

Document of  
**The World Bank**

**FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY**

Report No: PAD3785

INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT ASSOCIATION

PROJECT PAPER

ON A

PROPOSED ADDITIONAL GRANT

IN THE AMOUNT OF US\$7.16 MILLION

TO THE

REPUBLIC OF THE GAMBIA

FOR AN

EDUCATION SECTOR SUPPORT PROGRAM ADDITIONAL FINANCING  
{RVP CLEARANCE DATE}

Education Global Practice  
Africa Region

This document has a restricted distribution and may be used by recipients only in the performance of their official duties. Its contents may not otherwise be disclosed without World Bank authorization.

## CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS

(Exchange Rate Effective {, 2020})

Currency Unit =

---

= US\$1

---

US\$ = SDR 1

## FISCAL YEAR

January 1 - December 31

Regional Vice President: Ousmane Diagana

Country Director: Nathan M. Belete

Regional Director: Dena Ringold

Practice Manager: Meskerem Mulatu

Task Team Leader(s): Alison Marie Grimsland

## ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

AF	Additional Financing
E&S	Environmental and Social
ECD	Early Childhood Development
ECF	Extended Credit Facility
EFA-FTI	Education For All – Fast Track Initiative
EGRA	Early Grade Reading Assessment
EMIS	Education Management Information System
ESMP	Environmental and Social Management Plan
ESCP	Environmental and Social Commitment Plan
ESF	Environmental and Social Framework
ESSP	Education Sector Support Program
FCS	Fragile and Conflict Affected State
GBV	Gender Based Violence
GER	Gross Enrollment Rate
GPI	Gender Parity Index
GRM	Grievance Redress Mechanism
GRS	Grievance Redress Service
LBS	Lower Basic School
LEG	Local Education Group
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MICS	Multiple Indicator Cluster Surveys
MoBSE	Ministry of Basic and Secondary Education
NAT	National Assessment Test
NDP	National Development Plan
NER	Net Enrollment Rate
PCU	Project Coordination Unit
PDO	Project Development Objective
RCF	Rapid Credit Facility
RED	Regional Education Directorate
SEA	Sexual Exploitation and Abuse
SEP	Stakeholder Engagement Plan
SH	Sexual Harassment
SMP	Staff Monitored Program
SOE	State Owned Enterprise
TSA	Treasury Single Account
UBS	Upper Basic School
WFP	World Food Programme
WHO	World Health Organization
VAC	Violence Against Children



**BASIC INFORMATION – PARENT (The Gambia - Education Sector Support Program - P162890)**

Country	Product Line	Team Leader(s)		
Gambia, The	IBRD/IDA	Alison Marie Grimsland		
Project ID	Financing Instrument	Resp CC	Req CC	Practice Area (Lead)
P162890	Investment Project Financing	HAWE2 (9250)	AWCF1 (6550)	Education

Implementing Agency: The Ministry of Basic and Secondary Education (MoBSE), The Ministry of Higher Education, Research, Science and Technology

Is this a regionally tagged project?	
No	

Bank/IFC Collaboration
No

Approval Date	Closing Date	Expected Guarantee Expiration Date	Original Environmental Assessment Category	Current EA Category
28-Mar-2018	31-Dec-2022		Partial Assessment (B)	Partial Assessment (B)

**Financing & Implementation Modalities**

<input type="checkbox"/> Multiphase Programmatic Approach [MPA]	<input type="checkbox"/> Contingent Emergency Response Component (CERC)
<input type="checkbox"/> Series of Projects (SOP)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Fragile State(s)
<input type="checkbox"/> Performance-Based Conditions (PBCs)	<input type="checkbox"/> Small State(s)
<input type="checkbox"/> Financial Intermediaries (FI)	<input type="checkbox"/> Fragile within a Non-fragile Country
<input type="checkbox"/> Project-Based Guarantee	<input type="checkbox"/> Conflict
<input type="checkbox"/> Deferred Drawdown	<input type="checkbox"/> Responding to Natural or Man-made disaster
<input type="checkbox"/> Alternate Procurement Arrangements (APA)	<input type="checkbox"/> Hands-on, Enhanced Implementation Support (HEIS)



**Development Objective(s)**

To increase access to early childhood development and basic education and improve quality of teaching and learning.

**Ratings (from Parent ISR)**

	Implementation					Latest ISR
	22-Jun-2018	10-Jan-2019	04-Jun-2019	25-Dec-2019	09-Apr-2020	02-Nov-2020
Progress towards achievement of PDO	S	S	S	S	S	MS
Overall Implementation Progress (IP)	S	S	S	S	S	MS
Overall Safeguards Rating	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS	MS
Overall Risk	S	S	S	S	S	S
Financial Management	S	S	MS	MU	MS	MS
Project Management	S	S	S	MS	MS	MS
Procurement	S	S	S	MS	S	MS
Monitoring and Evaluation	S	S	S	S	S	S

**BASIC INFORMATION – ADDITIONAL FINANCING (The Gambia - Education Sector Support Program Additional Financing - P173332)**

Project ID	Project Name	Additional Financing Type	Urgent Need or Capacity Constraints
P173332	The Gambia - Education	Restructuring, Scale Up	No



	Sector Support Program Additional Financing		
Financing instrument	Product line	Approval Date	
Investment Project Financing	Recipient Executed Activities	15-Jan-2021	
Projected Date of Full Disbursement	Bank/IFC Collaboration		
17-May-2023	No		
Is this a regionally tagged project?			
No			

**Financing & Implementation Modalities**

<input type="checkbox"/> Series of Projects (SOP)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Fragile State(s)
<input type="checkbox"/> Performance-Based Conditions (PBCs)	<input type="checkbox"/> Small State(s)
<input type="checkbox"/> Financial Intermediaries (FI)	<input type="checkbox"/> Fragile within a Non-fragile Country
<input type="checkbox"/> Project-Based Guarantee	<input type="checkbox"/> Conflict
<input type="checkbox"/> Deferred Drawdown	<input type="checkbox"/> Responding to Natural or Man-made disaster
<input type="checkbox"/> Alternate Procurement Arrangements (APA)	<input type="checkbox"/> Hands-on, Enhanced Implementation Support (HEIS)
<input type="checkbox"/> Contingent Emergency Response Component (CERC)	

**Disbursement Summary (from Parent ISR)**

Source of Funds	Net Commitments	Total Disbursed	Remaining Balance	Disbursed
IBRD				%
IDA	30.00	13.95	15.06	48 %
Grants	5.00	5.00		100 %

**PROJECT FINANCING DATA – ADDITIONAL FINANCING (The Gambia - Education Sector Support Program Additional Financing - P173332)**

**FINANCING DATA (US\$, Millions)**



**SUMMARY (Total Financing)**

	Current Financing	Proposed Additional Financing	Total Proposed Financing
<b>Total Project Cost</b>	35.00	7.16	42.16
<b>Total Financing</b>	35.00	7.16	42.16
<b>Financing Gap</b>	0.00	0.00	0.00

**DETAILS - Additional Financing**

**Non-World Bank Group Financing**

Trust Funds		7.16
EFA-FTI Education Program Development Fund		7.16

**COMPLIANCE**

**Policy**

Does the project depart from the CPF in content or in other significant respects?

Yes  No

Does the project require any other Policy waiver(s)?

Yes  No

**INSTITUTIONAL DATA**

**Practice Area (Lead)**

Education

**Contributing Practice Areas**

**PROJECT TEAM****Bank Staff**

<b>Name</b>	<b>Role</b>	<b>Specialization</b>	<b>Unit</b>
Alison Marie Grimsland	Team Leader (ADM Responsible)	Education	Hawe2
Laurent Mehdi Brito	Procurement Specialist (ADM Responsible)		EAWRU
Fatou Mbacke Dieng	Financial Management Specialist (ADM Responsible)	FM	EAWG1
Gina Cosentino	Social Specialist (ADM Responsible)	Safeguards	SAWS4
Sophie Lo Diop	Environmental Specialist (ADM Responsible)		SAWE1
Anta Tall Diallo	Procurement Team		AWCF1
Bintou Sogodogo	Team Member		Hawe2
Dilip Kumar Prusty Chinari	Team Member	Disbursement	WFACS
Khady Fall Lo	Team Member		Hawe2
Lalaina Noelinirina Rasoloharison	Team Member	Team assistant	HECED
Ryoko Tomita	Team Member		HEAED
Sachiko Morita	Counsel	Legal	LEGEN

**Extended Team**

<b>Name</b>	<b>Title</b>	<b>Organization</b>	<b>Location</b>
-------------	--------------	---------------------	-----------------





GAMBIA, THE

EDUCATION SECTOR SUPPORT PROGRAM ADDITIONAL FINANCING

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

<b>I. BACKGROUND AND RATIONALE FOR ADDITIONAL FINANCING .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>II. DESCRIPTION OF ADDITIONAL FINANCING .....</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>III. KEY RISKS .....</b>	<b>19</b>
<b>IV. APPRAISAL SUMMARY .....</b>	<b>20</b>
<b>V. WORLD BANK GRIEVANCE REDRESS .....</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>VI. SUMMARY TABLE OF CHANGES .....</b>	<b>ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.</b>
<b>VII. DETAILED CHANGE(S).....</b>	<b>ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.</b>
<b>VIII. RESULTS FRAMEWORK AND MONITORING .....</b>	<b>28</b>



## I. BACKGROUND AND RATIONALE FOR ADDITIONAL FINANCING

### A. Introduction

1. This project paper seeks the approval of the Regional Vice President to: (i) provide an Additional Financing (AF) in the amount of US\$7.2 million to The Gambia Education Sector Support Program (ESSP-P162890) through the Global Partnership for Education (GPE); and (ii) restructure the original project to allow for minor changes to the results framework. The additional US\$7.2 million in traditional investment project financing includes what GPE defines as US\$5 million in multiplier funds<sup>1</sup>, and an additional US\$2.2 million in additional financing. The original project, financed jointly by the International Development Association (IDA) (US\$30 million), and GPE (US\$5 million), was approved on March 28, 2018 and has been effective since August 31, 2018. The project is expected to close on December 31, 2022 as originally planned and is being implemented by the Ministry of Basic and Secondary Education (MoBSE).

2. The project development objective (PDO) is to increase access to early childhood development (ECD) and basic education, and improve the quality of teaching and learning. It has three components which have been progressing well, as confirmed during the Mid-Term Review (MTR) completed in July 2020 and the subsequent implementation status report (ISR) archived in October 2020. These include: Component 1: Enhancing Access to ECD and Basic Education; Component 2: Improving Quality of Teaching and Learning; and Component 3: Technical and Institutional Support. The proposed AF is a unique opportunity to capitalize upon the roadmap for pre-service and in-service teacher training reforms<sup>2</sup> developed under the original project for long lasting sustainable reforms to increase teacher effectiveness.

3. The majority of funding will go toward overhauling pre-service and in-service teacher training, with a smaller set of funds set aside for enhancing the performance management system (PMS) of teachers, improving technology capacity, and expanding the activities under the parent project. The project is complementary to the Emergency Education Sector COVID-19 Response Project (P174035) which was approved on July 20, 2020 and became immediately effective. The project, funded by GPE in the amount of US\$3.46 million with the World Bank as the grant agent, focuses on more immediate COVID-19 response, relief, and resilience efforts such as immediate food distribution, provision of materials to support distance learning, and support for healthy reopening of schools and accelerated learning programs. Conversely, the AF focuses on critical changes to teacher training reform as part of longer-term systemic improvements, as well as additional initiatives to improve access and quality of teaching already under way. Throughout project preparation special attention has been paid toward modalities of implementation support which are effective even with limited travel options, and contribute toward a more technology-enabled sector. These include carefully pairing international

---

<sup>1</sup> The GPE Multiplier is a financing instrument in which eligible countries access the GPE Multiplier by mobilizing at least US\$3 in new and additional external financing for every US\$1 from the Multiplier. The Gambia has mobilized external financing through a philanthropic organization, mainly focused on school construction. The additional financing is complementary to these investments.

<sup>2</sup> The Comprehensive Pre-Service and In-Service Strategic Framework for Teacher Education and Implementation Plan details reforms at the pre-service and in-service training levels which focus on a continuum of improved teacher preparation and professional development training. The reforms focus on revitalizing The Gambia College, subjects and building the capacity of the INSET unit, with a particular focus on strengthening pedagogical knowledge and instruction of core.



and local technical assistance (TA), and prioritizing funds for enhanced video conferencing capabilities to allow for capacity building through virtually-enabled learning and training.

### Country and Sectoral Context

4. **The Gambia, like other countries in the region and beyond, is seeking to mitigate the negative impacts of the COVID-19 pandemic on the education system, while continuing to move forward with their Education Sector Strategic Plan, 2018-2030.** In terms of immediate challenges, school closures which began in late March and ended in late October 2020, have led to many lost days of schooling, disrupted examinations, and are expected to increase dropout risks, and vulnerability of at risk populations. The Government is currently working to respond to these immediate challenges through the implementation of their Coronavirus Response Plan under the auspices of the MoBSE. This emergency education strategy is anchored to the broader National Response Plan under the leadership of the Ministry of Health and complementary to the sector strategic plan. At the same time, the Government is committed to continuing to implement the medium and long term reforms and sustainability measures of the broader sector strategy, which consists of five main program areas: (i) access and equity; (ii) quality and relevance; (iii) research and development; (iv) science, technology and innovation; and (v) sector management. The additional financing primarily supports results areas in program areas (i), (ii), and (v) through strategic interventions to increase access, improve relevance, and cross cutting system improvements in curriculum and teacher management/training.

5. **Although at this stage it is not possible to predict the total number of children who will return to school upon reopening—which began at the end of October—enrollment had been increasing in The Gambia prior to the crisis.** The gross enrollment rate (GER) increased from 2013 to 2019 at all levels of education (Education Management Information System, EMIS); in ECD from 36.5 percent to 54.6 percent; in Lower Basic Schools (LBS) from 92.8 percent to 117.9 percent; in Upper Basic Schools (UBS) from 68.1 percent to 70.4 percent; and in Senior Secondary Schools (SSS) from 39.0 percent to 49.6 percent. Although the primary completion rate increased from 73.6 in 2010 to 88.2 in 2019, the UBS completion rate has stagnated over the last 10 years (59.5 percent in 2010 and 59.0 percent in 2019).

6. **Although universal primary completion has not been achieved, enrollment targets for girls have been met at all levels of education.** The “traditional” gender disparities have been eliminated from ECD to senior secondary schools, however the post-secondary education level was still lagging at 69 percent in 2015. Girls registered a higher GER and net enrollment rate (NER) at ECD, basic and secondary levels, as well as higher completion rates at lower and upper basic levels. Boys’ slightly lower enrollment rates at primary level may be due to higher enrollments of boys in Majalis or Koranic centers which are not included in the official school count figure. Under the ESSP project, an initiative in region 5 targets out-of-school children, many of whom are enrolled in Majalis. Prior to the COVID-19 crisis, the initiative was showing promising results prior in terms of increased enrollments in public schools, and is relaunching in tandem with the reenrollment campaign as schools reopen to hopefully increase the number of school age students who newly enroll and reenroll in school.

7. **Regional disparities in access to education are evidenced by variations in the GER.** As an example, prior to school closures, out of the 6 administrative regions, Region 2, close to Banjul, had the highest GER in ECD (65.8 percent) and in UBS (77.5 percent) while Region 5, a remote region, registered the lowest GER in both ECD (29.2 percent) and LBS (78.1 percent). Region 6 also had low enrollment rates, particularly at upper basic level (37.4 percent) (EMIS, 2019). The Government has been targeting interventions in these regions to mitigate



socio-cultural and financial barriers that may negatively impact enrollment and completion rates, and it is possible these communities may be hardest hit in a COVID-19-driven economic downturn given job insecurity and lower access to health services within these respective regions. A projection model from the World Bank estimates that an additional 1,700 students may not return to school. In addition to the access initiatives under the ESSP, including school expansion, transportation support, and the Region 5 initiative, under the aforementioned GPE financed COVID-19 project a major re-enrollment campaign is being supported, including targeting messaging for girls which may be at higher risk of not returning. The EMIS exercise to be completed in January 2021, with results in May 2021, will reveal whether there are significant downturns in school enrollment due to the crisis.

8. **Improving learning outcomes has been a significant challenge.** For example, although EGRA data from 2007 to 2016 shows significant improvements in knowledge of letter sounds and word recognition, reading comprehension remains low. The 2016 EGRA showed that only one out of five (20 percent) reading comprehension questions are answered correctly. Additionally, the National Assessment Test (NAT) is conducted bi-annually in grades 3 and 5 and annually in grade 8. Although low, the scores, have shown some improvements over time. The test items of 2012 and 2017 NAT grade 3 and grade 8 and those of 2012 and 2016 grade 5 NAT were linked so that the scores of these years would be comparable. The average scores of both English and mathematics of all three grades have improved, as shown in Table 1. Despite these gains, the extended school closure may lead to learning losses. Approaches to rapid assessment upon school reopening are under development under the aforementioned GPE financed COVID-19 project to assess learning loss, and adapt remediation programs as needed.

**Table 1. Average scores of National Assessment Tests of Grades 3, 5, and 8 in 2012 and 2016/17 (Common items only)**

	2012	2016/2017
G3 English	45.8	53.2
G3 Math	39.0	44.6
G5 English	47.3	56.1
G5 Math	47.6	53.4
G8 English	47.3	58.4
G8 Math	43.9	49.8

*Source: National Assessment Test. Scores are all statistically significant*

9. **The Gambia College School of Education (teacher training college) is responsible for training primary school teachers and is the main provider of pre-service teacher training in The Gambia.** However, the quality of pre-service teacher training is low and creates considerable challenges once teachers are in the system given that they are poorly prepared for the classroom and often lack even basic minimum competencies in mathematics and English. Preliminary results from the recently piloted Teacher Competency Test underscore this concern. Although there have been efforts in the past to increase the caliber of students enrolling in teacher training centers for lower basic teachers, teacher competency upon completion of the program still remains low, which suggests systemic issues within Gambia College. In addition to limited institutional capacity, lecturers often have no experience teaching in lower basic settings, the content does not sufficiently focus on relevant subject content knowledge and pedagogic skills, and school management capacity is still limited.



10. **Under the current project an institutional audit is being undertaken to document the current situation in Gambia College**, including its infrastructure, organizational structure, staff, and administration, to make recommendations which will inform the details of the AF areas of intervention. Preliminary results show that that the: (i) the institution is understaffed, with a student to full-time lecturer ratio of 107.5:1, which results in core course requirements which necessitate teaching groups of 300 or more students at once; (ii) less than 1 percent of entering students meet the minimum requirements of required WASSCE English and mathematics credits, and it is not tracked whether they make up these credits during their course of study when given conditional admission; (iii) lecturer qualifications are uneven, and there are notably no staff employed to teach courses in national languages despite the ministry policy, and only one special education teacher. Further, capacity to teach coursework focused in curriculum, assessment, and evaluation appears to be extremely limited, with no corresponding qualifications demonstrated. Lastly, (iv) technology use within the Gambia College is extremely poor, and the physical audit showed faulty electrical wiring and other issues which impact operations of the institution.

11. **The project is well-aligned to the Country Engagement Note (CEN) for the period 2018-2021, and the Systematic Country Diagnostic (SCD) 2020.** The project is particularly aligned to Country Engagement Note objective 2: invest in human capital and build assets and resilience for the poor. The project supports development of human capital by improving teacher effectiveness in the classroom, and providing better access for the most vulnerable student populations to education, including especially, girls, children from poor rural households, and children with disabilities. In addition, the initiatives to improve the access to and quality of education directly align with the SCD priority to enhance primary and secondary education as part of the main objective to build human capital. The SCD which was completed in May 2020 will inform the forthcoming Country Partnership Framework (CPF) 2021.

## B. Current Project Performance

12. The project has an overall disbursement rate of 51 percent, comprised of 100 percent disbursement of the GPE grant (US\$5 million, TF-A7053), and 42 percent of the IDA grant (US\$30 million, IDA-D2800). There is positive progress in each component, despite the challenges posed by the COVID-19 pandemic. Progress toward achieving all PDO level indicator targets are also progressing well and the project is currently rated moderately satisfactory. However, the previous school closures, inability to carry out national testing for the 2019/2020 academic year, as well as uncertainty regarding how long it will take the COVID-19 virus to recede, warrant a more conservative learning achievement target as detailed under the results framework section. A summary of project performance by component is provided below.

13. **Component 1. Enhancing Access to ECD and Basic Education** (US\$9.7 million; of which US\$7.7 million IDA and US\$2.0 million GPE) is advancing. The component finances a set of interventions aimed at increasing access to early and basic education, particularly for vulnerable populations, using a blend of supply and demand side initiatives. Activities include: the construction of Early Childhood Education (ECD) and Lower Basic School (LBS) classrooms; school transportation; identification of special needs children; targeted incentives for enrollment in Region 5; support to the provision of foundational skills in koranic schools; and development of a targeted second change education program.

### *Sub-Component 1.1 Expanding the network of basic and ECD classrooms*



14. Construction is expected to begin in December 2020 and is based on a contract between the Ministry of Basic and Secondary Education (MoBSE) and Future in Our Hands (FIOH) who will construct classrooms based on a performance-based 18-month implementation schedule. Transportation is well under way via the innovative donkey cart approach and the project has benefitted from a 21 percent price reduction in fabrication due to the scale up. Finally, the screening tool for better identification of children with special needs has been developed, piloted and finalized with training and data collection has begun this November, given that schools have reopened.

*Sub-component 1.2 Expanding Opportunities and Access for out-of-school children*

15. The second chance education program called Gambia School of Open Learning (GAMSOL) started in May 2019, and, up until the school closures, participants were enrolled across 6 regions in 38 centers, with increasing interest from other donors who provide, for example, training on entrepreneurship education and bikes for participants to travel to the centers. The program is expected to restart once COVID-19 restrictions are lifted by late November or early December. The Region 5 out-of-school children initiative which targets 7 districts (out of a total of 11) was rolled out in the first two districts, and will be followed with the remaining 5 districts shortly following school reopening. Support to Koranic centers is being informed by a baseline survey which identified 2,798 Koranic centers hosting over 147,000 students in the country, 36 percent of whom are not attending any other form of school. The findings of the survey are being used to develop a new model for support to the centers to introduce foundational reading and numeracy skills to these children who are considered out of school.

16. **Component 2. Improving Quality of Teaching and Learning** (US\$18.0 million; of which US\$15 million IDA and US\$3 million GPE) is progressing. The component aims to improve quality of teaching and learning through the: (i) sequenced revision of curriculum for ECD through Grade 9; (ii) development of a coherent framework for teacher training; and (iii) support to system for effective teacher recruitment and deployment.

*Sub-component 2.1 Curriculum Revision and Implementation*

17. The curriculum revision is making progress. The revised curriculum framework was shared in a stakeholder review workshop in late November/Early December 2019, and feedback from subject experts is being integrated into the framework, with technical assistance support expected to begin in November 2020.

*Sub-component 2.2 Improved Teacher Training and Professional Development*

18. The Teacher Professional Development (TPD) framework and 5-year action plan have been developed to guide a holistic approach to in-service and pre-service teacher training. The framework views teacher education as a continuum and is underpinned by a newly developed Teacher Professional Development Index of Competences (TPDIC). In addition, the first ever Gambia Teacher competency test was piloted in August 2020 for graduating teachers from Gambia College, which provides a basis for identifying areas needing further improvement, and recommendations on how to make the selection process for future cycles more robust. Finally, the Gambia READS early reading program underwent monitoring (including 600 teachers and 1500 pupils) the results of which will inform training planning over the next few months.

*Sub-component 2.3 Teacher Recruitment and Deployment*



19. Activities financed under sub-component 2.3 are also moving forward, including strategic planning activities to more closely link supply and demand of teachers within the country. The Government has agreed that MoBSE will annually provide the number of new teachers they need in each subject area and the only those number of students will be sponsored by MoBSE and guaranteed to obtain a teaching position after the graduation from Gambia College.

20. **Component 3. Technical and Institutional Support (US\$7.3 million; of which US\$7.3 million IDA)** activities are also progressing with a focus on assessment of learning outcomes, improving data collection and management, as well as communications.

*Sub-Component 3.1 Strengthening Capacity for Data Driven Decision Making*

21. Data management and assessment activities are progressing, although there have been some implementation delays. Data collection for the service delivery indicators (SDI) exercise to evaluate service delivery in primary schools has begun in November 2020 and given that data collection started a few weeks after school reopening, the survey instrument incorporates in COVID-19 specific questions. The Assessment Unit has also been undertaking NAT reporting and analysis. However, the EGRA assessment originally planned for May 2020, and the annual NAT were not held this academic year due to school closures. The assessments will be carried out prior to project close, either in May 2021, or May 2022. Lastly, in support of an integrated Education Management Information System (EMIS) between the Ministries of Basic and Secondary Education (MoBSE) and Higher Education (MoHERST), a National EMIS Technical Team (NETT) was established and a roadmap was developed to guide the integration, and unique student identifications are being developed.

*Sub-component 3.2 Implementation of Communication Strategy*

22. A Communications Unit under the Science and Technology Directorate has been established to support clear information sharing on education initiatives within the country and will begin moving forward with implementing the previously approved strategy. With support from the MRC Holland Foundation, the unit is also developing content for a new national TV channel which features educational programming. The establishment of a communications strategy and team is, and will remain, critical to COVID-19 response efforts, including school reopening, continued enrollment, and remediation efforts.

**C. Rationale for Additional Financing**

23. **The Gambia is eligible for critical additional funds through the GPE.** Based on increased country allocations, and eligibility for multiplier funds due to additional investments from the private education sector foundation from the Netherlands, The Gambia has become eligible for an additional US\$7.2 million. This Dutch charitable donor, the MRC Holland Foundation is focusing on expanding the network of lower basic schools, and other hard inputs such as technology inputs, science labs, internet connectivity, and renovations, throughout The Gambia, particularly in rural areas. These additional multiplier funds would allow the World Bank to scale up complementary efforts, which are aimed at improving the teaching practices of the current stock and future pipeline of teachers, so that both newly built and current schools would benefit from higher quality teaching. The proposed project also supports critical videoconferencing capabilities which build upon the donor's



charitable efforts to further extend internet connectivity throughout the country.<sup>3</sup>

24. **The additional funding is a unique opportunity to scale-up and optimize teacher training reform for improved teacher quality, by leveraging the findings of teacher training strategic planning activities under the Parent Project.** The *Comprehensive Pre-Service and In-Service Strategic Framework and Implementation Plan*, as well as The Gambia College curriculum review, both of which have been completed under the original financing, have revealed weaknesses in teacher training which results in a supply of a low-quality teachers. This analytical work and review also identified key reforms to improve the pedagogical content knowledge of teachers at each stage of their career. Teacher pre-service training reform is a high impact, sustainable initiative which would contribute positively toward the project's objective of improving teaching and learning and builds upon the momentum already generated by the analytical work, and intensive policy dialogue. At the same time, high quality teaching is even more critical in the face of the learning losses due to the COVID-19 pandemic. The approach builds on best practices in teacher education which underline the importance of: (a) providing practical training which includes specific subject specific pedagogical techniques rather than general pedagogical training; (b) accompanying targeted and repeated training with follow up coaching; and (c) treating teacher education as a career-long development process with a clear link between pre-service and in-service teacher training.

25. **The Government is committed to the reform agenda and there is a high level of readiness to implement the proposed activities.** By utilizing additional GPE financing linked to the original grant, and building upon the evidence under the parent project, the World Bank can move quickly to provide support to the teacher training reform efforts. Because the ESSP has laid the groundwork to develop a strategic framework and coherent policy for pre-service and in-service teacher training, including a revision of the Gambia College curriculum and competences framework, the gaps, including organizational challenges and pedagogical weaknesses are clear. As such, the AF will support the first two years of the critical reforms to introduce a coherent, consistent, strategic and sustainable approach to transforming teacher education in The Gambia, thus improving the overall quality of the teaching profession.

26. **The AF will contribute to the goals stated in the GPE's Strategic Plan (2016-2020)** of: (i) improved and more equitable learning outcomes; (ii) increased equity, gender equality and inclusion; and (iii) effective and efficient education systems. The AF will aim to improve learning outcomes through systematic improvements to teacher training, including in the vulnerable communities supported by MRC Holland, and improve the education system through strategic management, training, and deployment of teachers.

## II. DESCRIPTION OF ADDITIONAL FINANCING

27. **The proposed changes are consistent with the existing PDO.** In addition to the proposed changes by component which are elaborated below, additional intermediate indicators will be added to the Results Framework to capture the targets related to the teacher training reform and enhanced pre-service and in-

---

<sup>3</sup> MRC Holland Foundation has also requested complementary support to build the transportation capacity of MoBSE for improved delivery and storage of critical building materials, equipment, learning materials and furniture. As a result some unused funding within the ESSP original financing will be allocated toward building two storage spaces (likely regions 5 and 1) and procuring two vehicles to improve storage capacity.





service teacher training. There will also be some small adjustments to the original results framework, to take into account the school closures due to the pandemic. There are no proposed changes to the PDO or safeguards category under the additional financing and implementation arrangements will remain the same.

**28. Component 1. Enhancing Access to ECD and Basic Education** – Proposed total amount US\$10.679 million; Original Grant US\$9.7 million; Proposed Additional Financing US\$.979 million (of which US\$0 IDA and US\$.979 million GPE).

*Sub-Component 1.2 Expanding Opportunities and Access for out-of-school children* – Proposed total amount US\$6.079 million; Original Grant US\$5.1 million; Proposed Additional Financing US\$.979 million from GPE.

29. Some additional funding will be added to sub-component 1.2 to continue efforts aimed at providing educational services to school aged students who are not currently in schools. This includes support to the model for Koranic centers (Majalis) to deliver foundational skills across more centers and builds upon the results of the earlier referenced survey of Majalis completed under the current project. The previously referenced GAMSOL second chance program will also receive additional funding to provide expanded support to students who have dropped out of the system, and explore an option for school age youth who are illiterate. Both are even more critical than before given the expected impacts from the previous school closures due to COVID-19. In addition, funding will go towards disability inclusion efforts well underway, including accessibility adaptations for latrines, training for newly recruited itinerant teachers, and a small number of learning aids not previously budgeted for. The work builds on a three-pronged approach to improving disability inclusion in The Gambia developed under the current project which focuses on: (i) identifying students with special needs through classroom level screening; (ii) linking screening results with adaptive devices to support student access and learning; and (iii) providing sensitization and training for education personnel, school directors, and teachers to support disability inclusion.

**30. Component 2. Improving Quality of Teaching and Learning** - Proposed total amount US\$22.045 million; Original Grant US\$18.0 million; Proposed Additional Financing US\$4.405 million (of which US\$0 IDA and US\$4.045 million GPE).

*Sub-Component 2.1 Curriculum Revision and Implementation* – Proposed total amount US\$6.86 million; Original Grant US\$6.6 million; Proposed Additional Financing US\$.260 million from GPE.

31. Initially, the project aimed to complete curriculum revision for ECD, lower basic and upper basic schools with a particular focus on English, science, and mathematics and to print textbooks based on these revisions during the project timeline. However, during the MTR, the scope was found to be too expansive given the large number of subjects targeted across all grades. As such, a reprint of textbooks will be supported immediately to ensure textbooks are distributed to schools during the life of the project, and curricular updates to textbooks will be taken into account for the subsequent round of textbook printing (after project close). A small amount of funding will also be added under the AF to move forward with additional revisions based on a review of the framework and pilot testing of the curriculum.

*Sub-component 2.2 Improved Teacher Training and Professional Development* - Proposed total amount US\$10.551 million; Original Grant US\$7.2 million; Proposed Additional Financing US\$3.351 million from GPE.



32. Funding would be added to sub-component 2.2 to support activities to further enhance teacher quality. The objective is to improve the quality of teachers through interventions in pre-service and in-service teacher education, the introduction of a formalized teacher induction system, and quality assurance measures. These reforms are grounded in the *Comprehensive Pre-Service and In-Service Strategic Framework and Implementation Plan* and *Gambia Teacher Competency Framework* that were financed under the original grant. The reform is expected to have a profound impact on the quality of teachers in The Gambia, by bringing significant and lasting improvements to the teacher training system based on best practices in teacher education, adapted for The Gambia.

33. **Years 1 and 2 of the implementation plan, the most critical for the training reform, will be supported with the additional financing.** This would include: (i) strengthening pre-service teacher training at Gambia College; (ii) improving teacher readiness through an improved student-teacher supervision program and introduction of a formal teacher induction program aimed at newly qualified teachers; and (iii) upgrading skills and competencies of current teachers through reform of in-service education and training (INSET). These areas of support are further described below.

34. **Focus Area 1. Strengthening pre-service teacher education in Gambia College (GC)**<sup>4</sup>. Currently, the stock of teachers exiting Gambia College has been shown to have weaknesses in both content knowledge and pedagogy. This is due in part to low qualifications of entering student teachers<sup>5</sup>, but also due to: (i) limited capacity of teacher educators within GC; and (ii) a curriculum which does not support building competency in pedagogy and subject areas at the right level for LBS. Teacher educators of student teachers who will go on to become LBS teachers often have limited to no experience teaching at the lower basic level, and so there are limited examples for student teachers of practical approaches to teaching reading, writing, and numeracy for lower basic students. Other subject areas taught within GC, for example, early childhood education, special needs education, and national languages also have limited qualified staff and will receive support.

35. To address this, following finalization of an institutional audit of GC (physical and organizational) under the current project, the additional financing will support:

- a. **Basic Content Knowledge:** Introduction of intensive teaching of lower basic level English and Mathematics courses will be introduced as part of the curriculum for students enrolled in the diploma program. This is intended to ensure that these students have mastery of the relevant content and have been exposed to good practice in the teaching of this content. This will require secondment of experienced teachers to the Gambia College as trainers, and long-term TA to work with these trainers to develop and teach the modules and build capacity of the trainers.
- b. **Staff and Management Capacity.** In addition to building capacity in English and Mathematics through the initiative above, capacity of teaching staff at Gambia College will be enhanced through: (i) secondment of experienced teachers to Gambia College to work as trainers in areas of shortage; and (ii) long-term TA and capacity building aligned with the introduction of the competency framework to help develop and train the trainers in key subject areas. Management will receive training on institutional management, human resources, data management, and budgeting.

<sup>4</sup> The organizational reforms are expected to benefit both Brikama and Basse campuses.

<sup>5</sup> Over 90 percent of entering student teachers do not have credits in both English and Math of West African Senior School Certificate Examination at entry, and the testing of recent graduates found that over 60 percent did not have sufficient content knowledge in lower basic school (LBS) level English grammar.



- c. **Rehabilitation.** A small percentage of funding will go towards minor infrastructure and hardware enhancement at Gambia College based on the audit, including adequately equipping the college. This would include video conferencing facilities to support virtual trainings and technical assistance support.

36. Technical assistance to the Gambia College is expected to begin as soon as the project is approved and will be in the form of international experts coupled with local expertise, likely via an NGO. The TA is expected to last for a duration of one and half to two years. The approach would include a scaffolded approach to capacity building in which select teacher educators are paired with highly qualified teacher trainers who support development *and* the delivery of select courses, with progressive handover to their counterparts within Gambia College.

37. **Focus Area 2. Improving Teacher Readiness.** Quality support to student teachers in the classroom, as well as newly qualified teachers would be introduced to improve teacher classroom readiness. This will help to ease the transition from student teacher to newly qualified teacher and is aimed at providing enhanced support for beginning teachers as they gain experience teaching and honing their pedagogical skills in the classroom. This focus area would include two core activities: (i) enhanced supervision of student teachers; and (ii) introduction of a formal teacher induction system which ensures that newly qualified teachers are provided with support, mentoring, and formative evaluation, during their first years in service. The activity would support training of seasoned teachers to become mentors for student-teachers and newly qualified teachers; a new practicum course at The Gambia College linked to the student's school placement; and monitoring and evaluation of the program.

38. **Focus Area 3. Development of In-Service Training Capacity and Management:** Aligned with the *Comprehensive Pre and In-service Strategic Framework and Implementation Plan*, the AF would build the capacity of the in-service training unit (INSET) to enhance their role in providing high quality, high impact trainings which are aligned with priority areas of the education sector. The aim would be to build INSET capacity so that they not only more effectively play a coordinating role in in-service teacher training, but also are able to train subject specialists on high impact training methods. These enhancements would be done through the following actions: (i) support for development of a strategic plan for in-service training; (ii) appointment of regional INSET and induction coordinators; (iii) development of a system of capturing and recording courses provided, and the training records of individual teachers; (iv) building the capacity of the INSET unit in key strategic areas by appointing content specialists to the INSET team to become master trainers in core subjects; and (v) supporting the INSET content specialists with international TA to develop and implement trainings in the priority areas over the first two years of the reform. The priority courses under the new model would be developed over 2020-2021 and delivered during 2021-2022, and would also tap into preexisting expertise within the Ministry (e.g. within the special education and ECD units which are receiving additional technical assistance and capacity building).

*Sub-component 2.3 Teacher Recruitment and Deployment* - Proposed total amount US\$4.994 million; Original Grant US\$4.2 million; Proposed Additional Financing US\$.794 million from GPE.

39. Just over US\$1 million will be added to sub-component 2.3 to support preexisting activities. This includes supporting continued teacher attendance monitoring and classroom observation efforts, including piloting of the newly updated classroom observation tool, as well as continued regional monitoring efforts conducted by



regional education personnel (regional directorates, cluster monitors, etc.). The additional funding will help to cover costs of additional monitoring expenses associated both with the expanded teacher initiatives under sub-component 2.2, as well as more frequent monitoring due to the COVID-19 pandemic which has resulted in expanded school based remediation initiatives.

40. In addition, funding will be added to the ongoing initiative to address the shortage of qualified mathematics and science teachers by supporting University of The Gambia (UTG) scholarships for candidates with strong math and science skills who transition into teaching. The additional funding will support approximately 150 students to complete qualifications, and places a priority on ensuring at least 30 percent are female.

**Component 3. Technical and Institutional Support** Proposed total amount US\$9.076 million; Original Grant US\$7.3 million; Proposed Additional Financing US\$1.776 million (of which US\$0 IDA and US\$1.776 million GPE).

*Sub-Component 3.1 Strengthening Capacity for Data Driven Decision Making.* Proposed total amount US\$4.936 million; Original Grant US\$3.9 million; Proposed Additional Financing US\$1.036 million.

41. A Performance Management System (PMS) is currently only partly implemented, in that teachers are monitored regularly, but the reporting is weak, and therefore the data cannot always be used to measure improvements in performance over time. The funding will support strengthening of the system to improve data capture and analysis and linkage with the HR and promotion systems, as well as funding for continued capacity data management and assessment.

*Sub-Component 3.2 Implementation of Communication Strategy.* Proposed total amount US\$.817 million; Original Grant US\$0.7 million; Proposed Additional Financing US\$.117 million.

42. Additional funding would be used to support communications, given the need for clear, high quality communications which accompany the pre-service and in-service training reform. As such, an additional US\$.175 would be added to support communications and sensitization efforts. This would support full operationalization of the communications team, and a series of focused messages which accompany the implementation of the revised teacher training approach.

*Sub-Component 3.3 Project Management and Institutional Support.* Proposed total amount US\$3.323 million; Original Grant US\$2.7 million; Proposed Additional Financing US\$.623 million.

43. Additional support will be provided to the implementing agency for some operations costs and capacity building, and enhanced technology within MoBSE, the regional directorates, and Gambia College to improve their ability to conduct and participate in technology enabled trainings (including via video conferencing), virtual planning sessions, and to promote enhanced sector wide communication, all of which are absolutely critical to the continued implementation of the sector strategy.

44. **Beneficiaries.** The additional financing is expected to directly benefit an additional 2,000 teachers with upgraded skills, mentorship and training before the close of the project, and an estimated 10,000 teachers will benefit from the upgraded performance management system. Given that the reforms are systemic, an estimated 2,000 plus teachers and student-teachers are expected to benefit from extensive induction, training,



and mentorship every year thereafter, meaning 10,000 teachers would benefit over the next 5 years. The initiative will also indirectly benefit over 65,000 students in their classrooms annually.

45. **Monitoring and Evaluation.** The Results Framework (Annex 1) consists of the project development objective, PDO level indicators, intermediate indicators, baselines and targets, frequency of data reporting, data source/methodology, and responsibilities for data collection. The approach has been to build capacity of country systems for monitoring as is evidence through the sustained development of the Education Management Information System (EMIS) year over year. As such, the additional financing, as in the parent project does not use a stand-alone M&E system, but rather benefits from the M&E arrangements for the Education Sector Strategy directly within the MoBSE given its close alignment with sector priorities. MoBSE has the critical M&E function of coordination and implementation supported by the EMIS team of the Directorate of Planning.

46. **Learning From Evidence Approach.** The project incorporates a Learning from Evidence approach as part of the M&E approach in line with the GPE objectives to: (i) learn continually from evidence and apply that learning adaptively to enhance program effectiveness; and (ii) generate knowledge and evidence on the relevance, effectiveness and efficiency of grants. In addition to providing measures of the number of student-teachers who undergo improved training approaches, the project will utilize the newly established teacher competency test for graduating teachers to measure improvements in foundational subjects and pedagogical knowledge year over year. Although the data will be analyzed year over year, the impacts of the pre-service training reforms are not realistically expected until Spring 2023, given that this is the year that the first cohort is expected to sit for the final exams. At the in-service training level, as with previous training cohorts, The Gambia will carry out pre and post-tests to assess the effectiveness of the revised teacher training. Further, the project benefits from data generated from the newly updated classroom observation tool (COT) which is being this academic year, on what is and is not working in the classroom.

47. **Results Framework.** The project will add a small number of additional intermediate results indicators to measure the additional financing. In addition, there are two changes to the original results framework. These include the following:

- The end target of the PDO indicator *Average Score of the Reading Comprehension Section of Early Grade Reading Assessment (EGRA), Grade 3 in Public Schools* will be revised downward given anticipated learning losses due to the extended school closure stemming from the outbreak of the COVID-19 pandemic;
- The indicator *Review Grade 1-3 English core textbooks to align with the reading curriculum and textbooks made available to Grades 1-3 in % of public schools* will be deleted. The latter part of the indicator is still captured in the indicator *pupil textbook (core subjects) ratio at public LBS*. The change takes into account the approach to continuing with the textbook reprint to ensure students receive textbooks before the end of project close.
- The annual targets for number of teachers trained will be increased to reflect the higher number of teacher beneficiaries.
- The following intermediate indicators will be added:
  - *Number of diploma students who complete LBS English and mathematics initiative;*
  - *Percentage of newly qualified teachers assigned to a trained induction mentor; and*
  - *Central database of in-service teacher training in place and populated.*



48. Project Costs by Component and Sub-Component

Component Name	Original		AF	TOTAL
	IDA	GPE	GPE	
<b>Component 1. Enhancing Access to ECD and Basic Education</b>	<b>7.7</b>	<b>2.0</b>	<b>0.979</b>	<b>10.679</b>
<i>Sub-Component 1.1 Expanding the network of basic and ECD classrooms</i>		4.6	0.0	4.6
<i>Sub-Component 1.2 Expanding Opportunities and access for out of school children</i>		5.1	0.979	6.079
<b>Component 2. Improving Quality of Teaching and Learning</b>	<b>15.0</b>	<b>3.0</b>	<b>4.405</b>	<b>22.405</b>
<i>Sub-Component 2.1 Curriculum Revision and Implementation</i>		6.6	0.260	6.86
<i>Sub-Component 2.2 Improving teacher Training and Professional Development</i>		7.2	3.351	10.551
<i>Sub-Component 2.3 Teacher Recruitment and Deployment</i>		4.2	.794	4.994
<b>Component 3. Technical and Institutional Support</b>	<b>7.3</b>	<b>0.0</b>	<b>1.776</b>	<b>9.076</b>
<i>Sub-Component 3.1 Strengthening Capacity for Data Driven Decision Making</i>		3.9	1.036	4.936
<i>Sub-Component 3.2 Implementation of Communication Strategy</i>		0.7	.117	.817
<i>Sub-Component 3.3 Project Management and Institutional Support</i>		2.7	.623	3.323
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>30.0</b>	<b>5.0</b>	<b>7.2</b>	<b>42.16</b>

**III. KEY RISKS**

49. The overall risk is assessed as moderate which is a downgrade from the risk rating of substantial. This assessment takes into account the new guidance from OPCS on risk ratings. The *Macroeconomic* risk remains is assessed as *moderate*: although the country's current and projected macroeconomic outlook are less favorable following the outbreak of the COVID-19 pandemic, the macroeconomic risk to achieving the development objective remains moderate as does political and governance risks which are also assessed as moderate. The *Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability* risks remains as *substantial*, since although there have been capacity building measures, the reform approach for Gambia College is new in the country. Given the PDO's strong alignment to the Government's strategic agenda for the education sector, as well as the client's steadfast commitment to achieving the PDO, the risk ratings for *Strategies and Policies* and *Technical Design of Project or Program* are assessed as moderate. In addition to the Government's strong commitment to the sector, donor support—both in terms of financing and technical advice—have both been sustained following the outbreak of the COVID-19 pandemic. The World Bank and the Government have continued to work closely to mitigate the negative effects on the COVID-19 crisis. As previously indicated, the Government of The Gambia received Global Partnership for Education (GPE) funding under the Accelerated Funding Window for COVID-19, with the World Bank as the grant agent (P174035). These additional financial and technical resources



should also help to minimize the negative impacts of the COVID-19 pandemic on The Gambia and to further mitigate the aforementioned risks.

50. **Political and Governance risk is moderate.** The political coalition established in late 2016 after President Barrow assumed office is fragile. Previous reform efforts have been significantly delayed because of loosening of the reform momentum. The authorities remain committed to the implementation of the reform agenda, but at the same time, lack a solid institutional system and governance structures to backup and support the reform momentum. Implementation by an experienced PCU—which has historically had very limited turnover and benefitted from well-established roles and responsibilities—is expected to help mitigate implementation delays due to political risks.

51. **Macroeconomic risk is moderate.** While the economic recovery further improved in 2019, debt sustainability remains a great challenge and the COVID-19 economic impact is expected to be substantial, however the risk to the education sector and the achievement of the project development objective remains moderate, given the current funding in place.

52. **Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability is substantial.** Although the PCU has substantial experience working on WBG operations, reform of The Gambia College will require significant cross-ministerial engagement with the Ministry of Higher Education, clear communications throughout the reform process to ensure buy-in from key stakeholders (student teachers, teachers, unions, etc.), and expertise in teacher education. The PCU is also managing the COVID-19 Emergency Education Response Project (P174035) in tandem which increases demands on staff. Mitigation measures include reinforcing communications support to the MoBSE, and sustained international technical assistance with in-built capacity building approaches to improve the managerial and technical expertise within MoBSE and The Gambia College, and coordinated safeguards and procurement approaches across the various projects.

#### IV. APPRAISAL SUMMARY

##### A. Economic and Financial (if applicable) Analysis

53. **While the economic and financial analysis conducted for the parent project remains valid, it has been updated to reflect the increased financial resources allocated to the project.** The Cost-benefits Analysis conducted for the proposed Additional Financing has been appended in Annex 1. The additional funding is a unique opportunity to scale-up and optimize teacher training reform for improved teacher quality, by leveraging the findings of teacher training strategic planning activities under the Parent Project. The majority of funding will go toward overhauling pre-service and in-service teacher training, with a smaller set of funds set aside for enhancing the performance management system (PMS) of teachers, and improved technology capacity. The project is complementary to the Emergency Education Sector COVID-19 Response Project (P174035) which was approved on July 10, 2020 and became effective immediately upon signing on July 20, 2020. This AF focuses on critical changes to teacher training reform as part of longer-term systemic improvements. Throughout project preparation special attention has been paid toward modalities of implementation support which are effective even with limited travel options and contribute toward a more technology enabled sector.

54. **The proposed AF is expected to generate substantial benefits and is also likely to have reasonably high rates of return.** Furthermore, the Cost Benefit Analysis results under the worst and best scenario assumptions



show that even under the worst scenario, the project is still economically viable. Under the base scenario, which is the lowest the project could achieve, the internal rate of return (IRR) reaches 17.9 percent, the NPV of the intervention benefits is US\$ 16.58 million and the benefit-cost ratio is 1.7. The sensitivity analysis confirms this project is a good investment and worthy intervention. The monetary return of the project activities is compensated even in the worst economic scenario. The proposed AF is justified economically.

## B. Technical

55. The key technical features of the overall operation, including the parent project and additional financing include: (i) a focus on regional and socioeconomic disparities to target marginalized and vulnerable populations; and (ii) carefully phased in and scaled up successful approaches which build on the preexisting evidence based. Activities were selected based on the evidence developed during several previous projects, updated IHS and EMIS data, and the Education Sector Analysis (ESA) completed in 2018 to allow for better targeted of interventions focused on improving access. Quality inputs are principled on developing high quality teacher in the classrooms, and are underpinned by best practices globally, as well as data gathered over several years on teacher performance on foundational skills from training cohorts pre- and post-tests, and the 2020 student-teacher competency exam, the results of which are preliminary. These results consistently show a relatively low foundation in mathematics, literacy, and pedagogy on the part of incoming teachers, which are the impetus for deep reforms, that are expected to substantially improve the pipeline of teachers in the forthcoming years, and allow for in-service teacher training to deepen, update, and expand skills of teachers rather than act as a band-aid for insufficient pre-service training.

## C. Financial Management

56. The FM arrangements for the Additional Financing will be the same as those under the parent project, including the FM risk assessment which is **Substantial**. As mitigating measures have been implemented for the Education Support Project to address FM capacity constraints, the FM arrangements satisfy the WB's minimum requirements.

57. The financial management staff under the PCU at MOBSE is responsible for the financial management of the three ongoing WB financed projects. The overall financial management performance of the Education Sector Support project is Moderately Satisfactory because the internal audit function is still unfilled, and the manual of procedures is not up to date. However, the auditor has expressed an unqualified opinion on the 2019 financial statements. The interim un-audited financial reports (IFRs) for the GESSP and ACE project are submitted on time and are deemed to be of acceptable quality by IDA. Staffing is adequate to handle additional activities.

58. In order to accommodate the new project in the existing financial management system and ensure readiness for implementation: (i) the accounting software used for the parent project should be updated for the bookkeeping of the project's activities; (ii) the manual of procedures should be updated to include retirement policies and internal audit procedures; and (iii) an addendum to the external auditor's contract signed to include the AF in the audit scope.

## D. Procurement





59. Procurement under the project will be carried out in accordance with the World Bank's Procurement Framework. Procurement by countries will follow the World Bank's Procurement Regulations for IPF Borrowers for Goods, Works, Non-Consulting and Consulting Services, dated July 1, 2016 (revised in November 2017 and August 2018). The Projects will be subject to the World Bank's Anticorruption Guidelines, dated October 15, 2006, revised in January 2011, and as of July 1, 2016. Countries will use the Systematic tracking of Exchanges in Procurement (STEP) to plan, record and track procurement transactions.

60. The procurement arrangements for the AF will also be the same as those under the parent project. The procurement risk is assessed as **Substantial**. To mitigate this risk, there will be continued training and support to the PCU procurement staff from the Bank's Accredited Procurement Specialist. Due to the COVID 19 sanitary situation, some specific procurement arrangements such as use of electronic means (bids/proposals electronic submission, bids/proposals electronic opening) may be used. However, the use of this specific arrangements will be closely discussed with the World Bank.

#### **E. Environment (including Safeguards)**

61. Similar to the parent project, the AF is a Category B-partial assessment project with similar potential negative environmental impacts which are likely to be minor, site specific, reversible, and easily manageable. The environmental impacts of the AF will mainly stem from minor rehabilitation of The Gambia College, in addition to the expansion of the network of classrooms with construction and rehabilitation works already planned in sub-component 1.1. The parent project also finances school transport thanks to the innovative approach of the donkey cart.

62. The construction and rehabilitation of early childhood education (ECD) and lower elementary school (LBS) classrooms, will involve earthworks, excavations, machinery, solid waste, land clearing vegetation, nuisance related to noise, dust. Rehabilitation of The Gambia College may also include minor nuisances related to noise, and dust. School transport with donkey carts could also entail risks for the safety of students and the community. It will therefore be important to put in place safety measures to control this risk in order to avoid accidents.

63. No new environmental safeguard policies were triggered other than those identified in the parent project: OP 4.01 Environmental Assessment, OP 4.12 Involuntary Resettlement. As the specific details of the areas of intervention of the AF will only be known during the implementation, the borrower has prepared an Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF) which provides the standard procedure and institutional arrangements for environmental and social screening, categorization and approval of sub-projects, as well as guidelines for the preparation, implementation and monitoring of the site specific environmental work (simplified ESIAs/EMPs or environmental measures). These site-specific instruments include environmental clauses to be inserted in contractors' bidding documents. The ESMF has been consulted upon and validated in-country and at the World Bank. The World Bank's guidance will also be used during the implementation of activities to deal with the risks associated with COVID 19.

#### **F. Social (including Safeguards)**

64. The activities to be supported through the AF are not expected to involve resettlement activities leading to physical or economic displacement. The PCU is in the process of increasing its safeguards capacity by hiring a social specialist and an environmental specialist which is essential for environmental and social risk management,



monitoring and sustainability of this project. In the interim, the project is assisted by a social and environmental consultant who, once safeguard staff is on board, will assist with capacity building. The project's Grievance Mechanism remains to be fully operational but is required to be effective prior to construction, and will include procedures specifically addressing the safe and confidential management, as well as referral to appropriate services of SEA/SH-related claims. The project has also developed COVID-19 worker and community safety protocol measures, including guidance on conducting stakeholder engagement and community consultations in WB-supported operations when there are constraints on conducting public meetings to be observed during construction.

65. **Mitigation of SEA/SH Risk.** An SEA/SH risk assessment was conducted, and the risk rating for GESSP AF was determined to be substantial. As a result, the project will adopt a series of measures designed to address and mitigate SEA/SH risk. In addition to ensuring that relevant personnel for the project and implementing partners sign, and are trained upon, codes of conduct that specifically address SEA/SH and applicable sanctions, the project will update its current GM to include specific procedures and a response protocol, which includes a mapping of locally available structures that offer quality services, to treat GBV complaints ethically, safely, and confidentially and in accordance with guiding principles for survivor care. Personnel will also be trained on basic SEA/SH prevention and response concepts, GM functioning, and service referrals for survivors. In project areas where services are extremely limited or non-existent, the project will review options for ensuring that beneficiaries have access to safe and confidential survivor care when needed. The project will ensure that adequate consultations with women in targeted communities will be conducted in safe and enabling environments, such as in sex-segregated groups and with female facilitators, in order to obtain their inputs on planned activities and understand their risks and vulnerabilities to SEA/SH in a particular context. The project will likewise ensure that social safeguards staff have adequate experience in gender-sensitive programming and in GBV prevention and response in order to oversee the SEA/SH Prevention and Response Action Plan, which will be informed by the existing SEA/SH risk assessment, and to ensure that SEA/SH risks in relation to planned project activities are being adequately addressed and mitigated. As needed, the project will recruit external technical assistance to support selected risk mitigation activities, such as trainings, community consultations and awareness-raising, and service-mapping.

66. **Gender Inclusion.** As in the original project, the additional financing supports equitable access to project benefits for female beneficiaries, constituents, and stakeholders. Given the focus of the AF on improved teacher training this means ensuring that female teachers, including student teachers, will have access to the wide range of pre-service and in-service trainings being planned during implementation, and will likewise enjoy equal access to trainings in all subjects that are offered, including in subject areas traditionally dominated by male teachers. Trainings will likewise incorporate modules on the promotion of equitable gender norms, the importance of equal access to education for both girls and boys, and the critical role that the teacher can play in fostering and modeling equitable behavior. In addition, the parent project will continue to support scholarships for students who will go on to become teachers in difficult to fill subject areas such as science and mathematics with the cohort consisting of 30 percent or more women annually. These are subjects that have historically been male dominated, and as such the percentage target for females is an important first step towards closing the gender gap in this area. Lastly, because boys are less likely to enroll than females in the districts with the lowest enrollments (targeted districts in Region 5 under sub-component 1.2) there is also an indicator specifically targeted on boys' enrollments in these districts as shown in the results framework. As explained above this imbalance in gender parity is likely due to higher enrollment of boys in majalis (or qur'anic schools).



67. **Disability Inclusion.** The current project has support for children with disabilities through an integrated approach which focuses on better school level identification of children who need additional support, training for education personnel and teachers on disability inclusive school environments and classroom teaching, and development of a mechanism to provide assistive devices to support children in schools. The additional financing keeps this focus by enhancing disability inclusive training at the pre-service level by identifying capacity constraints related to special education at The Gambia College and proposing a course of action to ensure all graduating teachers have initial exposure and training to disability inclusive classroom approaches. The project also support The Gambia College's previous efforts to ensure disabled student teachers are given equal opportunities for enrollment in their programs. In addition, the classroom construction funded under the original financing takes into account accessibility for children with disabilities.

## **V. WORLD BANK GRIEVANCE REDRESS**

68. Communities and individuals who believe that they are adversely affected by a World Bank (WB) supported project may submit complaints to existing project-level grievance redress mechanisms or the WB's Grievance Redress Service (GRS). The GRS ensures that complaints received are promptly reviewed in order to address project-related concerns. Project affected communities and individuals may submit their complaint to the WB's independent Inspection Panel which determines whether harm occurred, or could occur, as a result of WB non-compliance with its policies and procedures. Complaints may be submitted at any time after concerns have been brought directly to the World Bank's attention, and Bank Management has been given an opportunity to respond. For information on how to submit complaints to the World Bank's corporate Grievance Redress Service (GRS), please visit <http://www.worldbank.org/en/projects-operations/products-and-services/grievance-redress-service>. For information on how to submit complaints to the World Bank Inspection Panel, please visit [www.inspectionpanel.org](http://www.inspectionpanel.org)



## VI. SUMMARY TABLE OF CHANGES

	Changed	Not Changed
Results Framework	✓	
Components and Cost	✓	
Implementing Agency		✓
Project's Development Objectives		✓
Loan Closing Date(s)		✓
Cancellations Proposed		✓
Reallocation between Disbursement Categories		✓
Disbursements Arrangements		✓
Safeguard Policies Triggered		✓
EA category		✓
Legal Covenants		✓
Institutional Arrangements		✓
Financial Management		✓
Procurement		✓
Implementation Schedule		✓
Other Change(s)		✓

## VII. DETAILED CHANGE(S)

### COMPONENTS

Current Component Name	Current Cost (US\$, millions)	Action	Proposed Component Name	Proposed Cost (US\$, millions)
Component 1. Enhancing Access to ECD and Basic Education	9.70	Revised	Component 1. Enhancing Access to ECD and Basic Education	10.68
Component 2. Improving Quality of Teaching and	18.00	Revised	Component 2. Improving Quality of	22.40



Learning			Teaching and Learning	
Component 3. Technical and Institutional Support	7.30	Revised	Component 3. Technical and Institutional Support	9.08
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>35.00</b>			<b>42.16</b>

**Expected Disbursements (in US\$)**

Fiscal Year	Annual	Cumulative
2018	0.00	0.00
2019	8,936,334.73	8,936,334.73
2020	8,036,568.00	16,972,902.73
2021	8,000,000.00	24,972,902.73
2022	10,000,000.00	34,972,902.73
2023	7,027,097.30	42,000,000.03

**SYSTEMATIC OPERATIONS RISK-RATING TOOL (SORT)**

Risk Category	Latest ISR Rating	Current Rating
Political and Governance	● Substantial	● Moderate
Macroeconomic	● High	● Moderate
Sector Strategies and Policies	● Moderate	● Moderate
Technical Design of Project or Program	● Substantial	● Moderate
Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability	● High	● Substantial
Fiduciary	● Moderate	● Moderate
Environment and Social	● Moderate	● Low
Stakeholders	● Moderate	● Moderate
Other		
Overall	● Substantial	● Moderate



**LEGAL COVENANTS – The Gambia - Education Sector Support Program Additional Financing (P173332)**

**Sections and Description**

No information available

**Conditions**



**VIII. RESULTS FRAMEWORK AND MONITORING**

**Results Framework**

COUNTRY: Gambia, The

The Gambia - Education Sector Support Program Additional Financing

**Project Development Objective(s)**

To increase access to early childhood development and basic education and improve quality of teaching and learning.

**Project Development Objective Indicators by Objectives/ Outcomes**

Indicator Name	PBC	Baseline	Intermediate Targets				End Target
			1	2	3	4	
<b>Enhance Access to ECD and Basic Education</b>							
Students benefiting from direct interventions to enhance learning (CRI, Number)		0.00	26,300.00	31,400.00	53,200.00	399,000.00	411,000.00
Of which female (Percentage)		0.00	50.00	50.00	50.00	50.00	50.00
Increase GER LBS in select districts in Region 5 (Percentage)		70.40	72.00	74.00	76.00	78.00	80.00
Increase GER LBS in select districts in Region 5, Male (Percentage)		63.00	65.00	67.00	69.00	71.00	73.00
Increase in ECD GER (Percentage)		46.50	47.50	49.00	51.00	53.00	55.00



Indicator Name	PBC	Baseline	Intermediate Targets				End Target
			1	2	3	4	
ECD GER, Male (Percentage)		45.20	47.00	48.50	50.50	53.00	55.00
<b>Improve Quality of Teaching and Learning (Action: This Objective has been Revised)</b>							
Average score of the Reading Comprehension section of EGRA, Grade 3 in public schools (Number)		1.23	1.23	1.23	1.60	1.60	1.60
<b>Action: This indicator has been Revised</b>	<b>Rationale: The original target for 2020 was 1.6 and for 2022 was 2.0, however given the extended school closure due to COVID the end target was revised downward to 1.6 (the interim target) to reflect potential learning losses during the project period due to the pandemic.</b>						
Average score of the Reading Comprehension section of EGRA, Grade 3 in public schools, female (Number)		1.20	1.20	1.20	1.60	1.60	1.60
<b>Action: This indicator has been Revised</b>							

**Intermediate Results Indicators by Components**

Indicator Name	PBC	Baseline	Intermediate Targets				End Target
			1	2	3	4	
<b>Component 1. Enhancing Access to ECD and Basic Education</b>							





Indicator Name	PBC	Baseline	Intermediate Targets				End Target
			1	2	3	4	
Number of ECD (Annexed and Community-based), LBS, and UBS classrooms built (Number)		0.00	0.00	40.00	121.00	121.00	121.00
<b>Component 2. Improving Quality of Teaching and Learning</b>							
Public Lower Basic Schools completing special needs assessment (Percentage)		0.00	20.00	40.00	60.00	70.00	75.00
Core subjects' curriculum of Grades 1-6 revised and finalized (Yes/No)		No	No	No	No	No	Yes
Teachers trained on the integrated language and literacy curriculum for G1-3 (Percentage)		0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	50.00	100.00
Review Grade 1-3 English core textbooks to align with the reading curriculum and textbooks made available to Grades 1-3 in % of public schools (Percentage)		0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	100.00
<b>Action: This indicator has been Marked for Deletion</b>	<p><b>Rationale:</b>  <i>The indicator Review Grade 1-3 English core textbooks to align with the reading curriculum and textbooks made available to Grades 1-3 in % of public schools will be deleted. The latter part of the indicator is still captured in the indicator pupil textbook (core subjects) ratio at public LBS. The change takes into account the approach to continuing with the textbook reprint to ensure students receive textbooks before the end of project close.</i></p>						
Community-based ECD model reviewed and revised (Yes/No)		No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Pupil textbook (core subjects) ratio at public LBS (Percentage)		4.10	1.10	4.10	4.10	1.10	1.10



Indicator Name	PBC	Baseline	Intermediate Targets				End Target
			1	2	3	4	
Number of teachers trained under the project (Number)		0.00	2,000.00	4,000.00	6,000.00	10,000.00	10,000.00
<b>Action: This indicator has been Revised</b>	<b>Rationale:</b> <i>The end target is revised upward to 10,000 to take into account the additional financing activities.</i>						
Percentage of schools using revised COT (Percentage)		0.00	0.00	25.00	60.00	90.00	90.00
Number of HTC teachers receiving tuition scholarships in UTG Mathematics or Science Bachelor's program (Number)		0.00	75.00	150.00	225.00	300.00	300.00
of which female (Percentage)		0.00	30.00	30.00	30.00	30.00	30.00
Externally reviewed and overseen end-of-year examination in place for students completing the revised Gambia College programs (Yes/No)		No	No	No	No	Yes	Yes
Number of diploma students who complete new LBS teacher English and mathematics initiative (Number)		0.00	0.00	0.00	600.00	1,200.00	1,200.00
<b>Action: This indicator is New</b>							
Percentage of newly qualified LBS teachers assigned to a trained induction mentor (Percentage)		0.00	0.00	0.00	25.00	50.00	50.00



Indicator Name	PBC	Baseline	Intermediate Targets				End Target
			1	2	3	4	
<i>Action: This indicator is New</i>							
Central database of in-service teacher training in place and populated (Yes/No)	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
<i>Action: This indicator is New</i>							
<b>Component 3. Technical and Institutional Support</b>							
Expand EMIS to cover post-secondary level (Yes/No)	No	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Develop unique student IDs and include them in the system (Yes/No)	No	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Communities involved in planning and implementation of targeted enrollment interventions in Region 5 (Yes/No)	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Monitoring & Evaluation Plan: PDO Indicators					
Indicator Name	Definition/Description	Frequency	Datasource	Methodology for Data Collection	Responsibility for Data Collection
Students benefiting from direct interventions to enhance learning		Annual	EMIS. Beneficiaries include students in		MoBSE Planning Directorate



			Majalis, students getting incentives in region 5, students benefitting from donkey carts, students benefitting from ECD interventions and classroom construction, students benefitting from the expanded PSI-PMI and ELA program, students participating in the second chance program and students who are receiving scholarships. Once LBS and UBS students		
--	--	--	--	--	--



			receive textbooks, beneficiaries will include all public LBS and UBS students. The number of students in government and grant aided LBS are 235,277 and that in UBS is 74,401 (EMIS 2017). It is expected to increase by 3% every year.		
Of which female	Percentage of direct beneficiaries who are female.	Annual	EMIS		MoBSE Directorate
Increase GER LBS in select districts in Region 5	Here is the current GER in select districts in LBS (public, Madrassa and private conventional) (EMIS 2017)  total    boy    girl  Fulladu West	Annual	EMIS		MoBSE Planning Directorate



	72.1 64.7 79.6				
	Lower Saloum 91.9 77.5 106.6				
	Niamina East 67.4 62.4 72.5				
	Niani 79.2 75.0 83.6				
	Nianija 52.7 39.3 66.2				
	Sami 72.2 66.7 77.7				
	Upper Saloum 47.3 37.8 56.8				
	Average 70.4 63.0 77.8				
Increase GER LBS in select districts in Region 5, Male		Annual	EMIS		MoBSE Planning Directorate
Increase in ECD GER		Annual	EMIS data		MoBSE Directorate
ECD GER, Male					
Average score of the Reading Comprehension section of EGRA, Grade 3	EGRA is conducted every 2 years in The Gambia.	Once every two years	EGRA		MoBSE Assessment Unit



in public schools	Average score of the reading comprehension section in Grade 3 was 1.23 out of 5 questions total in 2016 (Male 1.27 and Female 1.20). The original target for 2020 was 1.6 and for 2022 was 2.0, however given the extended school closure due to COVID the end target was revised downward to 1.6 (the interim target) to reflect potential learning losses during the project period due to the pandemic.				
Average score of the Reading Comprehension section of EGRA, Grade 3 in public schools, female					

**Monitoring & Evaluation Plan: Intermediate Results Indicators**

Indicator Name	Definition/Description	Frequency	Datasource	Methodology for Data Collection	Responsibility for Data Collection
Number of ECD (Annexed and Community-based), LBS, and UBS classrooms built	The breakdown of the target of 121 classrooms is following. 20 Annexed ECD classrooms to existing LBS, 20 community based ECD classrooms, 60 LBS/UBS	Annual	PCU Construction Unit.		PCU Construction Unit



	<p>classrooms and 21 ECD classrooms annexed to multi-grade schools. 21 ECD classrooms come from the following reason. In the previous and ongoing projects, a total of 48 multi-grade schools were built, which did not include ECD classrooms due to the budgetary constraints. Currently 27 ECD classrooms are being built for these 48 multi-grade schools, funded by the Early Learning Partnership (ELP). This means that remaining 21 multi-grade schools still need ECD classrooms.</p>				
Public Lower Basic Schools completing special needs assessment	<p>Percentage of lower basic schools which complete a special needs assessment to identify special needs learners.</p>	Annual	Completed survey via regional directorate in coordination with cluster monitors		Special needs unit in MoBSE
Expand EMIS to cover post-secondary level	<p>MoHERST EMIS system will be developed and integrated with MoBSE</p>	Annual	MoBSE and MoHERST Planning		MoBSE and MoHERST Planning Directorates





	EMIS system.		Directorates		
Core subjects' curriculum of Grades 1-6 revised and finalized		Annual	Revised and Finalized curriculum submitted by the MoBSE Curriculum Directorate		MoBSE Curriculum Directorate
Teachers trained on the integrated language and literacy curriculum for G1-3	public grades1-3 teachers will be trained.	Annual	MoBSE In-Service Training Unit		MoBSE In-Service Training Unit
Develop unique student IDs and include them in the system	Phase 1 will be development of student ID for new entrants and Phase 2 will be for existing students.	Annual	ID development in the system provided by MoBSE Planning Directorate		MoBSE Planning Directorate
Communities involved in planning and implementation of targeted enrollment interventions in Region 5			It will be measured by meeting minutes of annual consultative meetings with school based management		



			committees and community representatives.		
Review Grade 1-3 English core textbooks to align with the reading curriculum and textbooks made available to Grades 1-3 in % of public schools		Annual	PCU and MoBSE M&E unit		PCU and MoBSE Curriculum Unit
Community-based ECD model reviewed and revised	An impact evaluation of community-based ECD and Annexed ECD attached to LBS showed that there was very little impact on the community-based ECD. However, if community-based ECD does not exist, there would be many children who would not be able to access to Annexed ECD attached to LBS due to the distance. Therefore, it is necessary to review and revise the community-based ECD model to improve quality.	Annual	Revised ECD model submitted by the ECD Unit of MoBSE		ECD Unit of MoBSE
Pupil textbook (core subjects) ratio at public LBS	Unit of Measure is ratio, not percentage (there was no ratio to in the drop-down menu).	Annual	All G1-9 students in public LBS receive core		MoBSE M&E function



			subjects textbooks		
Number of teachers trained under the project	Every year about 2,000 teachers will be trained. Targets are cumulative.	Annual	CPD data from In-Service Education Training Unit (INSET) of MoBSE.		MoBSE Directorate
Percentage of schools using revised COT		Annual	Standards and Quality Assurance Directorate (SQAD) of MoBSE is responsible for data collection and analysis. It will be sample based. Data will be collected from 15% of public LBS.		MoBSE, via cluster monitors and regional directorates.
Number of HTC teachers receiving tuition scholarships in UTG Mathematics or Science Bachelor's program		Annual	UTG admission data and record of scholarships		MoHERST



of which female	30% of the students who receive scholarship to be female.	Annual	MoHERST admission data		MoBSE PCU
Externally reviewed and overseen end-of-year examination in place for students completing the revised Gambia College programs		Annual	Examination report by external party		MoBSE M&E unit
Number of diploma students who complete new LBS teacher English and mathematics initiative	Number of students enrolled in Gambia College who complete new English and Mathematics courses for LBS teachers.	Once semesterly (twice annually).	Gambia College records	Gambia College data collection, number of students completing each semester	Gambia College School of Education
Percentage of newly qualified LBS teachers assigned to a trained induction mentor	Percentage of newly qualified teachers who are assigned a trained mentor	annually	INSET unit reports via regional directorates and INSET coordinators		INSET unit
Central database of in-service teacher training in place and populated		Annually	MoBSE		



## Annex 1. Economic and Financial Analysis

1. This section provides an update of the Cost-benefit Analysis (CBA) for the proposed Additional Financing. The first section of the Economic and Financial Analysis conducted for the parent project on the analysis of key sector issues and the returns to education, remains valid. Therefore, this annex covers the CBA of the Additional Financing (AF) project interventions, as well as a sensitivity analysis.
2. The cost-benefit analysis is employed to estimate the benefit brought by the AF project, as well as the associated cost to assess the economic feasibility. The analysis is tailored based on component-specific intervention designing, beneficiaries targeting, and the benefit quantifying. The cost-benefit analysis only captures the economic benefit streams of the project beneficiaries realized in terms of lifetime earnings due to improved learning, as well as the intermediate benefits of these interventions. Semi-tangible benefits are benefits that are mostly associated with the quality component of the project and they are estimated based on standard benefit findings from similar interventions in other countries. Overall, the cost benefit analysis uses two different approaches of benefit stream estimates – access and quality.
3. The first approach of the cost benefit analysis focus on access interventions of the project. This section captures the benefits associated with construction of the Early Childhood Education (ECD) and Lower Basic School (LBS) classrooms; school transportation; identification of special needs children; targeted incentives for enrollment in Region 5; support to foundational skills provision in koranic schools; and development of a targeted second change education program.
4. The second approach focuses on the impact of interventions on quality improvement. This examines both the direct and indirect impact of interventions. The impact of direct and indirect interventions looks at improvements in student learning resulting from:(i) sequenced revision of curriculum for ECD through Grade 9; (ii) development of a coherent framework for teacher training; and (iii) effective teacher recruitment and deployment.
5. The cost-benefit of access and quality are calculated separately, then combined to obtain the overall cost-benefit estimates which are weighted by the cost allocated to each category.

### Assumptions for cost-benefit analysis

6. To derive the cost-benefit analysis of the AF, the model makes several assumptions about the project activities, the associated costs, and benefits. These assumptions remain unchanged compared to the cost-benefit analysis conducted for the parent project. Below are key assumptions used:
  - **Data:** The 2015 IHS and EMIS data are used to estimate the number of beneficiaries, class size and STR.
  - **Age:** ECD starting age is 3, primary school starting age is 7 and labor market entry age is 18 (to allow delayed entry and accommodate those who start school on time to complete secondary).
  - **Survival/retention:** Although the project is expected to increase survival rates, the current survival rates are used for the lower bound of IRR and NPV (grade 6: 56.3 percent, grade 9: 42.9 percent, and grade 12: 23.9 percent).



- **Rates:** A 15 percent discount rate is used (although the current lending rate is around 10 percent for lower bound of IRR and NPV), the inflation rate assumed for the project lifetime is 5 percent, the maintenance cost assumed for the life time of the construction is 5 percent. The 2015 official exchange rate is set at 43.4 GMD per USD and 5 percent inflation remains the same.
- **Earnings:** A wage rate is estimated for different levels of education and age, using the 2015 IHS—the earnings rate and cognitive skills remains the same over the lifetime of benefits, except for inflation adjustment.
- **Employment:** The probability of employment remains the same and is it is estimated by level of education using the 2015 IHS. Unemployment rate by level of education will remain the same although quality improvement might increase the chance of employment to take the lower bound of the benefits.
- **Life span of the project:** The beneficiaries of the project engage in the labor market for a period of 30 years except for those benefiting from capacity building. The schools provide services for 30 years in the base scenario.
- **Associated/Incremental cost:** Since the targeted intermediate and direct beneficiaries are school age children, there will be an opportunity cost associated with the quantifiable program benefits. Incremental spending incurred after the end of project is calculated based on public and household unit costs using data from the 2017 PER.
- **Evidence from other countries:** the probability of project implementation used is 62.5 percent, which is an average of 40 interventions in Latin America— this is assumed to be the lower bound, since The Gambia has very high capacity in project implementation based on the Bank engagements. The correlation between the intervention and cognitive skills (10) and the impact of the project (4.5 percent) are the average of 40 projects. Correlation between earning and cognitive skills were taken of the lowest bound of the range stated above (0.17 to 0.23).

7. **Table 1 presents the cost-benefit analysis results for the base scenario which is the optimal level that the AF project could achieve based on the strictest conservative assumptions.** Both the IRR and the NPV of costs and benefits of quality related interventions of the project show that the project is economically viable. The present value of the overall project benefits is estimated to be US\$28.60 million, while the present value of costs is estimated to be US\$6.31 million. The corresponding NPV of the intervention benefits is US\$22.29 million. The IRR associated with this NPV is 27.5 percent. Although some potential benefits from the Project cannot be fully quantified, the NPV of the quantifiable benefits are larger than the NPV costs, thereby strongly supporting the efficiency of investments undertaken under the Project.

8. **Table 1 below presents the cost-benefit analysis results for the base scenario which is the lowest the project could achieve based on the strictest conservative assumptions.** Both the internal rate of return and the net present value of costs and benefits of both access and quality related interventions of the project show that the project is economically viable. The present value of the overall project benefits is estimated to be US\$ 49.89 million, while the present value of costs is estimated to be US\$ 28.92 million. The corresponding net present value (NPV) of the intervention benefits is US\$ 16.58 million. The internal rate of return (IRR) associated with



this NPV is 17.9 percent. Although some benefits are not fully quantifiable to measure the total potential benefit of the project, the NPV of the quantifiable benefits are larger than the NPV costs, thereby strongly supporting investment on the project. Finally, the benefit-cost ratio of the project is estimated to be 1.7.

**Table 1. Internal Rate of Return and Net Present Value in millions of USD**

	Access	Quality	Total
IRR	12.5%	18.6%	17.9%
Discounted cost (present value of costs)	\$7.13	\$21.79	\$28.92
<i>O/w project cost</i>	\$6.99	\$18.56	\$25.55
<i>Maintained/incremental costs</i>	\$2.21	\$.00	\$2.21
<i>school fees (household and public)</i>	\$.14	\$.00	\$.14
Present value of incremental benefits	\$12.05	\$37.84	\$49.89
NPV	\$.53	\$16.05	\$16.58
Benefit/cost ratio	1.7	1.7	1.7

Source: Authors' estimations based on IHS 2015 and EMIS

**Sensitivity Analysis**

9. **The sensitivity analysis was conducted by changing key assumptions from the already defined assumptions used in the base scenario.** Given that the above IRR of the base scenario is generated based on strict conservative assumptions on the benefits, the sensitivity analysis shows the improvement in the access and quality of education that could result from a better implementation and management of the project under two scenarios. To come up with these scenarios, we relax certain assumptions on the benefits and costs associated with the sustainability of facilities and other key parameters. Table 2 summarizes the key assumptions which have been relaxed. Table 3 and table 4 present the results of the second-best and first-best scenarios of the simulation models considered for the sensitivity analysis. The cost benefit analysis was re-estimated by changing the main parameters, leading higher NPV and IRR under a second-best scenario and a first-best scenario (table 3 and 4). The results of the sensitivity analysis imply that the project could achieve more if successfully implemented and well managed.

**Table 2: Summary of the key assumptions considered for the sensitivity analysis**

Sensitivity parameter	Worst scenario	Baseline	Best scenario
<i>Project implementation</i>			
Probability of implementation of the project	53%	63%	73%
Life span of the building	30	40	50
Life span of quality	10	15	20
Maintenance rate	10%	7.50%	5%
Discount rate	15%	12%	10%



Class size			
Basic education-60 classrooms	50	60	70
ECD 20 centers	100	120	140
ECD 41 annexed class	50	60	70

**Table 3. Net Present Value (NPV) in millions of USD and Internal Rate of Return (IRR) based on second best scenario**

	Access	Quality	Total
IRR	15.9%	20.5%	19.9%
Discounted cost (present value of costs)	\$7.19	\$23.43	\$30.62
<i>O/w project cost</i>	\$6.99	\$19.74	\$26.74
<i>Maintained/incremental costs</i>	\$1.36	\$.00	\$1.36
<i>school fees (household and public)</i>	\$.20	\$.00	\$.20
Present value of incremental benefits	\$19.79	\$86.02	\$105.81
NPV	\$5.38	\$62.59	\$67.98
Benefit/cost ratio	2.8	3.7	3.6

Source: Authors' estimations based on IHS 2015 and EMIS

**Table 4. Net Present Value (NPV) in millions of USD and Internal Rate of Return (IRR) based on first-best scenario**

	Access	Quality	Total
IRR	19.3%	22.4%	22.1%
Discounted cost (present value of costs)	\$7.75	\$24.64	\$32.39
<i>O/w project cost</i>	\$7.35	\$20.60	\$27.96
<i>Maintained/incremental costs</i>	\$.60	\$.00	\$.60
<i>school fees (household and public)</i>	\$.40	\$.00	\$.40
Present value of incremental benefits	\$47.13	\$169.06	\$216.18
NPV	\$24.44	\$144.42	\$168.85
Benefit/cost ratio	6.1	6.9	6.8

Source: Authors' estimations based on IHS 2015 and EMIS