreed QA checklist. The results are to be stored in a database and used as the baseline for future visits.

Education service delivery in 3 pilot districts (Borama, Burao, Berbera) was operationalized with 273 support staff (cleaners and watchmen) benefiting under the Joint Programme for Local Governance (JPLG).

The first ever Joint Review of the Education Sector was held under strong MOEHE leadership and with their active involvement. The capacity of MOEHE has risen to the extent that they ably started preparing for the second JRES before the arrival of the consultant. The Education Officers (formerly trainees to the TAs) have now all been integrated as MOEHE staff and have played key roles in preparing for this JRES. They are a valuable resource for the future success and continuity of MOEHE.

The first ever education annual action plan was developed through which the current JRES is being assessed. It was incorporated into the Education Sector Strategic Plan which was revised, translated, printed and disseminated widely.

The coordination, collaboration and support from all partners continues to be a great resource for MOEHE. The joint steering committee meetings are now held 6-monthly for the whole sector in addition to the monthly ESC and other special meetings.
• The Secretariat for the Vocational Qualifications Authority (VQA) was established and it has started to inspect and register technical institutions, which is ongoing.

• The Education Act was finalized and is waiting for approval by Parliament. Validation and sensitisation will happen concurrently since it may take some time for endorsement by Parliament.

• There was capacity building of the Commission for Higher Education. Minimum standards are being reviewed to add on to the University standards draft after which it will be disseminated and followed up by an initial pilot evaluation exercise.

Analysis of the Education Management Information System (EMIS) data
The data in this section has been taken from the EMIS Unit and the draft 2013/14 Year Book which was released just before the JRES. Overall, the enrolment data increased at every level as can be seen from the tables below.

**PRIMARY SCHOOL ENROLMENT**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>154 10/13</th>
<th>143 11/14</th>
<th>% age increase</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Boys</td>
<td>114861</td>
<td>117967</td>
<td>2.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girls</td>
<td>91683</td>
<td>95127</td>
<td>3.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>206,544</td>
<td>213,094</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**SECONDARY SCHOOL ENROLMENT**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>154 10/13</th>
<th>143 11/14</th>
<th>% age increase</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Boys</td>
<td>16001</td>
<td>27368</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girls</td>
<td>7708</td>
<td>16133</td>
<td>109%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>23,709</td>
<td>43,501</td>
<td>83%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There have been substantial increases in enrolment at secondary level especially for girls which has more than doubled. It has been reported that girl-friendly spaces are now becoming overcrowded, which is a pleasing challenge! The gender parity index is improving at both primary and secondary levels as can be seen from the tables below.

**Primary level GER Trends**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GER Trends</th>
<th>Boys</th>
<th>Girls</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>GPI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>167 7/12</td>
<td>50.3</td>
<td>38.1</td>
<td>44.3</td>
<td>0.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>154 10/13</td>
<td>48.2</td>
<td>38.8</td>
<td>43.5</td>
<td>0.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>143 11/14</td>
<td>48.2</td>
<td>39.1</td>
<td>43.6</td>
<td>0.81</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Secondary level GER Trends**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GER Trends</th>
<th>Boys</th>
<th>Girls</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>GPI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>154 10/13</td>
<td>13.8</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>0.52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>143 11/14</td>
<td>24.9</td>
<td>15.7</td>
<td>20.5</td>
<td>0.63</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The enrolment ratios, nevertheless, are not quite as encouraging as the raw enrolment data. For example, the overall primary Net Enrolment Rate (NER) has gone down from 34.0% (2012/13) to 33.3% (2013/14). However, this might be explained by the uncertainty in the overall population figures. The UNDP 2005 projected data is still being used as the source of school age population.

Generally, the net figures are significantly smaller than the gross figures. For example, the Primary Grade 1 Gross Intake Rate (GIR) is 102.8% whereas the Net Intake Rate (NIR) is only 21.9%. This implies that children are generally entering school at a much higher age than the Ministry-recommended age of 6 years.

The public versus private figures confirm the trend mentioned earlier. It can be seen in the table below that enrolment in private primary schools has considerably increased whereas the enrolment in public primary schools has gone down due to the falling quality which has been explained in a previous section.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PUBLIC versus PRIVATE</th>
<th>Primary Schools</th>
<th>Secondary Schools</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ownership</td>
<td>154 10/13</td>
<td>143 11/14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public</td>
<td>165017</td>
<td>164876</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private</td>
<td>43576</td>
<td>47846</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The main ESSP targets for 2016 are: GER (primary) = 75% with equal participation of girls and boys; GER (secondary) = 50% with a girl/boy disparity narrowed to 3/4; transition rate from primary to secondary school = 75%. Although progress has been made towards all these goals, the gaps are clearly still wide. Moreover, since there are no overall data on total number of pastoralist children and disabled/special needs children in Somaliland, it is difficult to assess the ESSP targets of reaching 40% of pastoralist children and 50% of disabled children. It is assumed that these targets are far from being met.

Priorities of the Ministry of Education & Higher Education for 2014

This section looks at the priorities of the MOEHE as agreed in the 2014 Aide Mémoire. It can be seen that generally excellent progress was made.

1. Construction of the proposed Somaliland Teachers Training Institute
   • The management framework and blueprint for the National Teaching Training Institute was developed. It was decided that the first two years will only have female trainees.

2. MOEHE will seek to fill the teacher gaps by increasing teacher training
   • Number of teachers trained = 344 primary, 439 secondary, 83 TVET

3. MOEHE will establish a proper Teacher Profile and Management System
   • Database has been set up. Remaining issues: data analysis and issuance of teacher ID cards

4. MOEHE plans to increase the number of teachers receiving incentives
   • 482 additional primary teachers have been paid in 2014 through GPE and other partners

5. MOEHE will increase the quantity of teaching and learning resources received by schools
   • 631,000 textbooks were distributed to 878 primary schools. The textbooks covered all primary levels and subjects, teacher guides and syllabi, including much needed English textbooks for the first time
6. MOEHE plans to complete and approve the curriculum framework in 2014
   • The curriculum framework has been developed and validated through a highly consultative process. Broad learning outcomes have been finalised for all levels. Curriculum milestones in the ESSP yet to be fulfilled include the establishment of a Curriculum Development Centre.

7. MOEHE has prioritized the finalization of the Vocational Qualifications Framework
   • The Secretariat for the VocationalQualifications Authority (VQA) was established and it has started to inspect and register technical institutions, which is ongoing.

8. Finalize the higher education legislation and provide the framework for the Higher Education Commission to execute its mandate
   • There was capacity building of the Commission for Higher Education. Minimum standards are being reviewed to add on to the University standards draft after which it will be disseminated and followed up by an initial pilot evaluation exercise.

9. Quality Assurance – training, dissemination, printing, translation, monitoring and training materials and school visits
   • 90 school supervisors were examined, selected and trained to visit almost all public primary and secondary schools (902 out of 954). Monitoring is ongoing. Printing and dissemination of some QA materials are yet to be done.

10. Finalizing all the draft policies – Translation, dissemination and validation
    • The Somaliland National Education Policy is under review and needs completion before the MOEHE continues work on finalising the other policies which should be in line. The ESSP was revised, translated, printed and disseminated widely in 2014.

11. MOEHE will improve the school infrastructure, including constructing and renovating additional schools and classrooms
    • 124 classrooms built, 90 classrooms renovated, 33 schools and 49 classrooms furnished

Donor communiqué 2014
This section looks at the priorities of the donors as mentioned in the donor communiqué of the 2014 Aide Memoire.

1. Improving Learning Outcomes
   • The quality in public primary schools is falling. However, the number of passes in the primary examinations increased from 11,684 to 12,744 while the overall performance in the secondary examinations also improved. Neighbouring countries continue to recognise Somaliland secondary school certificates for admission into institutions of higher learning.

2. Decentralisation of Quality Assurance
   • This is one of the Ministry’s priorities and much progress was made in 2014 as described earlier. However, regional education officers do not have a budget to adequately cover the running costs of their offices.

3. Data Practices
   • There are still problems here. Unfortunately the finalised EMIS results for 2013/14 were not ready when the JRES consultant arrived in Hargeisa. It was discovered that many private schools had been missed out from the EMIS which caused further delays as MOEHE rectified the situation. EMIS data are essential for the JRES.
4. Public Private Partnership

- This is taking place at the school level. Many schools are getting support from Telesom. One headteacher said he was expecting a photocopier while another said his school was being renovated with more than $5,000 from Telesom.

- One vocational training centre pays companies for one-month internships after which the companies are requested to take over the interns.

5. Mutual Accountability

- Many teachers are not on the government payroll. There needs to be more transparency from government on the number of teachers it is paying, how much it is putting in and where. Donors need the real picture to identify where support is required in order to reach the unpaid teachers.

6. Local Solutions

- Secondary schools have an acute shortage of textbooks. Many secondary teachers are writing their own pamphlets for sale at a reduced price.

- One primary school grows grass in its compound during rains and cuts it for donkeys and goats to eat. This raises enough income to pay two watchmen for a year.

Capacity development of the Ministry of Education & Higher Education

The capacity of the MOEHE has been strengthened in the five areas of Finance & Administration, Human Resource Management, Quality Assurance & Standards, Policy & Planning, and Gender through the five Technical Advisers (TAs) and their Education Officers (former trainees). The success of the Education Officers is clear since they are now fully integrated as staff in the MOEHE and have actively participated in the current JRES. This means that the TA positions can be gradually phased out. However, it is recommended that in key areas such as Quality Assurance and Policy & Planning the TAs should be continued while there is a great need for them.

Positive changes have been registered at the MOEHE with the development and articulation of policies and procedures, and the establishment of operational systems. More resources should be put towards the decentralization process which is beginning to take root. Regional officers are closer to the people and they therefore know the needs better. The REOs and DEOs need running costs to carry out their duties but, just like schools, funds are short.

“The supervisor visits the nearest school to his house. He cannot go elsewhere because he has no transport.” Regional Education Officer

There are also no written job descriptions so some regional staff are unaware of their proper functions. The consultant found one regional staff teaching in a nearby secondary school. This greatly benefited the school but was it fulfilling the functions of the regional office? The consultant asked one REO his opinion on the proposed new National Teacher Training Institute. However, the REO said he was unaware of the initiative! Clearly communication needs to be improved between the MOEHE’s central and regional offices.

The education partners are a great resource for the MOEHE and the monthly ESC meetings and working groups should be actively continued. There was a lapse in the ESC meetings in 2014. The MOEHE should ensure that the agenda keeps to important issues relevant to the education partners and, in return, partners should send their key personnel to attend such meetings without fail.

Capacity development is a priority of the Ministry and tangible steps have been made in this direction in 2014. The GPE project provides a good illustration how the capacities of the Ministry in planning, budgeting and implementation have been raised at both central and regional levels. The Quality Assurance personnel themselves worked out the supervision schedule so that almost all schools in the country could be reached. The Ministry have learned a lot “by doing”. As a result, the MOEHE
accountants can now monitor the accounts of local NGOs working with government. Some GPE funding has been sent to the regions who do their own finances. This is building the capacity of the regions too. This method of implementation where some funding goes directly to the Ministry which is then fully involved in developing its own budgets, activities and reporting is preferred by the government because it enhances ownership and therefore sustainability. Training should focus on \textbf{practical issues which are followed up} rather than done theoretically without application. Learning by doing, i.e. on-the-job training, is the most effective and sustainable method.

\section*{Challenges and way ahead}

This final section of the report deals with the main challenges of the education sector with some suggestions for the way ahead.

\subsection*{Challenges}

The main challenge in 2014 (continuing up to the present) was that the Free Primary Education policy is not working as hoped for. Many trained teachers are moving away from public primary schools into the private ones where conditions are more favourable. They are followed by the children because many parents are prepared to pay for private school to ensure their children receive quality education. The quality of the public schools is therefore diminishing as senior trained teachers are replaced by young untrained ones. It is a downward spiral because as more trained teachers leave the public schools the more the quality decreases and it has now reached a precarious level.

The problem can be explained as follows. Before FPE, schools charged fees from which they could supplement teacher’s salaries above the government level. Therefore, headteachers could control their teachers by paying more to those who worked more hours, less to those who worked fewer hours and nothing at all to those who did no work. However, after FPE, all teachers in public schools receive exactly the same salary – no matter how many hours they work. As salary comes from the government, headteachers can no longer control the teachers especially as teachers are now demoralised because their total income has decreased as a result of FPE. Moreover, before FPE, school fees could pay for the essential running costs of the school as well as the “unpaid” teachers who were outside the government payroll. After FPE, there is no money for school running costs or to pay the volunteer teachers. If a school has no running costs it cannot function properly let alone provide quality education. Devoted teachers may pay for the schools’ running costs out of their own pockets – for example, by buying their own lesson preparation books or making telephone calls to parents to report absent children. Since there is “Free Primary Education” by legal statute, some communities are now even reluctant to contribute to the running costs of the schools and some Community Education Committees (CECs) are virtually inactive.

\begin{quote}
\textit{“Free Primary Education is a good idea in principle but it is not working in practice and needs reform.}\
\textbf{Headteacher of public secondary school}
\end{quote}

Note that many other challenges in the education sector result from FPE. If the problems of FPE can be tackled successfully, some challenges should also disappear. For example, if schools provide quality education, then parents or politicians should not need to be convinced of the value of education. It should be self-evident.

Other challenges in the education sector in 2014 were as follows:

\begin{itemize}
  \item There are two types of public primary school in Somaliland – the urban and the rural. Both of these have challenges but of a different nature which need to be addressed in different ways.
\end{itemize}

\footnote{After FPE many teachers are worse off, even though government doubled their salaries from $50 to $100, because they no longer receive a supplement from school fees which was worth more than the Ministry’s $50 increase.}
Urban schools tend to be largely populated with overcrowded classes and deteriorating furniture. They are competing academically (and currently losing the battle) with the many urban private schools which are increasingly springing up. Rural schools, on the other hand, tend to be small with sparsely filled classes and underqualified teachers. Many rural schools do not have the full complement of grades (1-8) and finish at grade 6, for example. If parents do not have money to send their children to town schools, the children will drop out after grade 6 because there is no class to continue in the rural school. Another problem to be solved is the transfer of teachers. A headteacher in a rural school informed the consultant that he is losing teachers when volunteer teachers seek to transfer themselves away to urban schools as soon as they get onto the government payroll. The MOEHE should discourage this movement.

- The regional education officers suffer similar problems to schools in that they do not have a budget to adequately cover the running costs of their offices. Although some progress has been made in school supervision with the help of partners and GPE, there is no sustainable solution in sight.

- EMIS data are essential for the JRES. Unfortunately the finalised EMIS results for 2013/14 were not ready when the JRES consultant arrived in Hargeisa. It was discovered that many private schools had been missed out from the EMIS which caused further delays as MOEHE rectified the situation.

- Reaching children in remote places and pastoralist communities is an ongoing challenge which has not been adequately addressed. The pastoralist education programme in 2012-13 was not continued in spite of its relative success and the immense needs.

- The Vocational Qualifications Authority (VQA) needs to be empowered with running costs. There is no resource centre to train TVET instructors. The TVET syllabus and books are in English, not Somali. If they are not translated, a terminology system needs to be established.

The way ahead and recommendations for 2015

Some recommendations were already mentioned earlier in the text. Important ones are repeated here.

First and foremost, it is recommended that the Free Primary Education policy should be thoroughly reviewed and that partners should urgently support the Ministry to address the key concerns associated with FPE, in particular the schools’ running costs and communities/ parents’ contributions. Somaliland should look for its own solution but can borrow ideas from other countries. For example, in South Africa there are Model C schools where government pays the salaries and parents contribute to cover the rest. Parents would then have more control and say in how the school is run which should have a positive effect on the quality of education provided. It is right for parents to contribute to their children’s education if they are able to. Indeed it is their duty. However, for those parents who are very poor and unable to pay, their children should be allowed free schooling as has always been practiced in Somaliland according to Islamic values.

Other suggestions for the way ahead are:

- If the flaws in FPE are fixed, then it is likely that the problems in the urban public primary schools will solve themselves automatically. A sound “business model” should survive and flourish according to the laws of economics. The urban public primary schools should bounce back to their former status and be among the best schools in the country through healthy competition which generates quality and attracts more students. However, the rural schools will still have intrinsic problems to be addressed.

- It is recommended that the Ministry establishes a new Department for Rural Schools to address the rural disparities – in the same way that it successfully set up a Gender Department to address the gender disparities. The Department for Rural Schools should focus on the problems of schools outside the towns and should seek solutions for improving quality such
as getting good teachers and headteachers into rural schools and paying them higher incentives. This is already done in other countries with the support of GPE.

- The Joint Programme for Local Governance (JPLG) project currently in 3 districts should be expanded to other districts to improve education service delivery at district level.

- MOEHE Working Groups should be more active in the critical subsectors such as gender, EMIS, teacher education, QA, Education in Emergencies (EiE) and TVET. These groups can provide valuable support to an overstretched Ministry while at the same time help build the Ministry’s capacity in the relevant subsector. In particular, the EMIS working group should be a permanent fixture throughout the year assisting the preparation, implementation and follow up of the annual census and its proposed decentralisation with support from all concerned partners.

- EMIS should be simplified to capture only the most basic data on number of schools, teachers and pupil enrolment to avoid confusion\(^7\) and ensure data is finalised and analysed in good time before the JRES. The data should be disaggregated according to region, male/ female, rural/ urban and private/ public so that MOEHE can identify disparities that need to be addressed.

- MOEHE should feedback finalized EMIS reports to the schools\(^8\). This would motivate teachers and enhance accountability because teachers would be able to question data and help report mistakes. Ownership and accountability would be further enhanced by decentralising EMIS in line with government’s decentralisation plans. Some NGOs are interested to support this process.

- The Examinations Department’s capacity should be strengthened for analysing the national examination results to identify potential disparities. For example, their secondary school results should be disaggregated by gender and their primary school results should be disaggregated by public vs private. It would be beneficial if the Examinations Department were to be more closely linked with the EMIS Unit because they both deal with the same schools.

- MOEHE should set up an appropriate EMIS system for TVET and higher education to identify needs and help manage and monitor these subsectors in relation to the whole sector. There is a great gap in the TVET sub-sector which needs to be highlighted.

- TVET requires more support and funding, especially for girls and the disabled, and the courses should be geared to the job market or self-employment. There are many jobless out-of-school youth who could benefit from such training.

- Higher Education\(^9\) is essential for producing leaders and should receive increased support and funding in view of the importance of this subsector to the overall development of Somaliland. The university act legal framework has been completed and validated and will be operational in 2015. At the same time, through the support of the consortium, other relevant quality assurance assessment tools such as the minimum university standards guidelines and the career development guidance manuals are now completed and operational.

---

\(^7\) Some headteachers said that the EMIS questionnaire was too complicated and took too much time to fill. One headteacher said he merely guessed some of the answers such as the distance of school from pupils’ homes.

\(^8\) All headteachers spoken to said that they had not received feedback on EMIS.

\(^9\) Some Higher Education priorities inserted for 2015-2016 are awaiting support. The tools such as minimum university standards guidelines, questionnaires and the career guidance manual have been developed and translated into Somali. The next step is to operationalize these tools underpinning the DHE key objectives.
But the Higher Education sub-sector is still severely underfunded. The consortium agrees to increase its focus on higher education by supporting the minimum universities standards assessments to be carried out by the Directorate of Higher Education (DHE) in collaboration with the Commission. At the same time DHE will carry out career guidance sensitization workshops in the 55 secondary schools in Somaliland. The key objective is to guide the high school students on employable career development options such as marine studies, health care services, veterinary and so forth. The Directorate plans to advocate for the introduction of higher technical and vocational courses for post-secondary school leavers, adapted to employable market oriented skills to support educated youth employment and reduce the high level of youth unemployment. It is also evident that the recent proliferation of privately owned universities may lead to gaps in the required quality of higher education being offered resulting in mediocre standards of graduating students. Therefore a thorough assessment based on universal university standards is required to enhance the potential and future impact of the students who have invested in acquiring the requisite primary and secondary schooling. This investment requires dedicated quality assurance from the MOEHE.

The Somaliland National Education Policy is under review and needs completion before the MOEHE continues work on finalising the other policies which should be in line. The Education Act and Education Policy are key. Policies are urgently needed otherwise partners are working without guidelines which can cause confusion and waste of resources.

The Higher Education Directorate is developing a new national Higher Education Policy that can harmonise the mandates of the Commission of Higher Education and the H.E. Directorate. There will be need for exposure study tours to learn from African Educational Authorities and other developing countries.

The consultant met one Somaliland headteacher who had studied in Ethiopia and highly recommended the organised education system there particularly with regard to EMIS and zonal education offices. MOEHE should learn lessons from good practice in neighbouring countries (e.g. Ethiopia, Kenya) either through sharing relevant documentation or by encouraging group exchange visits.

Most organisations have already finalised the plans for their activities in 2015. The JRES should be better carried out at the end of the year (Nov-Dec) rather than March to ensure that its recommendations can be incorporated into partners’ plans and activities for the following year.

In future reviews, more time should be added for the consultant to reach schools far from the main road or in remote pastoralist areas, which are presumably the most under-served and needy areas. Time should also be added for the consultant to meet key strategic partners in Nairobi.
Appendix 1: Stakeholders met by the consultant

State Minister for Education
DG Ministry of Education
DG Higher Education
Director Policy & Planning
Director TVET & NFE
Director Curriculum & Teacher Training
EMIS Unit
Examinations Department
Commission for Higher Education
Technical Adviser Policy & Planning
Technical Adviser Quality Assurance
Education Officers (former trainees)
Regional Education Officers
Regional Education Staff (gender focal point, supervisors, accountant and cashier)
District Education Officer
Universities and technical institutes
Headteachers and teachers of primary and secondary schools
European Union Delegation (EU)
United States Agency for International Development (USAID)
United Nations Children’s Fund (UNICEF)
United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO)
Save the Children International (SCI)
CARE International (CARE)
Norwegian Refugee Council (NRC)
Africa Educational Trust (AET)
Adventist Development & Relief Agency (ADRA)
Members of the JRES task force
Appendix 2: Schools and institutions visited by the consultant

### School visits including Hargeisa

* G = Government, P = Private, C = Community, N = NGO

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Main Town</th>
<th>Sub-Sector *</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Hargeisa</td>
<td>Primary (G)</td>
<td>Sheikh Ali Osman</td>
<td>town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>Primary (P)</td>
<td>Al Rayaan</td>
<td>town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>Secondary (G)</td>
<td>Mohamoud Ahmed Ali</td>
<td>town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>Higher Education (G)</td>
<td>Hargeisa University</td>
<td>town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td>Primary (G)</td>
<td>Dacar Budhug</td>
<td>outside town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td>Primary (G)</td>
<td>Hamaas</td>
<td>outside town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Berbera</td>
<td>Primary (G)</td>
<td>Omer Binu Khadab</td>
<td>town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td>Secondary (G)</td>
<td>Bursade</td>
<td>town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
<td>TVET(N)</td>
<td>GAVO</td>
<td>town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td>Higher Education (G)</td>
<td>Berbera Maritime &amp; Fisheries Ac.</td>
<td>town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
<td>Primary (G)</td>
<td>Gelokor</td>
<td>outside town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td>Secondary (P)</td>
<td>Dayaxa</td>
<td>town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Burao</td>
<td>NFE(N)</td>
<td>Family Life Education Centre</td>
<td>town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
<td>TVET (G)</td>
<td>Burao Technical Institute</td>
<td>town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td>Higher Education (P)</td>
<td>Gollis Burao Branch</td>
<td>town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
<td>Primary (G)</td>
<td>Qoyta</td>
<td>outside town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Sheikh</td>
<td>Primary (G)</td>
<td>Dubur</td>
<td>outside town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td>Secondary (G)</td>
<td>Mohamed Shire Gaab</td>
<td>town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Gabiley</td>
<td>Primary (G)</td>
<td>Arabsiyo</td>
<td>outside town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
<td>Secondary (G)</td>
<td>New Gabiley/Qalah</td>
<td>town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Borama</td>
<td>Primary (P)</td>
<td>Alquudus (mainly girls)</td>
<td>town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td></td>
<td>TVET (N)</td>
<td>HAVOYODO</td>
<td>town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td></td>
<td>Higher Education (G)</td>
<td>Eelo University</td>
<td>town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td></td>
<td>Secondary (G)</td>
<td>Dila</td>
<td>outside town</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 3: List of references

2012-2016 Education Sector Strategic Plan
2014 Education Action Plan
Final Somaliland JRES Synthesis Report 2014
Aide Mémoire Somaliland Final 2014
EMIS 2012-2013 Somaliland Statistical Year Book
EMIS 2013-2014 Somaliland Statistical Year Book draft 21 March 2015
National Education Framework for Transformation
Minutes from ESC meetings and technical working groups
MOEHE budgets and policies (including revised TVET policy)
GPE status report
Mid-term review of ESDP II
Interim reports of Horumarinta Elmiga
SYLI fact sheet and mid-term review
NTTI draft management plan
VQF document – Somaliland
SWES interim narrative report
CHE final report
Final SOMGEP CEC training manual
Gollis University Faculty Journal
Berbera Maritime & Fisheries Academy’s Mission, Vision and Values
Appendix 4: Aide Mémoire, JRES, Somaliland, 24-25 March 2015

The following is a summary of the issues raised, key findings and recommendations of the Somaliland JRES 2015.

Opening speeches
The following topics were highlighted:

- Somaliland’s commitment to the development of a robust education system
- Ensuring all children have access to quality primary education regardless of age, presence or absence of impairment and gender
- Education is clearly articulated in the Somaliland Special Arrangement: Peace and State-building Goal 5
- Latest statistics show a steady increase in girls’ enrolment and the gender gap is narrowing
- However, overall enrolment is only increasing at same rate as population growth
- For a rapid increase of enrolment there needs to be quick implementation of non-formal education programmes such as pastoralist education programmes
- The decentralization process should be encouraged for improved access and quality
- Teacher training is important to improve the quality of education provided
- Need more support for higher education which includes teacher training institutions
- Technical education is required to enable society to catch up with modern technology
- Education for youth is a pillar of the peace process

The incoming Honorable Minister of Education Professor Faarah Elmi Mahamuud Geedoole emphasized the importance of the following three areas:

1. Quality of the teacher and the quality of the learner
2. Need to improve practical education (TVET) such as technical institutes and applied technology
3. Special needs should receive more support

Issues raised
The following issues were raised following the presentations by the consultant and Education Officers:

- Importance of community contribution
- How can schools be maintained?
- Late age of entry into primary schools
- Quality of education and lack of qualified teachers
• Improve access to upper primary and secondary in rural areas
• School site selection and planning
• Public-private partnerships in school construction
• First aid kits, health and hygiene matters in schools need attention
• Sanitation and garbage is a school issue requiring a policy
• More emphasis on special needs at all levels
• How can special needs be integrated?
• Crucial unmet need for TVET
• Public-private partnerships in TVET
• Awareness of TVET as a profession
• Alternative forms of useful TVET such as nurses, opticians, animal breeding
• Need TVET curriculum at all levels
• Using locally based materials in secondary school science labs
• Difficulty in transporting laboratory chemicals - needs policy
• Need more girl friendly spaces
• Draft policies need to be finalised
• QA should continue to ensure required standards are reached

Priorities for 2015
The following priorities were discussed and agreed for 2015:

1. Construction of the Somaliland National Teacher Training Institute
2. Revise and finalize the Teacher Education policy, include all subsectors in training and enhance the rank of teaching as a profession
3. Start process of formal TVET by extending intake to grade 8 and Form 4 graduates to be enrolled at the Hargeisa and Burao Technical Institutes
4. Continue process of curriculum development including syllabus outlines with competencies and standards identified
5. Strengthen the interim Vocational Qualifications Authority to become fully operational
6. Finalize the Higher Education legislation and provide the framework for the Higher Education Commission to execute its mandate
7. Strengthen the effectiveness of Quality Assurance with more field visits and improved reporting
8. Finalize all draft policies
9. Improve school infrastructure by constructing and renovating additional schools and classrooms including the construction of boarding schools in Sool and Sanaag
10. Focus on access for pastoralists and coastal communities (consider flexible scholastic year)
11. Improve EMIS system and include GER and NER in the statistics

12. Clarification of roles at decentralised level, defining the authority of the REO

13. Continue decentralisation process to include school maintenance, running costs, EMIS, school supervision and an additional district under JPLG

14. Provide career guidance to Form 4 leavers going on to TVET, university or job

15. Support the gender unit and gender mainstreaming at all levels

16. Include disabilities as a priority

17. Capacity strengthening of MOEHE at all levels

**Final reflections**

- JRES was overall very encouraging with strong ownership by MOEHE including the Education Officers
- 2015 is to be used for reflection on how the next GPE allocation can complement the sector
- Next review could have just one point of emphasis and the field trips could focus on that
- Hope for the participation of more Nairobi personnel (INGOs and donors) next year
Appendices 5 & 6: Action plans 2014 & 2015 (separate excel sheets)