Report of the Workshop on Pre-School Education in Low-Income Countries
November 26-27, 2013 in Bonn, Germany

Workshop Venue: Fabrik 45, Bonn, Germany
Workshop Convener: Michael Holländer (GIZ, Sector Program Numeracy)
Facilitators: Martin Kalunga-Banda, Hinrich Mercker
Content

Summary of the workshop on Pre-School Education in BMZ/GPE partner countries ........ 2

Why a workshop on pre-school education? ................................................................. 2

Workshop Objectives.................................................................................................... 2

What happened during the workshop? ........................................................................ 3

What are the results? ..................................................................................................... 3

What are the next steps? ............................................................................................. 4

Where to get further information? ............................................................................... 4

Results from Mapping Exercise.................................................................................. 5

Annex ............................................................................................................................ 14

Participating Organizations......................................................................................... 14

Links to further information ....................................................................................... 18

Conference Evaluation based on Participants’ Feedback............................................ 18
Summary of the workshop on Pre-School Education in BMZ/GPE partner countries

The Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) on behalf of the German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ) together with the Global Partnership for Education (GPE) co-hosted a workshop on Pre-School Education in Low-Income Countries on November 26-27, 2013 in Bonn, Germany.

28 participants from 15 different organizations representing the perspectives of think-tanks, NGOs, multilaterals and implementing agencies including representatives from Children’s Investment Fund Foundation (CIFF), DFID, Dubai Cares, Global Campaign for Education, Save the Children, UNESCO and UNICEF followed this invitation. Throughout the two-day workshop, the participants joined hands to develop ideas and recommendations to improve access and quality of pre-school education in BMZ and GPE partner countries.

Why a workshop on pre-school education?

“The specific demand for pre-school education in low income countries is there and there is an urgent need for action and technical support”. Right at the start of the conference, Aglaia Zafeirakou, focal point for early childhood education at GPE, made this point very clear. The supply side, on the other hand, is not yet fully prepared to respond adequately to the demand for delivery of good quality and inclusive pre-school education services. According to the focal point for early childhood education at the GPE, an ‘emergency situation’ arises from this growing demand calling for increased attention to the topic by international development partners.

Workshop Objectives

- The **challenges and promising options** for implementation of pre-school education programs are identified.
- **Priority areas** and **short-term goals** which need further technical expertise in order to provide meaningful advice and support for partner countries to implement good quality pre-school education services are laid out.
- **Next steps** for addressing the prescribed gaps and challenges are defined.
- **Possible contributions** from development partners are formulated.
What happened during the workshop?

To act upon this emergency situation, the workshop convened international experts, development partners and practitioners in the field of pre-school education. Besides sharing their experiences and mapping the various ongoing and planned interventions in the pre-school sector in low-income countries, the participants worked through a sculpting exercise to identify current challenges and acupuncture points with leveraging effects to bring by changes to the current system of pre-school education. A highly motivated group engaged in this exercise that resulted in creative and at the same time meaningful 3D representations of the current and desired system of pre-school-education in low-income countries as well as the available and needed technical support system.

What are the results?

Besides a mapping of current and planned activities of the organizations represented at the workshop, the participants also condensed the results from the sculpting exercise and the discussions into four principal recommendations:

1) A Technical Reference Group (TRG) should be established as coordinating body to facilitate exchange with a specific focus on pre-school education in low-income countries and raise the effectiveness of existing platforms of Early Childhood Care and Education (ECCE). The TRG should help to further identify and address priority areas with leveraging effects as well as opportunities and challenges in order to improve pre-school services in low-income countries.

2) Guidelines and quality standards with a special focus on pre-school education in low-income countries (including quality indicators) should be made available.

3) Community and parental awareness of and demand for holistic, integrated, cost effective and culturally relevant pre-school services should be raised.

4) The mechanisms and capacities for the provision of large-scale, equitable, quality pre-school services (private, public, and community) need to be improved and expanded in low-income countries.

Please also refer to the annex for more details on these recommendations.
What are the next steps?

The participants of the workshop have shown high engagement for the topic of pre-school education. The participants reflected that the workshop may be regarded as an important momentum for enhanced coordination and cooperation with a **specific focus on pre-school education** in the future. However, it is yet to be decided which concrete steps will be undertaken to act-upon the recommendations that were developed by the workshop participants. The GPE committed to follow-up on the terms of references and potential partners for a **technical reference group for pre-school education in low-income countries**.

For 2014, the GPE plans to carry out a **regional workshop on early childhood / pre-school education in Sub-Saharan Africa** together with other key partners.

The workshop was part of BMZ’s support to the GPE in reaching the Education for All (EFA) Goals as well as the objective 3 of GPE’s strategic plan (“A dramatic increase occurs in the number of children who are learning and demonstrating mastery of basic literacy and numeracy skills by grade 3.”). The BMZ remains involved and committed to supporting the GPE in reaching this goal.

Where to get further information?

For further information or if you want to get updates on the next steps please contact Ms Lena Maechel ([lena.maechel@giz.de](mailto:lena.maechel@giz.de)) or Dr. Michael Hollaender ([michael.hollaender@giz.de](mailto:michael.hollaender@giz.de)).
Results from Mapping Exercise

- World Bank: Resources Mobilization, Technical Advice, Analytical work - knowledge sharing
- UNICEF: Advocacy HQ, Reg. Co
- UNESCO: Policy advice on Regional, sub-regional and country level (however this depends on the agreed definition of the term region, Guide to formulation of indicators
- SABRE: Piloting components of Ghana’s 5 year Kindergarten operational plan
- GIZ Sector Programme Numeracy: technical advice to BMZ
- GIZ: Support in sector-planning at national, district/provincial + school levels, Advisory services to education ministries
- DFID: Advisory services to partner governments
- GPE: Support development of ESPs in countries (technically; including ECCE)
- CIFF: Early Learning Partnership, World Bank
- Kindernothilfe: Motivating partner organizations to influence education sector planning or to become part of LEG
- Global Campaign for Education: Influencing education sector planning at country level
- PLAN: Policy advice through networks, research

- DRC: Costed implementation plan
- Kenya: ECD component within GPE
- Sudan: ECD sub sector strategy
- The Gambia: ECD within Education Sector Plan, costed implementation plan
- Sierra Leone: Costed implementation plan; ECD within Education Sector Plan
- Uganda: ECD component within GPE (2014-2017), ECD Evidence Kit
Formal Education

UNICEF
- Child Friendly Schools
- Testing new pupil achievement record for kindergarten in Ghana
- Testing new teacher monitoring tool for kindergarten in Ghana

GIZ Mozambique (Nhupupwe)
- Support in implementation of pre-primary program

DFID
- Support to pre-primary education in Bangladesh and Ghana

Dubai Cares
- Comoros Islands: Formalization of ECD into Public School Systems

PLAN
- Include child right and child protection issues in formal education
- Strengthen system regarding quality education
Capacity Building (cross-cutting)

- Capacity Development at national, district/provincial + school-level
- Ministries, education administration: e.g. Teacher Training Institutions

UNESCO-IICBA-2013-2015: Capacity building of TEIs and MoEs on the use of Indigenous ECCE curriculum framework and modules in countries accelerating the achievement of EFA Goal 1

Africa regional workshops/training ECE/ECD (World Bank Early Learning Partnership)

School Readiness Assessments: Ethiopia, Indonesia, Malawi, Nepal, Bangladesh, Buttan

Essential package for children affected by HIV/AIDS/OVC

Capacity Building of partners ECDs and gov. staff on childrights --> right to quality education

Save the Children

UNICEF

GIZ

GIZ Mozambique

Dubai Cares

Plan

Kindernothilfe

Human Capacity Development of Teacher Trainers and Supervisors

India: Capacity Building of governmental/public ECD workshops in urban cities & pedagogical

2014: capacity needs assessment of ECD implementing partners in Malawi & development of training project based on Malawi ECD quality standards
Community Participation / Outreach

Save the Children
- Community Pre-schools in: Malawi, Ethiopia, Uganda, Zambia, Mozambique, Mali
- ECD <-> Nutrition & Health
- Awareness raising among parents & community leaders
- Involvement of children and youth in programme planning
- Parents associations research on parenting
- Evaluation of kindergarten concepts

Dubai Cares
- Pakistan: Community ECD Centers + Mother's Support
- Self Help Group Approach as a starting point for ECD initiatives
- Informal CBCCs incl. voluntary caregivers, parents committees, management commitment

Kindernothilfe

OMEP
- Toy libraries
- Work with and support refugee camp in Jordan

Parmenides Foundation
Annex

Participating Organizations
- Association Nhapúpwè / Centre for International Migration and Development (CIM) / Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ)
- Department for International Development (DFID)
- Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ)
- Dubai Cares
- Global Partnership for Education (GPE)
- Kindernothilfe e. V. / Global Campaign for Education
- Kreditanstalt für Wiederaufbau (KfW, German Development Bank)
- Organisation Mondiale pour l’Éducation Préscolaire (OMEP)
- Parmenides Foundation
- Plan International Deutschland e.V. / Global Campaign for Education
- Save the Children
- The Children’s Investment Fund Foundation (CIFF)
- The Sabre Charitable Trust
- UNESCO
- UNICEF

Detailed information on “What are the results?”
With reference to the four main recommendations as listed under “What are the results?” please find further details below.

1) Technical Reference Group (TRG)

- Consolidate the TRG:
  - Define Terms of Reference (objectives, timeline, budget)
  - Identify a secretariat or coordinating body
  - Identify members
- Possible tasks and responsibilities of the TRG:
  - Map existing platforms. Clarify how to best integrate a TRG and identification of gaps.
  - Assess existing programs as well as existing research
    - Feed them into a “Center for Results” (Clearinghouse) or similar
  - Explore financing options
  - Facilitate South-South exchange
2) **Guidelines and quality standards**

Define a prototype to measure (child readiness to learn, learning environment, school readiness)
- Map / collect all available tools
- Talk to teachers about what they value
- Use parent input
- Acknowledge the concept of “readiness for life”

3) **Community and parental awareness**

- Adequate out-reach to implementers that have access to communities and parents
- Establish an online group to share experiences in community out-reach / messaging
- Establish a platform for sharing of materials

4) **Mechanisms and capacities for the provision of large-scale, equitable, quality pre-school services (private, public, and community) need to be improved and expanded in low-income countries.**

- Mapping of stakeholders and interventions (what agency, which region, what quality)
- Identify best practices, biggest challenges and preconditions for success
- Engage with local education groups to identify best practices and to develop technical capacity at country level
- Establishment of a technical reference group (TRG) and a respective action plan with members drawn from GPE partners
- TRG to identify best practices, biggest challenges, preconditions for success
- Engage with local education groups at country level that show preconditions of success
- Best practices need to be adapted to country-context
- Develop technical capacity at country level
## DAY 1, 26.11.2013:
FOCUS: COMMON INTENT AND SENSING THE FIELD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TIME</th>
<th>SESSION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12:00 – 13:00</td>
<td>Registration and Welcome Lunch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:00 – 13:30</td>
<td><strong>Welcome from the hosting organizations</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Michael Holländer</strong> Team Leader Sector Programme Numeracy (GIZ) on behalf of BMZ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Aglaia Zafeirakou</strong> Sr. Education Specialist, PhD, Country Support Team, Global Partnership for Education (GPE)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:30 – 14:15</td>
<td>Check-in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:15 – 14:45</td>
<td><strong>Input GPE, Aglaia Zafeirakou:</strong> “Introducing the GPE Implementation Plan with a special focus on Strategic Objective 3: Outcomes and activities in relation to pre-school education: current status and challenges” Followed by clarifying questions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:45 – 15:30</td>
<td>Reflecting on stakeholder conversations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:30-16:00</td>
<td>Sharing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:00 – 16:30</td>
<td><strong>TEA BREAK</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:30 – 17:15</td>
<td><strong>Best Practices &amp; Lessons Learnt in Pre-School Education</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17:15 – 17:45</td>
<td>Feedback</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17:45 – 18:15</td>
<td>Check-out</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19:30</td>
<td><strong>Joint Dinner Restaurant Café Karl</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### DAY 2, 27.11.2013:
**FOCUS: PRIORITY AREAS, SHORT-TERM GOALS AND NEXT STEPS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TIME</th>
<th>SESSION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>08:30 – 09:15</td>
<td>Check-In</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:15 – 10:15</td>
<td>Sculpting the current system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:15 – 10:45</td>
<td><strong>TEA BREAK</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:45 – 11:45</td>
<td>Sculpting the current system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:45 – 12:45</td>
<td>Sculpting the FUTURE system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:45 – 13:30</td>
<td><strong>LUNCH BREAK</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:30-13:45</td>
<td>Welcome note Kerstin Sieverdingbeck Head of Pre-School Department at Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:45 – 14:30</td>
<td>Identifying leverage/acupuncture points for shifting the system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:30 – 15:50</td>
<td>Turning leverage/acupuncture points into NEXT Steps</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:50 – 16:10</td>
<td><strong>TEA BREAK</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:20 – 17:00</td>
<td>Final Check-Out</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17:00</td>
<td>Closing note</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**END of WORKSHOP**
Links to further information

- Website BMZ Education Division http://www.bmz.de/en/what_we_do/issues/Education/index.html

Conference Evaluation based on Participants’ Feedback
With 14 out of 23 feedback sheets, more than 50% of the participants of the workshop provided anonymous feedback. In order to identify key results, a comparison of the average scores for the statements 1-14 and the most frequent comments to the questions 15-16 are summarized in this overview.

The average scores to the statements 1-14 all lie between 3.4 and 4.8 indicating that the average feedback of different aspects of the conference is by and large positive.

Amongst the most frequent answer to the question of what improvements one would recommend to the workshop (question 15) were to have more time in general and particularly for more strategic discussions to define the next steps.

There was no clear tendency for the question about what was least valuable about the workshop (question 16). The comments include too little time, limited diversity of participants and imprecise definition of objectives for the workshop.

Amongst the most frequent answers to the question of what was most valuable about the event (question 17) were the networking opportunities during the workshop, the stimulation of creativity and the interactive design of the workshop.
3. The thematic focus on pre-school education is relevant and will help in furthering Pre-school Education / ECCE in developing countries

4. The workshop gave me sufficient understanding of the relevance of Pre-school education / ECCE and the urgent need for action

5. The complexity level of the workshop was appropriate

6. The pace of the workshop was appropriate

7. Overall, the discussions were productive and have taken us forward

8. The moderation was effective and has supported the process well

9. From my point of view, we have accomplished the objectives of the workshop

10. I will be able to apply what we have developed during this workshop in my own work

11. The workshop venue was well chosen

12. The workshop was well organized

13. Hotel accommodation was comfortable

Meaning of Scores

1 = “Strongly disagree” or the lowest, negative impression

2 = “Disagree”

3 = “Neither agree nor disagree” or an adequate impression

4 = “Agree”

5 = “Strongly agree” or the highest, positive impression”