

**2015/16 Backward-Looking Joint  
Review of the Education Sector  
Summary Report**

**November, 2016**

## Table of Contents

<b>Introduction</b> .....	3
<b>Section 1: 2016 Education Statistics</b> .....	4
<b>Section 2: Progress against 2015/16 EDPRS 2 and Sector Core Indicators and Related Policy Actions</b> .....	5
2.1. Progress against 2015/16 Targets for EDPRS2 core indicators.....	5
2.1. Progress against 2015/16 Sector Indicators .....	6
<b>Section 3: 2015/16 Budget Execution Performance</b> .....	6
<b>Section 4: Progress against Implementation of Recommendations from the Last JRES Meeting</b> .....	7
<b>Section 5: 2017/18 Sector Priority Areas during the Planning and Budgeting Process</b> ....	8
<b>Section 6: New Sector Policy Development, the Status of</b> .....	9
<b>2015/16 and 2016/17 Sector Analytical Studies</b> .....	9
<b>Annex 1.2: Sector Indicators Matrix (For the selected 10 sector indicators)</b> .....	11
<b>Annex 2.2: 2015/16 Budget by Agency</b> .....	13
<b>Annex 2.3. Progress against implementation of recommendations from the last JSR meeting</b> .....	14
<b>Annex 2.4. Status of Policies</b> .....	15
<b>Annex 2.5. Status of 2015/16 Sector Analytical Studies</b> .....	16
<b>Annex 2.6. Sector Priority Analytical Studies for 2016/17</b> .....	17
<b>Annex 2.7. Office of the Auditor General (OAG) report and corrective measures 2014/15</b>	18
<b>Annex 2.8.Recommendation from the 2015/16 Backward Looking JRES</b> .....	22

## Introduction

The Backward-Looking Joint Review of the Education Sector took place on 10<sup>th</sup> November 2016 at Hotel Chez Lando, bringing together 167 participants including senior managers, key development partners, Sector Working Group (SWG), civil society, private sector, Heads and Directors of education institutions, districts representatives, and other partners from line Ministries including Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning. It was an opportunity to engage in policy dialogue and to ensure ownership, accountability and transparency of the Economic Development and Poverty Reduction Strategy 2 (EDPRS2), Education Sector Strategic Plan (ESSP), implementation and monitoring process.

The 2015/16 Joint Sector Review had six main objectives:

1. To assess progress in achieving sector objectives with focus on 2015/16 targets for EDPRS2 core indicators and selected sector indicators and their corresponding policy actions;
2. To present and discuss budget execution performance;
3. To review progress in achieving EDPRS 2 midterm (2015/16) targets;
4. To review progress against recommendations from the last JSR;
5. To highlight priority areas for the 2017/18 fiscal year that will inform the planning and budgeting process for institutions in the sector;
6. To update stakeholders on key issues within the sector such as new sector policy developments including brief on the recent adoption of the Global Sustainable Development Goals and future implications to the sector (domestication), status of analytical works conducted etc.

In his opening remarks, the Minister of Education mentioned that the JRES was taking place at the right time when the period of planning and budgeting review process for the current fiscal year was happening. He emphasised that this opportunity should be used to reflect on the past, take stock of how ESSP is being delivered and together lay strategies for the rest of the current fiscal year and coming years. Thanking the stakeholders for their contribution towards National ICT in Education Policy and its Strategic Plan, the Minister opined that the use of technology in education will be one of the key enablers to ensure successful implementation of the newly launched Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in general and Goal 4 in particular which focuses on quality of education. He also said that various initiatives such as “The Secondary Education Quality Teaching Initiative” supported by the MasterCard Foundation with the aim “to improve the quality of teaching and learning in secondary schools so that thousands of young people have the skills and competencies needed to succeed in the 21st century, will help in domesticating and achieving the above mentions SDG4.

The Minister also noted that Rwanda in collaboration with all partners, has so far not only made a modest and promising progress as have been highlighted in the JRES reports but also on other international and credible reports such as Global Education Monitoring Report. The Government has no choice other than to increase the pace altogether and meet the set targets against key education sector indicators, especially those on which we have not done well as expected. He also pointed out how the Ministry of Education, in close collaboration with relevant partners, has adopted the approach of conducting comprehensive studies to inform the development of new or revised policies as well as initiatives aiming at contributing in meeting the set targets across all sub-sectors of education. Such studies includes comprehensive studies

on gender in education, LARS III, Causes in drop out, enhancement of science teaching in secondary, etc. The Minister also underlined that the Ministry is fully committed to make use of the evidences presented by these studies to inform the policies and strategies responses.

The Minister, in his closing remarks called for continued and joint collaboration in embracing the use of technology in education which will be one of the key enablers to ensure successful implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in general and Goal 4 in particular which focuses on quality of education. He also requested all education sector stakeholders to take note of the recommendations of today's session as Rwanda's education sector is moving on with the implementation of highlighted priorities in the next year and years to come. Finally, he also exhorted all the stakeholders to keep up the collaboration and support both technically and financially in aligning our national plans to the regional and international education goals such as the Post 2015 Agenda for Education for All, Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in general and Goal 4 in particular which focuses on quality of education.

## **Section 1: 2016 Education Statistics**

The 2016 Education Statistics (MINEDUC, 2016) highlighted some good progress, as well as implementation challenges by sub-sectors, Pre-Primary to Adult Literacy Education.

The number of pre-primary schools has increased by 8.3% equivalent to 216 schools in 2016 from 2,618 to 2,834 in 2015 and 2016. Number of students increased also by 3.5% from 183,645 in 2015 to 190,100 in 2016 in 2016 equivalent of 6,455.

The Gross Enrolment Rate (GER) in Pre-Primary Education has increased from 20.2% to 23.7% in 2015 and 2016. Net Enrolment Rate (NER) increased also from 14.2% to 17.2% respectively. Even though this is a substantial increase, the 2016/17 ESSP target of 29.9% and 28.0% were not achieved in 2016.

Moreover, the average GER in 22 poorest performing districts (defined as those districts that had a GER of less than 17% in 2014) improved from 14.1% in 2015 to 16.3% in 2016. This is in accordance with the 'equity indicator' recommendation from the Global Partnership of Education (GPE). The GPE stipulated that average GER in the least performing 22 districts should increase from 10% in 2014 to 17% by 2017.

The number of schools in primary has increased by 3.3% equivalent to 90 schools in 2016 from 2,752 in 2015 to 2,842 in 2016. Number of students increased from 2,450,705 to 2,544,394 in 2015 and 2016, representing an increase of 3.8% equivalent to 93,689 students. Total number of staff increased from 42,004 in 2015 to 43,558 in 2016. This represents an increase of 3.7%.

The GER in primary has increased from 135.3% to 139.5% in 2015 and 2016. However, this is still far away from the 2016/17 ESSP target of 106%. This indicates that there are many over-age children in primary education, caused by delays in starting education and high repetition across the grades.

The completion rate in primary has increased significantly by 4.8% in 2016 (from 60.4% in 2015 to 65.2% in 2016). However, this is still lower than the 2016/17 ESSP target of 74%.

The drop-out rate has been improved from 10.3% in 2014 to 5.7% in 2015, against the 2015/16 ESSP target of 7.6%. The repetition rate also dropped from 20.7% in 2014 to 18.4% in 2015, against a target of 9.7%. This is an important improvement for the sector.

In Lower Secondary, the GER has decreased from 45.9% to 42.5% in 2015 and 2016 and ESSP target of 78.0% was not attained. NER increased very slightly by 0.2% from 22.3% to 22.5% (ESSP target of 32.0% was not achieved). While GER and NER were decreased significantly by -4.8% and -1.4%, from 33.2% to 28.4%, and 20.9% to 19.5% respectively in 2015 and 2016.

In lower secondary education, drop-out rate has improved from 14.4% in 2014 to 6.5% in 2015, meaning that the 2015/16 ESSP target of 12.1% has been surpassed. The repetition rate remained constant at 11.6% so the 2015/16 ESSP target of 3.1% was not met.

In upper secondary, both GER and NER have decreased between 2015 and 2016, from 33.3% to 28.4%, and 20.9% to 19.5%. So the 2016/17 ESSP targets of 31% and 39% were not achieved.

In Tertiary Education the enrolment has increased by 4.8% in 2016, from 86,315 in 2015 to 90,463 in 2016. Higher education non-technical has 32,184 students in Public institutions and 49,799 students for private ones. Technical higher education has 6,901 students in public, and 1,579 in private.

A significant progress has been made in Adult Literacy Program, where a total number of centers has increased by 4.6% with an increment of 198 centers, from 4,313 in 2015 to 4,511 in 2016. The learners also increased significantly with 24,991 representing 26.1% increase, from 95,829 to 120,820 in 2015 and 2016.

## **Section 2: Progress against 2015/16 EDPRS 2 and Sector Core Indicators and Related Policy Actions**

This section provides the progress against 2015/16 EDPRS2 targets core indicators, sector indicators and policy actions.

### **2.1. Progress against 2015/16 Targets for EDPRS2 core indicators**

This part highlights two outcomes:

#### **(a) Availability of critical skills for service and industrial sectors:**

This is indicated by the percentage of employers satisfied with university graduates as an indicator. This has in turn, been assessed through three policy actions such as:

- Employer survey on employers satisfied with university graduates,
- Enforcement of career guidance support at all institutions and
- Policy recommendations from the Tracer Study findings of Graduates from Higher Education Institutions and employers' satisfaction of graduates' competencies.

According to the tracer study conducted in 2014/15 revealed that, 80.2% of employers are satisfied with university graduates. This is same as the baseline year and well below the target of >90%. Moreover, career centres have been established in 14 higher learning institutions for development of critical skills. Policies to enhance the delivery of quality education have been developed, including the on Teacher Development Policy, Language Learning and Curriculum and Assessment Policies.

#### **(b) Improved quality and learning outcomes across primary and secondary education**

The indicators used for understanding improvements in quality and learning are pupil: qualified teacher ratio in both primary and secondary schools. These indicators have been assessed through policies to support the delivery of quality education revised and/or developed including TDM Policy, Curriculum and Assessment Policy, Language of Learning policy etc.

The primary pupil: qualified teacher ratio for 2015/2016 is at 62:1 against the target of 52:1; which is not improving. However, pupil: qualified teacher ratio in secondary school is on track at 29:1 against the mid-term target of 32:1.

## **2.1. Progress against 2015/16 Sector Indicators**

Out of the 10 ESSP outcomes, the education sector reports on five of these against the EDPRS commitments. This sub-section therefore covers the five outcomes with seven indicators and nine policy actions as EDPRS targets.

Two sector indicators have surpassed the targets set for 2015/16. These are:

- (a) Transition from lower to upper secondary (82.8% against 70% of 2015/2016 target), and
- (b) Proportion of students enrolled in science and technology fields at upper secondary (55% against 47% target for 2015/2016), and tertiary education level (34% against 19% target for 2015/2016).

The remaining sector indicators are not yet on target, these include:

- (a) Transition from primary to lower secondary (71.1% against target of 87.9%),
- (b) Primary completion rate (60.4% against 74%),
- (c) Number of children with disabilities enrolled in school (25,761 against a target of 36,485),
- (d) Number of qualified TVET trainers trained (781 against a target of 883)
- (e) Percentage of employers satisfied with TVET graduates (75.1% against a target of 76%)
- (f) Percentage of children aged 4-6 enrolled in pre-primary education programmes (NER) (17.4% against a target of 23.8%)

Repetition and dropout rates in P5 are some of the key factors to the low completion rate and transition rate, and the sector priorities to address them are found in details in annex 2.

## **Section 3: 2015/16 Budget Execution Performance**

The Government of Rwanda's expenditure in the education sector – the total budget allocated to education- increased from 214.4 billion Frw in 2014/15 fiscal year to 220.6 billion Frw in 2015/16 fiscal year, representing an increase of 3% billion Frw equivalent to 6.3 bn.

The total recurrent and capital domestically financed budget allocated to education increased from 203.2 billion Frw in 2014/15 fiscal year to 205.6 billion Frw in 2015/16. Education expenditure as a proportion of all government budgets in 2015/16 was at 13.25%. In comparison to the funds predicted by ESSP for 2015/16 fiscal year (285.7 billion Frw), the budget allocated to education sector this year has been insufficient. The funding gap was thus significantly higher than predicted (32% instead of 10% for the whole ESSP period based on financial projections from MINECOFIN).

Generally, the budget allocated for 2015/16 was well-spent. The execution of the total budget to the education sector was at 99%. The tables in Annex 2.1 and Annex 2.2 contain details on allocation and execution of the budget by different categories. The execution in agencies (excluding districts) was at the high level of 100%. Rwanda Education Board (REB) was the agency which over-spent (101% execution rate).

Higher Education Council (HEC) spent the least (88%). MINEDUC also spent 92% execution rate. Other agencies had their execution rates within the range of 98-100%.

The budget execution by programmes was more uneven. Over-spending was recorded in Higher Education Scholarship Management (108%).

Some under-spending was recorded in Education, Science Technology, Research and Development (70%), Higher Education Quality Assurance (75%), Education Quality and Standards (77%) and Teacher Development and Management (87%).

## **Section 4: Progress against Implementation of Recommendations from the Last JRES Meeting**

This section highlights thirteen last JRES meeting recommendations and their implementation status:

The first recommendation as regard to ESSP Mid Term Review sign off by MINEDUC and the MTR recommendations action plan developed, the status for this indicates that ESSP Mid Term Review to be signed and circulated and many of them have been considered in planning and budgeting process 2016/17.

On the Clear strategy to address repetition and maintain progress on dropout, avoiding inefficiencies as a key focus over the coming year, dropout and repetition study is in progress. The inception report, methodology, sampling technique and roadmap has been approved. As regards to the finalization of the dropout and repetition study, Data collection will begin in early December 2016.

To look into the issue of delayed capitation grant to schools and understand the causes and blockages, the issue has been handled between Ministry of Education and MINECOFIN. Counter Verification has been conducted.

The fifth recommendation on the clear strategy on salary payment of qualified teacher in pre-primary where there is a pre-primary classroom at that school, as those teachers are to be counted as the other teachers at that school according to their having a minimum qualification, all districts have been requested to pay the pre-primary teacher's salary for pre-primary section attached to 9-12 YBE schools especially in rural areas.

The additional recommendation on future JRES Budget presentation to indicate government and donor financing, questionnaire on financing has been sent to all the Development partners to provide information related to the budget.

On the SDG indicator prioritization to include focus on quality outcomes, the National consultation workshop on SDG4 was conducted to build a common understanding of SDG4-Education 2030 and ensure sound foundation for its translation into national education system, policies and plans as well as its implementation

To avoid duplication of analytical studies and assess the existing versus planned studies, Centre for Gender Studies has been assigned to conduct all analytical studies related to gender (low enrolment of female students in Higher Learning Institutions)

The ninth recommendation on communication of strategies being used to increase the adult literacy focus: Literacy campaign is in progress, new Curriculum developed and is in use, Textbooks developed and provided to centres of literacy, 150 instructors and all Sector Education Officers (SEOs) trained and mobilization of partners, local authorities through meetings, workshops and Video conferences conducted.

Clarity on Teacher Training Colleges (TTCs) resourcing to ensure effective implementation of the Competency Based Curriculum, in the 2016/17 Financial Year, this issue has been taken into consideration.

The review of the budget availability to support basic infrastructure needs, especially for improvements in sanitation and hygiene, the budget availed for the construction of: 298 Latrines and 25 Water Tanks.

The clear strategies to ensure actions undertaken are sufficient to get improved learning outcomes, curricula were aligned with CBC, equipping schools with IT and Sciences materials, monitoring and supervising teaching /learning and providing advises where necessary, training of teachers, books aligned with CBC supplied to schools and enforcing the role of PTA in Teaching/Learning.

The last recommendation that highlights the release of the LARS2 findings, LARS 2 findings was validated and the next step is dissemination. For further details you can refer to annexed table 2.3.

## Section 5: 2017/18 Sector Priority Areas during the Planning and Budgeting Process

This section highlights priority areas (maximum of five) for the 2017/18 fiscal year that will inform the planning and budgeting process.

### Section 4: Five Priority areas for the 2017/18 Fiscal Year

Priority Areas for the 2017/18 fiscal year to inform the planning and budgeting process :

1. Continue to increase access and participation in pre-primary by increase infrastructure development, paying teachers' salaries and providing capitation grant especially in rural areas for pre-primary schools.
2. Continue the implementation of new Competence Based Curricula through teacher training for pre-primary, primary and secondary, and providing teaching and learning materials.
3. Increasing access and improving quality and relevance in TVET by implementing Competence Based Curricula (CBC) in TVET schools , renovating of the TVET schools in poor conditions, implementing workplace learning policy, appointing and training career guidance focal persons in all TVET schools, and establishing Business Incubation Centres at least one per province.
4. In order to implement ICT in Education Policy and achieve access, quality and relevance the following activities are planned in ICT at all education levels:

#### **Primary schools :**

- Primary schools will have access to the smart classroom program including (Digital content, access to local content and online formative assessments in English, Science, and Math.

#### **Secondary Schools :**

- Secondary schools will be equipped with 2 smart classrooms, which include (50 laptops in each smart classroom, Local digital Content access point or cloud solution, and online formative assessments including adaptive learning, Projector and Power solution to enable the charging of laptops).
- Secondary schools will be connected (through an education VPN and to the internet)

**Higher Education:** (All courses syllabus will be online (Faculty have their course outlines published and Digital courses and books aligned with courses in year 1 and Year 2 will be online).

5. Continue to strengthen Special Needs Education and Inclusive Education by supporting schools of excellence with appropriate materials and teachers training

## **Section 6: New Sector Policy Development, the Status of 2015/16 and 2016/17 Sector Analytical Studies**

This part provides new sector policy developments, status of analytical works conducted (progress, key findings if study report is available), re-structuring processes.

It also update stakeholders on key issues within the sector such as; new sector policy developments, Status of analytical works conducted in 2015/16 and 2016/17. Ten policies have been drafted waiting for the approval and their status is detailed in the annex 2.4.

In 2015/16, it was planned to carry out ten (10) analytical studies of which three were completed (the costing study on Pre-Primary Education, TVET Maintenance Framework and Situation Analysis on Special Needs Education), and the remaining seven have been highlighted in annex 2.5 and 2016/17 analytical works progress in annex 2.6 respectively.

**Signed by:**

**Lead Donors:**

**Dr.Celestin NTIVUGURUZWA**  
**Permanent Secretary**

Ministry of Education

DFID Rwanda

UNICEF Rwanda

## Annex. 1.1 EDPRS 2 Core Indicators Matrix

EDPRS OUTCOME	INDICATORS	UNIT	BASELINE VALUE (2014/15)	2015/16 Targets /EDPRS 2 Mid-term targets	2015/16 Performance	Indicator Score	2015/16 Policy Actions	Progress against Policy Actions	Catch up Plans for areas lagging behind
Availability of critical skills for service and industrial sectors	Employers satisfied with university graduates	Percent	80.2%	>90%	80.2 % (2014/15)		<p>Employer survey on employers satisfied with university graduates</p> <p>Enforcement of career guidance support at all institutions</p> <p>Policy recommendations from the Tracer Study findings of Graduates from Higher Education Institutions and employers' satisfaction of graduates' competences to be implemented</p>	<p>Tracer Study of Graduates from Higher Education Institutions and employers' satisfaction of graduates' competences was conducted in 2014/2015. The study report revealed that 80.2% employers are satisfied with university graduates</p> <p>Career guidance Centres were established in 14 HLIs</p>	<p>It is planned another survey to be conducted this FY 2016/17</p>
Improved education quality and learning outcomes across all levels of education	Pupil: qualified teacher (Primary)	Ratio	61:1	52:1	62:1		<p>Policies to support the delivery of quality education revised and/or developed including TDM Policy, Curriculum and Assessment Policy, Language of Learning policy</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-Continuous replacement of unqualified teachers in Primary</li> <li>-Fast tracking special statute for teachers and put in place the mechanism for teacher's incentives</li> <li>-The study on dropout of children at primary is in process.</li> </ul>	<p>Draft of TDM Policy, Curriculum and Assessment Policy, Language of Learning policy available. 936 qualified teachers recruited in Primary Education.</p> <p>Teacher statute approved and waiting for the publication. Teachers are awarded, teachers receive cows, laptops and incentives.</p>	<p>To recruit 1,728 qualified teachers in primary</p>
	Pupil: qualified teacher (Secondary)	Ratio	30:1	32:1	29:1				

## Annex 1.2: Sector Indicators Matrix (For the selected 10 sector indicators)

EDPRS/Sector outcome	Indicator	Baseline (2014/15) Value	2015/16 Targets	2015/16 Performance	Indicator Score	2015/16 Policy Actions	Progress against Policy Actions	Catch up Plans for areas lagging behind
Increased equitable access to 9 years of basic education for all children and expanding access to 12 years of basic education.	Transition from primary to lower secondary (girls/boys)	72.6%	87.9%	71.1%		School construction programme for pre-primary and Basic Education implemented. Parent Teacher Associations strengthened	School construction program implemented and 934 classrooms, 180 libraries & 1,466 latrines have been constructed.  2,278 school general assembly's committee members trained.	Implementing new Competence Based Curriculum and provision of Teaching Learning Materials Train teachers and Parents Teachers Associations
	Transition from lower secondary to upper secondary (girls/boys)	88.3%	70.0%	82.8%				
	Primary completion rate	61.3%	74.0%	60.4%				
Increased equitable access to education for students with special educational needs within mainstream and special schools.	Number of children with disabilities enrolled in schools	25,770	36,485	25,761		Centre for Inclusive Education expanded at the College of Education. -Increase SNE infrastructure development -Provision of SNE teaching and learning materials -Conduct awareness campaign on SNE	-School of special needs & inclusive education at UR were established. 4 special schools were upgraded to 9 and 12 YBE respectively. - A master's program has been started for those who want to upgrade their knowledge in special & inclusive education at UR. In UR-College of Education. Special Schools have been supported in terms of teaching learning materials and other specialized equipment Awareness campaign on SNE conducted Inclusive Education Teacher Guide developed to enable implementation of CBC to all children including those with learning barriers <b><i>In collaboration with Unicef the following activities have been done:</i></b> - 2557 teachers ( according to 1 teacher per school) were trained on inclusive methodologies as articulated in IE teacher guide - National curriculum for children with mental disabilities is being developed - Modelling Inclusive Education in five model schools( according to 1 school per province) is ongoing	Provision of Teaching Learning Materials in SNE and Inclusive Education schools, Strengthening schools of excellence by providing related teaching materials and train teachers ; Develop Curriculum for children with mental
Increased equitable access to relevant, high-quality, demand-driven TVET programmes	Number of Qualified TVET Trainers trained	729 Trainers trained in CBT and CBA	883	781		Validation and operationalization of the ToT implementation plan -Increasing training of Trainers in Competence Based Training (CBT) and Competence Based Assessment (CBA) -Increase industrial attachment for internships.	A cumulative total number of 781 trainers have been trained in CBT/CBA as well as ICT and English in the following details : 125 in Agriculture, 230 in Construction, 66 in ICT and English, 49 in pedagogy, 311 capacitated on basic skills for using TVET-MIS  In addition to that, a ToT baseline survey is being conducted and its results will inform future ToT development plans.	Operationalise Rwanda Teacher Training Institute and increase capacity development in TVET program through trainings

	Percentage of employers satisfied with TVET graduates.	73.70%	76.0%	75.1%		The recent TVET study conducted on graduates of 2013-14 revealed that 75,1% of employers are satisfied with the performance of TVET graduates	Conducting an another study on TVET graduates	
Improved access to school readiness programmes by 2017/18, accompanied by expanded access to three-years of early learning for four-to-six-year olds.	Percentage of children aged 4-6 enrolled in pre-primary education programmes (i.e NER)	13.3%	23.8%	14.2%		Take stock of all support to pre-primary education and cost to families. Increase in the number of schools with pre-primary component -Provision of Infrastructure development, Teaching learning materials -Community awareness on the importance of pre-primary education.	New classrooms were constructed in order to increase schools with pre-primary section. New Competence Based Curriculum for Pre-Primary has been since implemented in 2016, Related Teaching and Learning Materials provide to schools and Care givers have been trained on new CBC methodology. Community awareness on the importance of pre-primary education conducted	Pay capitation grant for students and teachers salaries for pre-primary schools attached to 9-12YBE schools in 2017/18 Increasing pre-primary schools especially in rural areas Continue to implement new CBC and train Care givers To sensitize Private Sector to invest more in pre-primary education
Strengthened performance in science, technology and innovation at all levels of education, and application of science, technology and innovation in relevant sectors of the economy	Proportion of students enrolled in science and technology fields at upper secondary and tertiary education level	45% (sec.) 17% (Tert)	47% (up.sec.) 19% (tert.)	55% (up.sec.) 34% (tert.)		Increase provision of Science and Technology teaching and learning materials at all levels and train teachers on the use. -Increase science facilities (laboratories, teaching learning materials)	24,100 XO Laptops have been purchased and 23,988 delivered to schools. 1,561 teachers have been trained in using ICT in teaching and learning. For science facilities 26 Laboratories were equipped and 3 new ones constructed in Nyagatare.	Continue to provide science and technology materials and construction of new laboratories

**Annex 2.5. Budget Execution by Program for 2015/16 FY**

SN	Program	2015/16 Revised Budget	Execution	% of Execution
	<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>205,618,483,606</b>	<b>203,736,108,460</b>	<b>99%</b>
	<b>MINEDUC + AGENCIES</b>	<b>89,012,963,970</b>	<b>89,036,219,898</b>	<b>100%</b>
1	Administrative and Support Services	15,274,073,345	14,801,116,169	97%
2	Education Sector Planning and Coordination	1,144,585,748	1,098,694,292	96%
3	Education, STR & D	852,370,009	595,122,161	70%
4	Higher Education Quality Assurance	140,700,000	105,211,483	75%
5	Higher Education	2,939,423,550	2,938,491,102	100%
6	Technical and Vocational Education	11,048,338,732	10,739,267,095	97%
7	Curricula and Pedagogical Materials	715,362,114	689,081,174	96%
8	Teacher Development and Management	1,845,588,646	1,605,301,738	87%
9	Education Quality and Standards	2,055,828,619	1,590,724,547	77%
10	ICT Integration in Education	14,927,088,277	14,307,751,533	96%
11	Examinations and Accreditation	5,329,286,529	5,070,230,630	95%
12	Higher Education Scholarship Management	32,740,318,401	35,495,227,974	108%
	<b>DISTRICTS</b>	<b>116,605,519,636</b>	<b>114,699,888,562</b>	<b>98%</b>
	Education	116,605,519,636	114,699,888,562	98%

**Annex 2.2: 2015/16 Budget by Agency**

SN	Agency	2015/16 Revised Budget	Execution	% of Execution
	<b>Total</b>	<b>89,012,963,970</b>	<b>89,036,219,898</b>	<b>100%</b>
1	MINEDUC	4,769,756,938	4,373,463,702	92%
2	HEC	568,853,378	501,164,812	88%
3	WDA	20,188,027,834	19,832,452,962	98%
4	REB	60,546,902,270	61,390,647,320	101%
5	UR	2,939,423,550	2,938,491,102	100%

### Annex 2.3. Progress against implementation of recommendations from the last JSR meeting

SN	Recommendations	Implementation Status
1	ESSP Mid Term Review sign off by MINEDUC and the MTR recommendations action plan developed	ESSP Mid Term Review to be signed and action plan developed
2	Clear strategy to address repetition and maintain progress on dropout, avoiding inefficiencies as a key focus over the coming year	Dropout and repetition study is in progress. The inception report, methodology, sampling technique and roadmap has been approved.
3	Finalize the dropout and repetition study	Data collection will begin in early December 2016,
4	Look into the issue of delayed capitation grant to schools and understand the causes and blockages.	This issue has been handled between Ministry of Education and MINECOFIN. Counter Verification has been conducted.
5	Clear strategy on salary payment of qualified teacher in pre-primary where there is a pre-primary classroom at that school, as those teachers are to be counted as the other teachers at that school according to their having a minimum qualification.	All districts have been requested to pay the pre-primary teacher's salary for pre-primary section attached to 9-12 YBE schools especially in rural areas
6	Future JRES Budget presentation to indicate government and donor financing.	Questionnaire on financing has been sent to all the Development partners to provide information related to the budget and some of them have filled the questionnaire.
7	SDG indicator prioritization to include focus on quality outcomes.	National consultation on SDG4 was conducted to build a common understanding of SDG4-Education 2030 and ensure sound foundation for its translation into national education system, policies and plans as well as its implementation
8	Avoid duplication of analytical studies and assess the existing versus planned studies.	Center for Gender Studies has been assigned to conduct all analytical studies related to gender (low enrolment of female students in Higher Learning Institutions )
9	Communication of strategies being used to increase the adult literacy focus	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Literacy campaign is in progress.</li> <li>- New Curriculum developed and is in use</li> <li>- Textbooks developed and provided to centers of literacy.</li> <li>- 150 instructors and all SEOs trained</li> <li>- Mobilization of partners, local authorities through meetings, workshops and Video conferences conducted</li> </ul>
10	Clarity on TTC resourcing to ensure effective implementation of the Competency Based Curriculum	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- In 2016/17 Financial Year, this issue has been taken into consideration</li> </ul>
11	Review of the budget availability to support basic infrastructure needs, especially for improvements in sanitation and hygiene.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Budget line created and budget earmarked for school hygiene and environment</li> </ul>

12	Clear strategies to ensure actions undertaken are sufficient to get improved learning outcomes.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Curricula were aligned to with CBC</li> <li>- Equipping schools with IT and Science materials</li> <li>- Monitoring and supervising teaching /learning and providing advice where necessary.</li> <li>- Training of teachers</li> <li>- Books aligned with CBC supplied to Schools</li> <li>- Enforcing the role of PTA in Teaching/Learning</li> </ul>
13	Release of the LARS2 findings.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- LARS 2 findings were available</li> </ul>

#### Annex 2.4. Status of Policies

SN	Policies	Status
1.	Special Needs Education Policy	Approved at Ministerial level and waiting for cabinet approval.
2.	Girls` Education Policy	The draft is available
3.	Comprehensive School Feeding Policy and its Strategic Plan	The draft is available
4.	TDM Policy	Draft policy is available
5.	Curriculum and Assessment Policy	The draft is in place.
6.	TLM Policy	The draft is available.
7.	Education Sector Policy	The zero draft is available
8.	Language Policy	The draft is available.
9.	Sports Policy	Approved at SMM level and waiting for cabinet approval.
10.	TVET Policy and Workplace Learning Policy	These policies have been approved by cabinet in September 2015 and are being implemented through annual action plan with WDA , MIFOTRA, DPs and other stakeholders

## Annex 2.5. Status of 2015/16 Sector Analytical Studies

SN	EDPRS 2/ Sector Outcome	2015/16 Planned Analytical work	Brief progress and key findings
1	Equitable access to 12 years basic education	School maintenance framework designed.	A database program to capture the status of schools infrastructure has been developed and is waiting the approval from RDB.
2	Improved quality and learning outcomes across primary and secondary education	The study of Drop-out and Repetition. LARS III assessment (involving 150 primary schools)	Inception report is in place and data collection will begin in early December 2016; The Learning Achievement in Rwandan Schools (LARS) is an educational assessment that aims to study the state of “learning” in literacy and numeracy in selected grades in primary schools in Rwanda. It is a tool developed by the Rwanda Education Board to monitor the quality and equity of learning in the primary schooling system. The first LARS (LARS I covering P3 and P5) took place in 2011, with the second LARS (LARS II) taking place in 2014 covering P2 and P5. LARS II was conducted with support from UNICEF and DFID. Discussions on the scope of LARS III therefore started only when finalization of LARS II report was on track.
3	Increase equitable access to relevant, high-quality, demand-driven TVET programmes	Apprenticeship Policy and implementation Plan.	The policy was developed and approved in September 2015. This policy is being implemented in full cooperation with other stakeholders such as PSF, MIFOTRA, NCBS
		System of Recognition of Prior Learning and 5-year costed implementation Plan	The Draft operational manual was developed and pilot phase has started in the construction sector. More than 4,192 masons known as casual laborers have been tested and certified. The next phase will be to expand this model to other sectors
		Development of a TVET demand-driven Planning matrix.	The planning tool which shows the list of TVET training areas and their linkages to Government priorities and labour market needs has started but its finalization will depend on full operationalization of the Labour Market Information System which being developed by MIFOTRA
		TVET financing mechanisms in Rwandan context and study on economics of TVET.	The feasibility study for development of a TVET financing mechanisms is on-going and it identified international best practices which can be applied in the Rwandan context such as Training Levy system, TVET students loan model, Voucher system and School-Enterprise Model. However, there is a need of legal expertise to analyze which financing model would fit into the Rwandan legal and financial framework.

## Annex 2.6. Sector Priority Analytical Studies for 2016/17

EDPRS2/sector outcome	Planned Analytical Work	Brief progress and Key Findings
Increased equitable access to (YBE) for all children and expanding access to 12YBE	Study of Dropout and Repetition	Data collection will begin in early December 2016
	Study on Children with Disabilities and their rights to education.	The study report was finalised, modalities of its dissemination is under discussion
Improved quality and learning outcomes across Primary and Secondary Education	Conduct Learning Assessment for Rwandan Schools (LARS III)	<p>The procurement for LARS III significantly delayed due to delays in finalization of LARS II. LARS II draft report highlighted a number of technical and analytical shortfalls which forced REB to procure another service provider, with support from DFID, to re analyse the data and produce a better quality report.</p> <p>Discussions on the scope of LARS III therefore started only when finalization of LARS II report was on track</p>
Increased equitable access to affordable, relevant, academically excellent higher education that also delivers quality research outputs.	Conduct a study on the decline of the female students in Higher Learning Institutions especially in Public HLIs.	Centre for Gender Studies has been assigned to conduct all analytical studies related to gender
Increased equitable access to relevant, high-quality, demand-driven TVET programmes.	Conduct a study to identify challenges hampering females enrolment in TVET, especially in more technical related trades and strategic actions developed	WDA in collaboration with Centre for gender studies, MIGEPROF, and GMO have started this study and the report is expected by end of December 2016.
	Conduct a study on reasons of low enrolment in TVET with focus on VTCs	WDA in collaboration with Suisse Cooperation, is conducting a study on low enrolment in TVET with more focus on VTCs. The report will be available end of May 2017.
	Conduct a TVET Trainer baseline survey	The study for ToT baseline survey has been launched and data collection has been completed. Data entry and analysis is still ongoing and the report is expected to be available by end of May 2017
Strengthened Performance in Science, Technology and Innovation at all levels of Education, and Application of Science, Technology and Innovation in relevant	Conduct an innovation survey in the business sector	<p>The Questionnaire template, Manual draft and the concept note are in preparation</p> <p>The nomination of National Technical Team of Innovation survey is planned by December that will be responsible for carrying out the survey.</p>
	Conduct a study on the causes of low enrolment rate of female students in science subjects at university	Centre for Gender Studies has been assigned to conduct all analytical studies related to gender (low enrolment of female students in Higher Learning Institutions)

**Annex 2.7. Office of the Auditor General (OAG) report and corrective measures 2014/15**

SN	Issues raised by the OAG	Action taken & Strategies set to resolve the issue	Agency
1	<p>Issues noted in Accounting and Financial Management in Public Universities in Rwanda by OAG are categorised in the following manner:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Accounting and book keeping issues</li> <li>• Tuition fees issues</li> <li>• Accounts receivables and payables issues.</li> <li>• Bank balances issues</li> <li>• Internal controls and corporate governance issues</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• University of Rwanda through Deputy Vice Chancellor in charge of Finance and Administration is going to set up a task force to investigate and establish the supporting documents for the adjustments passed on the opening fund balance for all UR Colleges.</li> <li>• This task force should also seek the causes for the differences between the trial balance and general ledger and make the necessary adjustments where necessary.</li> <li>• A control mechanism should be established to ensure that all adjustments made in the books of account are properly supported with documents illustrating rationale for such adjustments. No adjustment should be booked without proper authorization.</li> <li>• Advance payment of tuition fees from the sponsoring institutions should be supported with detailed schedules of the individual students being sponsored. This will facilitate management to quickly re-allocate the payments to the individual students' account and minimize on the tendency of holding similar students as creditors even when they have completed their studies</li> <li>• A detailed reconciliation of the unallocated receipts Account should be immediately sanctioned. This will enable management to identify students whose payments have never been re-allocated to the individual students account and those whose balances were as a result of errors that need to be adjusted.</li> <li>• Going forward, management needs emphasize that Transfers of tuition fees from the sponsoring institutions should be supported with detailed schedules of the students being sponsored. This will facilitate management to quickly re-allocate the payments to the individual students' account and minimize the tendency of holding a similar student as a debtor and a creditor at the same time.</li> <li>• A detailed reconciliation of the Students Debtors Account should be regularly conducted. This will enable management to identify students whose payments have been long overdue and those whose balances were as a result of errors that need to be adjusted.</li> <li>• All unexplained differences between the reconciled bank balances and balances per cashbook for the bank accounts should be adequately followed up and be fully reconciled.</li> <li>• University of Rwanda/DVC-AF is going to ensure that reconciling items are cleared within a timely manner to avoid carrying forward errors in the financial statements.</li> <li>• For transfers received from other budget agencies/projects, University of Rwanda/DVC-AF always is going to request for MOUs or guidelines for utilization of these transfers. This will aid management to assess whether the funds have been utilized in accordance with the requirements of the funding agency.</li> </ul>	UR

		<p>Overall, to achieve the desired improvements in internal controls and good financial management, the University of Rwanda is going to focus on the following;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Review the processes in place to ensure timely clearance of all unreconciled balances under accounts receivable and payable, unsupported adjustments;</li> <li>• Assess the adequacy and appropriateness of the financial reporting (book keeping) processes and accounting systems, and suggest the required improvements on a timely manner;</li> <li>• Continuously review adherence to the procurement laws and regulations;</li> <li>• Review the controls over preparation of bank reconciliations and ensure timely follow up of the reconciling items.</li> <li>• Evaluate the monitoring and management of projects financed by development partners.</li> </ul>	
2	Challenges with Internet connectivity in secondary schools	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• REB has terminated the contract signed with ISPA because of the bad quality of internet service provided. The decision to terminate the contract was taken following reports submitted by different schools complaining about poor quality of service they receive from the internet service provider and after the investigation made by REB technical staff that confirmed what was reported by schools. REB wrote a letter to ISPA requesting them to address poor connectivity issues and resolve them but they failed to do so. Therefore, REB had no other choice than terminating the contract in order to avoid spending money for internet service of poor quality.</li> <li>• After termination of the contract with ISPA, REB decided to connect some of the schools to internet through National fiber optic backbone. The connection on fiber optic was meant for schools that are located within a distance of less than one (1) Km from the backbone. Concerning schools which are located within a distance of more than one (1) Km from the backbone, it was decided that they should be connected to internet through wireless technology.</li> <li>• BSC submitted to REB quotations for schools to be connected through fiber optic and REB noticed that, the remaining funds after termination of the contract with ISPA, were not sufficient enough to pay for the installation works to be done for connecting those schools to internet. It was then decided to use that money for payment of monthly subscription fees to New Artel Ltd that was providing internet service to 11 TTCs.</li> <li>• It is to be remembered that those 11 TTCs were previously supported by MINEDUC in collaboration with Rwanda Education Commons (REC) Project. But at the end of the REC project, the 11 TTCs were transferred to REB and there was no budget planned for payment of their monthly subscription fees; the reason why REB used that money remaining from ISPA termination of contract.</li> <li>• Within the REB budget of the current FY 2014/2015, a certain amount of money has been allocated for school</li> </ul>	REB

		<p>internet connectivity. All the schools that were connected to internet by ISPA and the 11 TTCs that are located within a distance of less than one km from fiber optic backbone will be now connected to internet through "fiber optic" by BSC using that money from REB budget, while the remaining schools located within a distance of more than one km from fiber optic backbone will be connected to internet through "wireless technology" by TIGO using funds provided by RURA/ Universal Access Fund. REB will pay the monthly subscription fee.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• For schools to be connected to internet through wireless technology, a contract is going to be signed soon between TIGO and RURA and installation works will start immediately after the signature of this contract hopefully in the current month. For schools to be connected to internet through fiber optic, BSC has already submitted invoices to REB for consideration and the contract should be signed thereafter. It is expected that installation works will start by next month (November 2014).</li> </ul>	
3	Implementation of One Laptop per Child programme in schools	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• REB is currently designing a Strategic Plan which will include OLPC programme.</li> <li>• REB is currently designing a new National Curriculum which will see the integration of OLPC in the school timetables to ensure proper implementation of OLPC at Primary school level.</li> <li>• OLPC programme deployed 200 school servers which contain subjects like Mathematics, Science and English for P4, P5 and P6.</li> <li>• OLPC programme trained teachers at the 200 schools with servers on how to create lesson plans and how use the content to teach subjects in regular class like Mathematics, Science and English using the laptops.</li> <li>• OLPC programme is currently working with the District Education Officers to ensure that only schools with Electricity receive laptops.</li> <li>• OLPC programme recently trained all District Education Officers and Regional Education Inspectors so they fully understand the programme and to help follow up especially on usage and on laptops which need intervention on maintenance and repairs</li> </ul>	REB
4	Persistent challenges in tracking disbursements and recoveries for SFAR/REB student loan beneficiaries	<p>1. <u>Measure Challenges</u>  Persistent Instability of Management Structure and Policies. Since 2009 SFAR went through different changes which continued even after becoming a department of REB up to the current functional review.  Inheritance of Bad data since 1980 while the records were destroyed in 1994. Turnover of Leaders. 4 in 6 years since 2008 up to date</p> <p>2. <u>Actions taken</u>  The Policy of transferring the fund where it belong to a financial Institutions was approved by the Cabinet.  The Framework of transfer was concluded.</p>	REB

		<p>This include the review of the law, the serving scheme as innovative solution to increase the fund, the transfer of the loan disbursement and loan recovery to Atlas Mara Group/ BRD</p> <p>3. <u>Strategies set to resolve the issue</u></p> <p>Use of ICT. The SFAR-REB MIS was concluded and started implementation this academic year.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Revision of legal framework and be able to enforce punishment measures to loan defaulters the draft law was finished.</li> <li>b. Loan beneficiaries' information tracking systems. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>o Survey Loan Beneficiaries working places and profiles with the help of HLIs, RRA, RSSB, Embassies and Private Sector.</li> <li>o Establish loan repayment clearance form for all services (Tender, job seeking, all attestations, and Passport)</li> <li>o Track loan defaulters with the Credit Reference Bureau</li> <li>o Mass mobilization</li> <li>o Work closely with Districts, Public and Private Sector to identify loan defaulters</li> <li>o Issue of repayment Certificates.</li> </ul> </li> </ol>	
5	Implementation of the School Based Mentors programme	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A strategic plan exists to guide implementation of the School Based Mentors Programme which spells out the implementation plan in which the target number of SBMs to be recruited, deployment, replacement, monitoring and evaluation mechanisms.</li> <li>• Performance evaluations have been conducted every year after SBMs complete a one year contract. No SBM is allowed to sign a new contract before they are evaluated by their both head teachers and REB approve their recommendations by renewing contracts for those who are recommended by their head teachers and not renewing those of SBMs that are not recommended. Apart from the annual performance evaluation, Focal Points will come up with the real status of SBMs after collecting data from the field visit effected every term.</li> <li>• REB has set up a system of focal point who conduct a field visit once a term and provide a report to paymasters</li> <li>• In some case, Head teachers report late after the SBM has left. However, some measures have now been put in place: among them are appointing some REB Staff as focal points to all districts to make a regular follow up of SBMS attendance and performance. Also, senior mentors are expected to provide to their respective focal points on monthly basis a report that spells out the SBM status.</li> </ul>	REB
6	Schools not using text books distributed by Government	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• REB has developed a school management Handbook with clear instructions on how books are managed in schools. The handbook contains among other things, selection, ordering, storage, repairs and use of Learning and Teaching Materials (LTMs). Every school has received a copy of this handbook and before each cycle of ordering of LTMs, REB trains Head teachers on the management of LTM received.</li> </ul>	REB

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• REB has written a letter to all DEOs to follow up on LTMs distributed to school since cycle one and requested for a report on the status of LTMs in all schools.</li> <li>• REB will continue the sensitization of Head teachers on proper management of the LTMs</li> <li>• REB took the initiative to write a teachers' guide because of lack teaching materials of history, especially history of Rwanda. Although the name indicates that it is a teachers' guide, it is an actual fact also a student manual because it also contains students content in additional to guiding the teacher on how to teach history. In additional to that there was no student books for that specific years of studies.</li> </ul>	
7	Idle equipment acquired by WDA for TVET	Those equipment were purchased by WDA for three TVET schools (IPRC West, IPRC East and VTC Gaculiro). The equipment have been installed and currently they are in use.	WDA
8	Gatsibo Secondary Technical School constructed but not in use for long.	<p>This school of Gatsibo Secondary Technical School was constructed by Gatsibo District. Currently WDA has equipped the school in the following trades:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Electrical</li> <li>- Construction</li> </ul> <p>The equipment supplied are the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Drawing equipment</li> <li>- Personal protective equipment</li> <li>- Furniture</li> </ul>	

### **Annex 2.8.Recommendation from the 2015/16 Backward Looking JRES**

The following recommendations were drawn from JRES plenary discussions:

1. Finalize approval of all pending policies before the end of this fiscal year;
2. Disaggregate and publish all education statistics by gender;
3. Finalize the drop-out and repetition study and subsequently develop clear strategies to address the high repetition rate and the low transition from primary to lower secondary.
4. Incorporate actions based on LARS findings into policies and plans
5. Finalize LARS 3 to feed into policies, programmes, and strengthen learning, as well as to meet the GPE commitment
6. Disaggregate the education budget by government, DPs and private sector contributions;
7. Develop strategies to improve education sector financing by government and work towards equitable distribution of resources across all sub-sectors;
8. Conduct a survey on innovation in business;
9. Continue to promote gender equity in Higher Education and Science Technology Engineering and Mathematic (STEM)
10. Disaggregate and report on pre-primary GER for the poorest 22 Districts as per the GPE indicator;
11. Strengthen career guidance programmes in secondary schools;
12. Develop strategies and programmes to teach Kiswahili language either within the formal education or as informal education.