

Ministry of Education and Higher Studies

Republic of Somaliland

Aide Memoire

Joint Review of the Education Sector, 2016

Biko Gwendo,
International Research and Development Actions
Nairobi, Kenya
Email: b.gwendo@irdac.org

April 2017

Table of Contents

List of Abbreviations 4

1 Introduction and Background Information 5

1.1 Overview of the Education Sector in Somaliland 5

1.2 Role of Main Actors and their focus in the Education Sector 7

1.3 Joint Review of the Education Sector (JRES) 2016 7

1.3.1 Objectives of the JRES 8

1.3.2 Approach to the JRES 9

2 Key Findings on the Status of Education Sector 11

2.1 Early Childhood Education (ECE) 12

2.2 Primary Education 12

2.3 Secondary Education 12

2.4 Key highlights of TVET 13

2.5 Education Sector Financing 13

2.6 Teacher Workforce, Education and Remuneration 14

2.7 Education Quality Indicators 14

2.8 Special Education 15

2.9 Higher Education 16

2.10 The key successes of ESSP 2012-16 were identified as below: 16

2.11 Key challenges to effective education provision 17

2.12 Key shortfalls in delivery of ESSP 2012-2016 are as below: 17

3 Recommendations from Joint Review of the Education Sector 17

4 References 20

5 Annexes 20

Annex I : JRES Terms of Reference 20

Annex II : JRES Workshop Program 20

Annex III : List of JRES Workshop Participants 20

Annex IV : JRES Synthesis Workshop Presentation 20

Annex V : JRES Consultant Field Visits Schedule 20

List of Tables

Table 1: Education Institutions visited during JRES 2016 in Somaliland 10
Table 2: Education Programs whose progress was presented at the JRES 2016 in Hargeisa 11

List of Abbreviations

ADRA	Adventist Development Relief Agency
AET	Africa Educational Trust
CEC	Community Education Committee
DRR	Disaster Risk Reduction
ECE	Early Childhood Education
EGEP	Education Girls End Poverty
EMIS	Education Management Information Systems
ESC	Education Sector Coordination
ESSP	Education Sector Strategic Plan
EU	European Union
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GEC	Girls Education Challenge
GPE	Global Partnership for Education
IDP	Internally Displaced Persons
JRES	Joint Review of the Education Sector
MOEHS	Ministry of Education and Higher Studies
NFE	Non Formal Education
OIC	Organization of Islamic Countries
PBR	Pupil Book Ratio
PCR	Pupil Classroom Ratio
PTR	Pupil Teacher Ratio
SCI	Save the Children International
SWAP	Sector Wide Approach
TVET	Technical, Vocational Education and Training
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
USAID	United States Agency for International Development

1 Introduction and Background Information

Somaliland's Gross Domestic Product (GDP)[1] and living standards are the fourth lowest in the world. According to a World Bank survey of 2012, it ranks amongst the poorest countries in the world, with a GDP at USD 1.4 billion and a per capita GDP[2] of about USD 347[3]. Findings from a Household survey conducted in 2013 show that 43.2% of the population live on less than USD 1/day (53.4% in rural areas); 73.4% live on less than USD 2/ day. Somaliland's economy traditionally depends on the exploitation of natural resources, mainly livestock and agriculture. Almost 30% of GDP is derived from the livestock industry followed by 20% from wholesale and retail trade (including the informal sector). Recurrent droughts, often followed by floods, severely affect people's livelihoods. Approximately 75% of Somaliland are below 30 years, 46% are below age 15 and 31% are below age 9[4]. This shows there is potential for education given this demographic dividend.

Levels of development vary widely between urban, rural and nomadic areas, between males and females. In the 2012 study, initial estimates suggested that poverty in urban areas was 29% while it was 38% in rural areas. The Republic of Somaliland has established a system of governance and security allowing more medium to long-term rehabilitation and development interventions over the last decade. Somaliland is a liberal democracy that has maintained peace, security and economic recovery since its self-declaration of independence in 1994. It has established its own government system and functions. It has managed to maintain peace and security in the last two decades and significant improvement has been made in many social and economic sectors including Education Services

1.1 Overview of the Education Sector in Somaliland

However the education sector still requires support to improve adequate access to good quality, equitable and efficient services to all children. In 2012, the Ministry of Education and Higher Studies (MOEHS) developed the 2012- 2016 Somaliland Education Sector Strategic Plan (ESSP) and the highest priority for 2012-16 was given as the delivery of good-quality primary education to as many of the age-group as possible. Other priorities included the cost-effective provision of relevant secondary, TVET, university and continuous teacher development – together with effective information systems upon which sensible planning could be based and informed decisions taken, contributing to effective education sector management.

Overall, the ESSP expresses a call for expanded education opportunities for the hard to reach, particularly girls/women and vulnerable groups[5], greater ownership, and better coordination across donor-funded investments. The plan has formed the basis for alignment and coordination of partner support to the education sector. Consequently, this establishes management systems that move

[1] The value of all final goods and services produced domestically in one year
[2] GDP divided by the total number of people in the economy
[3] http://www.worldbank.org/en/news/press-release/2014/01/29/new-world-bank-gdp-and-poverty-estimates-for-somaliland
[4] UNFPA Population Estimation Survey, 2013-14
[5] Includes pastoralist, rural and IDP communities who are prone to community conflicts and environmental hazards

towards data driven decision-making. The EU has continued its strong focus on institutional capacity development for the MOEHS through past and ongoing programs, as a result contributing to evolution of a Sector Wide Approaches (SWAP), which is led by the MOEHS and is necessary for the long-term financial resources the education sector requires.

Despite significant improvement in realizing the ESSP, there has been also challenges and gaps such low capitation from the national budget. The quality of services in kindergarten and Quranic schools seems to be compromised by key determinants impacting on quality such as lack of a standardized Early Childhood Education (ECE) curriculum, untrained teachers, unfriendly teaching/learning approaches and inadequate use of play and learning materials. The primary education gross enrolment increased from 191,567 in 2011/12 to 234,128 children in 2014/15 school year. However, the Gross Enrollment Ratio (GER) is still low at 47% and needs much focus and support. In the secondary education sector, the total current student enrolment of both private and public schools as per the 2014/15 data is 47,913 compared to an enrolment of 31,072 in 2011 – an increase of 54% over four years but the GER still stands at 21.3%. Equity issues (especially for pastoralists, rural communities, urban poor, girls and those with special needs) groups remain the most excluded from education.

A sizeable number of schools are private, which is a considerable financial burden for families and many can therefore not afford to send their children to such schools, which are deemed to provide better quality education. The quality of education in Somaliland is generally low due to a lack of adequately trained education professionals (in particular female teachers) and qualified education professionals who are willing to serve outside major towns; shortage of relevant, quality teaching and learning materials; absence of unified and effective quality assurance systems etc.

Key result indicators for the sector are set out in the ESSP. Sector progress is set to be assessed and reported upon through separate Annual Joint Reviews of the Education Sector (JRES) involving the MOEHS, development partners, civil society and the private sector in the regions. JRES, as part of the sector-wide monitoring mechanism, addresses the fragmented and uncoordinated monitoring efforts. The first ever JRES for Somaliland was carried out in 2013 leading to the development of an Aide Memoire and an Annual Education Action Plan 2014. The 2015 Aide memoire articulated the following 16 priority areas which alongside the ESSP 2012-2016 were touched upon during the JRES 2015 and were the subject of the JRES 2016:

1. Construction of the National Teacher Training Institute and revision of the Teacher Education policy including all subsectors
2. Extend formal TVET at the Hargeisa and Burao Technical Institutes
3. Continue the process of curriculum development
4. Strengthen the Vocational Qualifications Authority
5. Finalize the Higher Education legislation
6. Strengthen the effectiveness of Quality Assurance
7. Finalize all draft policies
8. Construction of additional classrooms including boarding schools in Sool and Sanaag

9. Access for pastoralist and coastal communities
10. Enhancement of EMIS system
11. Clarification of roles at decentralised level, defining the authority of the REO
12. Continue decentralisation process under JPLG
13. Provide career guidance to Form 4 leavers going on to TVET, university or job
14. Support the gender unit and gender mainstreaming at all levels
15. Include disabilities as a priority
16. Capacity strengthening of MOEHE at all levels

1.2 Role of Main Actors and their focus in the Education Sector

The EU is the largest donor to the education sector in Somaliland. € 61M have been committed for education development throughout the whole of Somaliland for the period 2014- 2020. In the preceding period of 2008-2013, the EU invested 85 million Euros in the education sector in Somaliland.

- EU support to the education sector has seen a shift from a classical project approach which is seen to be fragmented by the beneficiaries to more integrated sector-wide programmes addressing all the key sub-sectors of education. The shift reinforces coherence between the various funding streams, coordination, donor harmonization, better ownership and non-duplication. Further, it translates to some core elements of the sector-wide approach (SWAP) making them applicable to the fragile and very unique Somali context. There is a clear link between the proposed contract and the following education programmes carried out by other sources of external assistance in the education sector:
- The Global Partnership for Education (GPE) which the EU and US Government contribute to is funding education to the tune of USD 14.5M, with USD 8.2M for SCZ. A new funding envelope for worth USD 33.1M is scheduled for 2017.
- USAID funds the Somali Youth Learner Initiative (SYLI) worth USD 19M focusing on improving secondary education opportunities and TVET for the youth.
- DfID through its Girls Education Challenge (GEC) Initiative funds two large education projects totalling GBP 21M creating opportunities for the marginalized Somali girls.
- There is a prospect of the World Bank supporting recurrent costs in the education sector such as the payment of teacher incentives.
- There may also be interventions funded by donors operating outside the standard coordination framework such as Turkey, Arab States and the OIC
- Educate a Child (EAC) funding equivalent to USD 1.6M to reach 20,000 out of school children in marginalized communities to access equitable quality formal education..

1.3 Joint Review of the Education Sector (JRES) 2016

In implementing the ESSP, evidence is needed to ensure that the education policy is inclusive, relevant, learner friendly and targets vulnerable and disadvantaged groups. Development, implementation and monitoring of evidence-based policies and programmes for improved quality of teaching and learning for all are the responsibility of education institutions and managers, who require continued capacity enhancement. It is in this context that the MOEHS and Education partners would like to assess the

education sector and the implementation of relevant strategic documents and, subsequently, develop a Synthesis Reports, Aide Memoire and a Costed Annual Action Plan for 2017 that is relevant, addresses critical educational issues, and works towards the realization of global education objectives.

The five-year ESSP for Somaliland terminates in 2016. From the outset, it formed the basis for alignment and coordination of partner support to the education sector. Consequently, there has been overwhelming donor support to the education sector, with donors funding various projects through capacity building, teacher training, infrastructure development etc. The traditional donors in Somaliland have included the EU, USAID, DFID, GPE, UNICEF, DANIDA, UKAID and bilateral donors such as the Qatar Foundation, Turkish government, Arab States, the Organization of Islamic Countries (OIC) and the World Bank.

JRES supports the review of the performance of the education sector, and was conducted within the context of the ESSP. JRES 2016 was the fourth in a row and was conducted with the support of the EU Delegation in partnership with the MOEHS and other Development Partners. It took place from mid-February to early March 2017.

JRES Synthesis report provides an overview of the current state of the education sector in Somaliland in relation to the Annual Education Action Plan 2015 and related Aide Memoire, based on data and statistics, documents, field visits and meetings. The synthesis report will include data analysis, graphs and charts, as well as a narrative portion. The synthesis report will be circulated a few days prior to the JRES and provide the basis for discussions during the JRES workshop. A Power Point of the synthesis report with photographs of the field visits will be presented during the JRES itself.

1.3.1 Objectives of the JRES

The Somaliland MOEHS conducts Annual Joint Review of the Education Sector (JRES) to review the yearly performance of the five years ESSP (2012-16). The review is used as a sector wide performance monitoring system to measure and continuously follow up the progress made against yearly planned activities and result indicators to improve coordination and collaboration among education stakeholders. The review involves the different departments of the MOEHS at all levels, development partners, civil society and the private sector. The JRES initiative started in 2014 and so far two review meetings were conducted in 2014 and 2015 and the ministry is currently planning to conduct the third 2016 JRES at the end of February 2017. Based on this, Save the Children as part of the Horumarinta Elmiga Consortium (SCI, CARE and NRC), in support of the MOEHS, commissioned a consultancy work to facilitate the review process

JRES seeks to contribute to the enhancement of the education sector performance.
Specifically, the JRES 2016 aimed to:

i. T
   o collect sufficient information and data evidence and critically review the 2016 annual plan and achievement against the ESSP result indicators

ii. T
o participate and coordinate with MOEHS at different levels and development agencies in gathering the relevant information and data

iii. T
o review the level of coordination of various actors in the education sector;

iv. T
o examine key challenges within the education sector to help determine priority actions to support the achievement of the objectives of the Education Sector Strategic Plan (ESSP);

v. T
o compile review report and present it in the JRES meeting.

vi. T
o compile Aide Memoire of the JRES review process and key action points agreed

1.3.2 Approach to the JRES

The MOEHS in collaboration with EU Delegation to Somaliland developed the Terms of Reference for the JRES and hired a consultant to lead the JRES process. The review entailed desk review of key documents, consultation with key stakeholders, fields visits, development of JRES synthesis presentation, JRES workshop deliberations, development of Aide memoir and Annual action plan for 2017. Key informant interviews were conducted with various education stakeholders engaged in the Education sector support. These included donors as well as implementing agencies. Additionally, various directors of the education were interviewed as well as the director general of education.

Desk Review

The review entail a technical and financial scrutiny of the 2016 annual plan against the 2012 – 2016 ESSP with extensive review of the available policy and strategy documents, secondary data available such as annual reports, monitoring and supervision reports, review and evaluation reports, ESA Report, latest EMIS Data (2014/15) etc. that available with the MoEHS and development partners. Annex II indicates the key documents and sources referenced in this review. Desk review helped to complement field visits especially on activities implemented in the regions that were not visited. It also helped formulate questions for consultations with MOEHS and development partners in corroborating the findings and conclusions arrived at. Review of these documents provided insight on the progress made so far in the six pillars of the ESSP i.e. Early Childhood Education, Primary Education, Secondary Education, Higher Education, TVET and Education Financing.

Field Visits

As part of the JRES process, the consultant and the JRES team undertook, field visits to various education institutions. Sample field visits were conducted in 8 education institutions in rural and urban settings (Table 2, below), involving Regional and District Education Offices in a randomly selected Regions in order to get a clearer picture of the situation on the ground through discussion with all education stakeholders. Further, the field visit helped to assess the actual situation on the ground vis-à-vis progress in implementation of ESSP 2012 – 2016 through visiting a cross section of educational

institutions in Hargeisa and neighboring regions In the field visits, the consultant interacted with pupils, teachers, head teachers, NFE/TVET center managers and Community Education Committee members and regional education officers to get first-hand experience and perception of education stakeholders. SCI, the lead implementing partner for the EU-funded *Horumarinta Elmiga* program provided the logistics for the field mission, including security, travel, scheduling and hosting meetings in collaboration with the MOEHS. Based on these field visits, a field-visit report and key findings were prepared and shared at the JRES Workshop and final aid memoire.

Table 1: Education Institutions visited during JRES 2016 in Somaliland

Education Institution	No. visited	Location
Non-formal education centre	1	Borama
Primary school	3	Borama, Hargeisa
Secondary school	1	Burao
TVET center	1	Berbera
University	1	Hargeisa
Teacher training institute	1	Hargeisa
Total	**8**	

Consultative Meetings

The JRES consultant conducted a series of sub-sector wide consultative meetings. These included the senior management and field experts of the MOEHS at different levels (Central, Regional, District, School) and education development partners to get wider insight and perspectives of the education sector including achievements and challenges. Key informant interviews were also conducted with donors, implementing agencies, Regional and District Education Officers, Directors of Education Institutions, Heads of various MOEHS Departments and Director General MOE in Hargeisa. (Annex III: Consultant Work plan) to get deeper insight on the performance of the Education Sector in triangulating findings from the desk review. Consultative meetings were held with various partners, starting with the MOEHS and SCI who were hosting and facilitating the JRES process.

JRES Workshop

The JRES exercise culminated in a two-day workshop attended by approximately 50 participants who represented various education partners in Hargeisa on 28 February and 1 March 2017. The workshop was officially opened by the H.E The Minister of Education, Mr Abdillahi and was attended by all Education actors and stakeholders, led by the DG MOE, with the EU Delegation to Somaliland in attendance and represented by Elisabeth Loacker. At the plenary session, various implementing partners presented their program achievements within 2016 in line with the aforementioned 6 pillars of the ESSP.

The consultant also made a Synthesis Presentation by the consultant that focused on:

- Key Frame of Reference was the ESSP 2012 - 2016
- Year of Focus for JRES Synthesis was 2016, but with 5 year analysis where relevant.
- Key Statistics for Primary and Secondary subsectors were drawn from EMIS 2014/2015 booklet.

- The key themes of Access/Equity, Quality and Governance and crosscutting issues i.e. Gender and Special Education interwoven across subsector presentations.
- Distinct insights were highlighted on Urban/Rural, Regional differences etc.
- JRES 2016 was happening simultaneously with ESA, ESSP, GPE processes

Table 2: Education Programs whose progress was presented at the JRES 2016 in Hargeisa

No.	Activity	Implementing Partner(s)	Donor
1	Horumarinta Elmiga	SCI, NRC, and CARE	EU
2	Educate Girls End Poverty	Relief International and ADRA	UKAID
3	Somali-wide Education Synergies	Africa Educational Trust	EU
4	Somali Youth Leadership Initiative	Mercy Corps, CARE and SONYO Umbrella	USAID
5	Increased access to inclusive education in Somaliland	International Aid Services	SIDA (SMC)
6	The Bridges Project	CARE	EU
7	GPE	UNICEF	Education A Child
8	Skills for Life	UNESCO	Al-Maktoum Foundation
9	Teacher & School leadership Training		
10	SOS Hargeisa Schools	SOS Children's Village	
11	Education in Sheikh district		
12	Child right project in Hargeisa		
13	Voice of the Youth project in Secondary schools		

Deliverables

Outputs of the JRES process were the following

a) ***Synthesis Report***: compiling key findings of the desk review, consultation meetings and field visits against the achievement of the 2016 Action Plan within the ESSP

b) ***Education Action Plan for 2017*** based on the new ESSP (2017 - 2021): that ensures activities proposed in the plan incorporate priorities and key strategies including costing financial plan as well as a monitoring and evaluation framework for the Action Plan

c) ***Aide Memoire***: a final report of the JRES workshop on issues discussed and raised, key findings and recommendations including the field visit and synthesis report

2 Key Findings on the Status of Education Sector

Joint Review of Education Sector (JRES) is an annual process that reviews the performance of the education sector. It is part of the sector-wide monitoring mechanism that addresses the fragmented and uncoordinated monitoring efforts in education. It contributes towards efforts to gather data and move towards data driven decision-making. JRES 2016 is the fourth in a row and was conducted within the context of Education Sector Strategic Plan (ESSP) 2012-2016 with support of the EU Delegation in

partnership with the Ministry of Education and Higher Studies (MOEHS), development partners, civil society and the private sector. Education Sector Strategic Plan (ESSP) 2012-2016 expressed a call for expanded education opportunities for the hard to reach, particularly girls and women, greater ownership, and better coordination across donor-funded investments. It formed the basis for alignment and coordination of partner support to the education sector. JRES 2016 took place from mid-February to early March 2017 in Hargeisa, Somaliland.

2.1 Early Childhood Education (ECE)

The ESSP identified six priority areas including increasing access, formulating a comprehensive regulatory framework and exploring an integrated approach of Quranic and formal ECE schools. Little traction was made on this sub sector, expect for the ECE framework that was developed, albeit in theory. UNICEF had conducted studies on integration. The limited progress within ECE could be attributed to underfunding, lack of data in the EMIS pertaining to ECE, besides limited awareness on the need for pre-school training.

2.2 Primary Education

This sub sector received the largest budgetary allocation of 90% in 2016. A total enrolment of 234,128 pupils (45% girls) was reported in 2014/15 period, which depicts a steady increase in enrolment across the four-year period. Whereas the enrolment of boys increased by 16% between 2011 and 2015, that of girls increased much rapidly, by 24%. During the ESSP period the GER has been largely stagnant and fell short of the 75% target. Deeper analysis of the GER demonstrates a decrease for boys (50.3 – 48.5) but an increase for girls (38.1 – 40.1). Through an elementary analysis of the NER figures above, it is evident 63.7% boys and 69% girls of eligible age are out of primary school. Hence, more girls are out of primary school than boys. On geographical distribution, GER and NER data shows significant inequity between urban and rural communities, with more children being out of primary school in rural communities.

The primary education sub sector received the largest budgetary allocation of 90%. On infrastructure, intensive school and classroom constructions continued with the number of schools increasing from 987 in 2012 to 1,083 in 2015, representing a 9.9% increment. Among the challenges experienced in primary education was inadequate financial and human resource capacity, large number of IDPs and pastoralist groups (up to 60%) besides low teacher motivation, more so in the rural communities.

2.3 Secondary Education

It was observed to be the fastest growing sub sector during the ESSP period as evidenced by increased enrolment by 54% between 2012 and 2016. Similar Similar to primary education, there are disparities in the geographical distribution of enrolments between urban and rural settings across the 6 regions of Somaliland. The government has maintained a 65% rate of increase in classrooms, thus keeping up with increased enrolment and demand. NER as at 2014/15 was 10.4%, indicating that 89.6% learners of eligible age were out of secondary school. Gender Parity Index has increased since 2011/12 from .52 to .68 by 2014/15 showing that the proportion of female students is lower than that of male students. NER provides useful information regarding later school starting and multi-age classrooms. Checking the NER

trends for both primary and secondary education between 2012 and 2016 shows stagnation. This suggests that despite the efforts to expand learning spaces and improve the quality of learning, there is has been little or no decrease in the number of out of school children, which warrants further investigation as to the causes[6].

On ESSP priorities and achievements, 50% of grade 8 graduates commence secondary education. According to the 2016 grade 8 exams, 90% of the candidates passed and qualified to join secondary education. All secondary schools are applying school improvement plans. Activities conducted also sought to reduce gender disparity in secondary education. Girls enrolment increased by 6% while that of boys decreased by the same proportion, an indication of reducing gender parity.

2.4 Key highlights of TVET

In the presentation for Horumarinta Elmiga, it was highlighted that the project is working with 7 IBTVET centres (training 615 youths), 44 EBTVET centres (training 400 youths) and 4 colleges (training 85 youths) Significant achievements were the re-establishment of Burao and Hargeisa Technical Institute as Secondary level Technical school. TVET activities in Somaliland are largely driven by INGOs hence poor coordination and lack of structured data provision. Several donor funded activities including Horumarinta Elmiga continued so support the TVET sub sector with training beneficiaries, providing refresher training for the trainers. The ESSP envisaged that the TVET authority would be established by 2016 and a legal framework for TVET qualifications set up. However, these were not realized, but significant progress was to set up the TVET authority and establish a legal framework. Notably, much of the priority in ESSP was on the provision of basic education as opposed to TVET and higher education, which is in line with the principles of Education for All, the commitment to free primary education policies, MDGs and SDS.

2.5 Education Sector Financing

* Allocation of the national funding almost doubled from USD7.8M in 2012 to USD14.6M in 20167
* Basic education, NFE and Secondary education were allocated the bulk of funds at 91% followed by Higher education (7%) and Commission for Higher education (2%)
* However, funding as proportion of the national budget has remained stagnated at around 7%. As a result, spending patterns have very little of education infrastructure and investments in training, capacity development for improving the quality of education services and education in emergencies.
* Approximately 72% of the education budget is spent on personnel and the compensation of human capital, which is a decrease from 92% in 2012
* Several international development bodies continue to contribute to channel funding from multilateral and bilateral bodies which contribute significant direct resources to building the education sector. Modalities for coordinating these contributions have been limited.

[6] The ESA attributes this to very low quality of education and poor teaching in schools, although conflict limits access to education, provision of materials and classrooms, as well as accuracy of data
[7] Somaliland Education Sector Analysis 2016

* Participation of private sector in expanding access to quality education was well articulated in the ESSP 2012-2016, however the maximum potential of private actors was not fully realized

Funding has almost doubled in the past 5 years, from USD 7.8M in 2012 to USD 14.6M in 2016. However, funding as proportion of the national budget has remained stagnated at around 7% (Table 3, below).

2.6 Teacher Workforce, Education and Remuneration

* The total number of teachers in primary school rose from 6,119 (16.1% female) in 2012/13 to 7,765 (14.2% female) in 2014/15
* The obvious trend is that the number teachers has been steadily increasing over time (by 27%), with proportionally greater increases in the number of male teachers compared to female teachers. Thus depicting a poor gender balance in the teaching force at primary level, which may limit equity in and access to support services for girls and women, and deprives girls of role models.
* Over 50% of primary teacher's qualifications are undefined, which brings to question the proportion of students who might be receiving substandard education, despite attending school.
* 64% of all teachers are stationed in urban schools compared to only 36% in rural areas. This suggest inequities in the distribution of education resources that aggravate existing patterns of social and economic exclusion.
* In 2014/15 the Ministry paid 66.4% of the free primary education teacher's salaries. It is not clear whether teacher salaries are dependent on qualification and/or workload, which creates risks for manipulation around teacher payment schemes.

2.7 Education Quality Indicators

* Primary school curriculum has been under development since the launch of the 2012-2016 ESSP. The curriculum framework has been completed and the MOEHS is currently working with partners to preview and finalize the syllabi. Two committees have been formed and are functional i.e. curriculum oversight and curriculum technical to oversee the curriculum transformation process.
* Pupil Book Ratio (PBR) (mathematics)
    - Primary schools – 0.43 (2014/15) a drop from 0.63 (2013/14)
* Internal efficiency of the school system – as depicted by promotion rate, repetition rate and dropout rate. These rates help to understand how the education system utilizes its resources and measure the efficiency of the education system in producing graduates of a particular education level, both between and between sub-sectors such as primary, secondary and higher education. These indicators have been promising considering reduced dropout rates from 10.8% to 3.6% between 2014 and 2015
    - Repetition – the average was 2% for the 2014/15 period, in which girls' repetition rate (2.2%) was higher than boys (1.9%) in all classes except in class 8, where the repetition was equal and lowest for both genders.

- Dropout – the largest proportion of dropouts occur in early grades (Grades 1-3)
- Promotion – the total primary promotion rate was 93.8%, and was lowest in Grades 1-2

* Pupil Classroom Ratio (PCR)
  - Primary school – decreased from 57 in 2011/12 to 46 in 2014/15
  - Secondary school – 41.7 pupils per classroom
* Pupil Book Ratio (PBR)
  - Primary school – it decreased from 1.5 in 2013/14 to 2.3 in 2014/15
  - Secondary school – data shows there is severe shortage of secondary textbooks in all subjects.

  Donors and implementing partners, such as UNICEF provide a large proportion of primary school supplies including textbooks for children in schools. 631,000 textbooks were distributed to 878 primary schools throughout Somaliland as of 2015.
* Gender Parity Index (GPI)
  - Primary school – 0.82 (2014/15) a rise from 0.81 (2013/14)
* Pupil Teacher Ratio (PTR)
  - Primary school – decreased from 32 in 2011/12 to 31 in 2014/15
  - Secondary school – 26.6 pupils per teacher

Considering the GPI value is still less than 1.0, it is evident that more boys than girls are attending primary school.

2.8 Special Education

Key Highlights

* The ESSP target was to have 6,000 children with special needs in school by 2016, the data shows that only 702 children with special needs were enrolled as of 2015.
* Through Horumarinta Elmiga, MOE identified 22 schools. Supporting 12 through provision of teaching and learning materials
* 27 teachers trained on Special Needs Education
* IAS also supporting schools by provision of assistive devices
* Available data shows children with special needs comprise less than 1% of the student population in primary schools. In secondary schools, 650 leaners with special needs were enrolled, representing 1.4% of those enrolled in the 2014-15 period. Of the latter, 76.9% were visually impaired, 19.8% had hearing impairment and the rest were physically challenged. This indicates that visual impairment is the biggest problem in special needs secondary schools.

Key challenges

* Lack of adequate specially trained teachers on SNE
* Lack of adapted curriculum for learners for SEN ϖ Lack standardised assessment and evaluation criteria for various groups of learners with SN
* Lack of proper monitoring and evaluation on SNE programmes ϖ Lack of proper coordination between MOEHS and service providers

* Lack of motivation for teachers supporting learners with SN in the mainstream schools. ϖ Negative attitudes towards learners with SEN
* Lack of adequate teaching/learning materials and assistive devices ϖ High cost of specialised materials and equipment for learners with SEN
* Lack of SNE language development for learners with hearing and visual impairment (deaf and blind)
* Difficulties to reach people with disabilities who live in geographically difficult areas.

2.9 Higher Education

Achievements

* Data from multiple INGO sources reveal that there are some 10,500 male and 4,900 female students in Somaliland enrolled across 17 institutions.
* Teaching staff/trainers are estimated 902 while non-teaching staff were 416
* The most popular courses are Business Administration, ICT, Science and Technology,=
* The Minimum Standards Framework finalized.
* Drafts of Higher Education Act for the Commission and Higher Education policy have been developed and incorporates into the Education policy.
* Construction of new facilities e.g. laboratories at Amoud University.
* The Ministry organized the 3rd Higher Education Institutes networking fair in July 2016. 5,000 students attended.
* In 2016 the Association of Arab universities carried out extensive visits to local private and public universities in Hargeisa, Berbera, Burao, and Borama
* 73 university students who scored better in secondary examinations are currently provided university scholarships.
* Project activities under Horumarinta Elmiga currently underway.

Challenges

* The Higher Education sector lacks critical and credible data regarding student enrolment, lecturers, qualifications and courses offered as the EMIS system does not cover this sub-sector
* The Higher Education sector is severely underfunded.
* Overlapping functions between Directorate and CHE.

2.10 The key successes of ESSP 2012-16 were identified as below:

* Free primary education has been implemented across the country.
* An increasing number of teachers are now paid for by the government
* An increase in the teaching force has meant the pupil teacher ratio (PTR) has been maintained
* A building program of class rooms has kept pace with the expansion in learner numbers
* The introduction of a new outcome based curriculum framework with syllabi but as yet without support learning materials
* There has been a significant improvement in the gender ratio with more girls attending school and performing better.

2.11 Key challenges to effective education provision

* Security still a major impediment to education provision
* Infrastructure targets, were not fully met in light of 2016 expectations
* Data quantity and quality remained a challenge with mention at the workshop on EMIS data was missing some key statistics. Hence, the MOEHS was advised to refer to the Puntland EMIS and derive additional indicators that can enrich the EMIS
* Minimal resources at primary schools for capital and operational costs
* Low capitation from Federal Government, considering the target of 10% was unmet
* Provision of education skewed to private actors has significant implications on access by the low income households. It was deemed that privatization of education was largely driven by the low quality delivery of public services, mostly attributable to low quality of teachers and low professional moral as well as poor infrastructure and equipment in public schools.
* Transition from primary to secondary is very low
* There is some improvement in examination pass rates at grade 8 and form 4.

2.12 Key shortfalls in delivery of ESSP 2012-2016 are as below:

* A reduction to near zero in the rate of growth of enrolment in Primary schools but continued growth in enrolment in secondary schools
* No significant improvement in the Net enrolment rate (NER).
* A decline in the quality of teachers represented by an increase in the ratio of unqualified teachers, with nearly 50% of teachers now not categorized as 'qualified'.
* A decline in the pupils book ratio (PBR) i.e. learning materials.
* No significant improvement in learning outcomes at primary level, with very low results in mathematics, but encouraging results in Somali literacy.
* Student's participation rates in the education system are still low, with more than 50% of children and youth being excluded from basic education

3 Recommendations from Joint Review of the Education Sector

Following the JRES discussions, the following are some of the observations made and the possible way forward

a. Considering the great financial commitment and mobilization of resources required to sustain and bolster achievements realized in the education sector, MOEHS should negotiate with the national government for additional allocation to the Ministry above the 7% of national budget.
b. In view of low domestic funding of the education sector, donors and implementing partners should consider funding functions around fragility related to improving sector management (particularly in relation to accountability and transparency initiatives) so as to maximize efficiencies with investments in the education sector.
c. To increase participation of vulnerable groups including learners with special needs, rural, nomadic and pastoralist communities in education, the government should prioritize its investments to supporting their children; aligning policy and strategy to actual needs and ensure inclusive and transparent planning and budget allocation.

d. MOEHS and its development partners to synergize their efforts to address gender parity in schools, both for learners and teachers. This considering that both GER and NER for girls is lagging behind that of boys in primary and secondary education, while there are significantly more male than female teachers.
e. To improve the quality of learning, teaching and learning materials need to be developed and distributed to schools since the PBRs in both primary and secondary schools are below parity.
f. In view of less than half of the teachers in both primary and secondary schools were certified, there is need to continue and expand teacher training programs so as to increase their qualification levels and as a result improve the quality of education.
g. To address teacher qualification and geographical distribution disparities, the Ministry should exploit the various incentives at its disposal, including financial benefits through 'hardship allowance' for teachers in hardship areas. Alternative certification strategies may be employed to recruit the right teachers, in high need areas so as to avoid forced relocation.
h. The newly developed curriculum framework should be rolled out into the schools, with relevant teacher training, production and distribution of learning materials undertaken. This will ensure the quality of education is improved and sustained.
i. MOEHS should lobby its development partners for unachieved ESSP 2012-2016 targets including infrastructural support and institutional strengthening of the MOEHS at the District and Regions, including finalization, enacting and implementation of relevant Policies and Acts and undertaking education sector analysis and developing of ESSP for 2017-2021 for aligning donor commitments.
j. Concerning ECE, the MOEHS should finalize the ECE policy framework to create overall coherence, ensure government oversight and quality assurance, paying particular attention to address supply-side barriers to ECE services. Similarly, the MOEHS should consider integrating aspects of ECE curriculum with Quranic education, as a measure towards extending pre-school competencies to a wide range of children in enhancing their readiness for formal schooling.
k. In view of the low GER (44%) and NER (33%) in primary schools, there is need to investigate the causes of poor enrolment, develop and adopt more evidence-based strategies, besides expansion of school feeding programs and construction of additional schools/classrooms in rural and marginalized communities.
l. MOEHS should improve the EMIS statistics for secondary schools, establish cause and effects of regional distribution and ownership, explore feasibility of boarding schools for improving access to vulnerable groups and agree on a realistic textbook policy as to what is an acceptable PBR, so as to improve access to and quality of secondary education.
m. On special needs education, the MOEHS with support from actors should design a strategy to cater for special needs students in terms of skilled delivery e.g. provision of braille-based learning materials, sign language facilities and a special more inclusive approach to the curriculum for students with learning disabilities
n. The government should act resolutely to push forward various overdue TVET reforms, notably the promulgation of the Qualification Framework, and the National Authority for TVET. These are pending pre-requisites for a convincing reform. In the same way, the MOEHS should ensure

the various private initiatives are aligned under the TVET policy with clear linkage of the training to employment

o. Higher education to be strengthened by supporting Commission for Higher Education, better equipping and furnishing university faculties and setting professional development program for faculty staff.

p. MOEHS should develop an EMIS policy for quality assurance and regulation and during the design phase of the incoming ESSP, ensure that indicators, targets and means of verification are realistic and achievable and logically tied to sector objectives. Further, the MOEHS should either improve or replace the PINEAPPLES system and train staff to improve their IT/data skills.

q. The follow on ESSP (2017-2021) should be well prioritized and costed with clearly spelled out activities for development partners (donors and agencies) to align their assistance to government priorities. To reinforce this, the MOEHS should improve its financial management and accountability systems as well as a monitoring framework that will enable tracking of achievements and milestones.

4 References

- EMIS 2014/2015
- JRES 2015 Aide Memoire
- JRES 2015 Synthesis Report
- Draft Annual Action Plan 2015 to 2016
- Education Sector Analysis Report, 2016
- ESSP 2012 – 2016 for Somaliland
- UNFPA Population Estimate Survey
- Program progress presentations by implementing partners
- Data from meetings with MOEHS Directorates
- Data from Implementing Partners

5 Annexes

Annex I	:	JRES Terms of Reference
Annex II	:	JRES Workshop Program
Annex III	:	List of JRES Workshop Participants
Annex IV	:	JRES Synthesis Workshop Presentation
Annex V	:	JRES Consultant Field Visits Schedule